



# *Inclusive*

An Open Access Peer Reviewed International Journal  
of Kolkata Centre for Studies

~ A UGC-CARE LISTED JOURNAL, E-ISSN: 2278-9758 ~

December  
2012



# **Special Paper Section**

# Reforms and Welfare: The Indian Scenario

Ajitava Raychaudhuri

## Introduction

India has undertaken significant economic reforms in phases starting from the benchmark date of 1991. Economic reform in India actually started around 1985 with substantial reduction in external tariffs for capital goods imports. However, discussions on reform in India almost pre-suppose as if the reform by definition is economic reform. It is well understood that economic reforms in many cases depend on reforms in the administrative and judicial systems. This is especially true since the urge to reform the economic system emanates from stories about corruption and malpractices, which hit the headlines at regular intervals. Things would have continued without much ado had the economic growth in India surpassed the 'self-imposed' boundary of 5 per cent per annum. In a sense it is good fortune that it was otherwise and India embarked upon the much touted economic liberalization in 1991.

However, the moot question is how far this reform has increased the welfare of the common individuals in India? After all, reforms are meant to raise the standard of living and economic well being of people. The main thrust of reform is to raise the growth rate of India's per capita income, assuming this will take care of the welfare issues. It is beyond doubt that unless the size of the cake expands, residents of a country cannot get a higher pie of the cake. But the faster growth is a necessary condition for raising welfare of the people, but not the sufficient. In other words, the benefit of growth would percolate to all but not symmetrically. The present paper will touch upon these issues sequentially.

## Background of economic reform

The present economic reform followed in India clearly follows the philosophy that a competitive market economy produces an equilibrium solution which makes both households and firms happy. In other words, in this solution, nobody can be made better off without hurting somebody else. This is the well-known first welfare theorem of Vilfredo Pareto. In addition the second welfare theorem for a competitive economy suggests that through redistribution of resources and goods among individuals, every solution can be made an efficient solution in the sense that all economic agents find their optimal position in that solution. But this automatically leads to the debate between equity and efficiency since redistribution is achieved only through a system of taxes and subsidies.<sup>1</sup> For example, higher taxes on owners of capital may affect incentives to invest in the economy while higher taxes on work may adversely affect work effort.

In any case, the underlying philosophy of India's economic liberalization of 1991 was to allow markets to function more extensively in as many sectors as possible. This naturally implies less government control in different spheres of production and distribution. One visible result of this is the abolition of what is called the 'license-permit Raj'. The existence of such type of control was inefficient from the perspective of economic logic for the most important reason that it leads to what is known as 'rent-seeking activities'. This rent is an income of mainly government officials and political entities which is not justified by standard economic theories of income distribution- this is an additional earning of the particular economic agent. This may take various forms and is usually branded as 'directly unproductive' activity. As Persson and Tabellini explain "We can conceptualize these rents in a variety of ways, from party finance to outright diversion of resources for private use in connection with the production of public goods".<sup>2</sup> The license or permit implies the existence of intermediary agencies between government and the producers who have been delegated powers to issue such licenses. This official power of these intermediaries encouraged them to extract rent from the beneficiaries of these licenses.<sup>3</sup> This aspect of economic reform was welcome from economic efficiency point, which has led to more free functioning of markets as far as industrial locations and production are considered. A similar story is the abolition of freight equalization policy which goes against competitive market mechanism as it distorts the basic principle of comparative advantage of some states that hold key raw materials in terms of non-renewable mineral resources.

The type of economic reform in the beginning of 1991 as illustrated above was welcome by most economists and contrary views were hard to find. No matter whether one has faith in market mechanism instead of centralized allocation as pursued in the socialist countries, no economist could support the existence of 'rent seeking unproductive' activities. In that sense economic liberalization starting in 1991 did not earn the wrath of people although it is always true that benefits of such reforms was bound to be asymmetric among different strata of people.

The other major aim of the reform is to start more integration of the economy with the world economy. The first step towards this was to reduce the barriers to import of goods by replacing the quota system by tariffs and subsequently, reducing the tariff levels drastically.<sup>4</sup> The second action was to align the foreign currency exchange rate to the rate prevalent in the world currency markets. This was done by allowing almost full convertibility of Indian rupee into important foreign currencies in the current account which shows goods and services trade. The third major step was to allow foreign direct investment in almost all the production sectors of the economy through automatic routes which requires no prior approval except statutory notifications to the government authorities.

The macroeconomic adjustment was basically in terms of reduction of fiscal deficit which reached a proportion of almost 10 per cent in 1991.<sup>5</sup> The standard macroeconomic theory suggests this would lead to crowding out of the private investment, especially when the interest rate was allowed to be more market demand driven as a response to banking sector reforms. The reason for such a high deficit was identified to be huge subsidy of the government for food, fertilizer and petroleum



products. In addition, it was argued that some of the public sector units were not generating any surplus for the government and they should be increasingly privatized. This again was a clear signal that government should have a lesser role in the production and consumption in the economy and markets should have a bigger role.

This whole package was termed as the first generation reform. Broadly, this reform was primarily aimed at signaling gradual withdrawal of the government from direct or indirect control as well as participation in the production and distribution of goods and services in the economy. The markets should be given its due role to play and the government's role should be clearly to oversee that the markets function as competitive as possible. As Stiglitz<sup>6</sup> has emphasized, a gradualist approach is the real key to success and China stands out as the real world success story in this regard. However, the issue remains whether such a process of economic reform, purportedly bringing more efficiency in the economy, can also ensure a fair deal to the vast majority of relatively poor people (especially in the rural sector) in India? The answer to this brought the subsequent wave of reform, which is also coined second generation reform, although the exact meaning of this term remains vague enough.<sup>7</sup>

### **Second Generation Reform**

As mentioned by Ravindran second generation reform is not well-defined and may not even be sequential.<sup>8</sup>The main thrust of the first generation reform is to create the environment for the smooth operation of the market mechanism in the product markets. This is done by reforms in the regulatory systems as well as in the tax subsidy schemes of the government. Thus, the second generation reform aims at liberalizing the input markets and services sector. Some of the inputs like credit market were made more competitive but that was not enough. The banking and insurance sector needed more private players, initially big domestic capital and then foreign capital. Other inputs like land and labour were controlled by either very old regulations or time-inconsistent legislations. The decision to open up retail sales to foreign capital is also a part of this reform process

Before going into a discussion of the implications of second generation reforms, one may point out an unlikely convergence of thoughts of Neo-Marxist and Neo-classical economists regarding the role of state in recent periods. The Neo-Marxist thought on this may be summarized in the words of James O'Connor who believes states in capitalist societies do not act only at the behest of the capitalist class and acts to legitimize the capitalist system through social expenditure on investment and consumption. This social expenditure may facilitate private production so that without this expenditure borne by the state, the private production would become unprofitable. This kind of expenditure is in physical capital like roads, ports, bridges, electricity generation and the like, which directly helps in the accumulation process of the private capital. On the other

hand, state undertakes social consumption in terms of employment schemes, educational and health subsidies, food subsidies, rental subsidies and the like. This not only helps the capitalist system to overcome its disproportionality crisis but also helps to depress market wage to maintain the surplus value. The end result is too much pressure on the state finance and finally, appearance of a fiscal crisis.<sup>9</sup>

The Neo-classical economic thought has discussed the same under the newly found interest in political economy. As Persson and Tabellini claims, 'Redistributive policies have become a predominant phenomenon in modern democracies. Transfers and subsidies have been the most rapidly growing component of government spending in the post-war period'.<sup>10</sup> The major thrust of these redistributive policies is clearly political so that the voters are influenced by these policies. The existence of the redistributive politics is another way to suggest that the state legitimizes the system through policies which makes inequality and asymmetry in the system tolerant. In that sense, the Neo-Marxists and Neo-classicals are hinting at the same process- a rising burden of transfer from state to the underprivileged as well as interest groups so that the capitalist system works well. One may recall that in the traditional Marxist and Neo-classical paradigm, role of state is viewed differently and such social expenditure in both cases were either ignored or treated as unproductive and have an adverse impact on either surplus value or profit, as the case may be. It is needless to say, the capitalist system works well if the markets witness more competition and participants in the market feel less asymmetry in terms of its outcomes.

The first generation economic reform in India tried its best to allow markets function more competitively in product markets. At the same time, the central government expenditure in India raised its percentage of expenditure on social sector.<sup>11</sup> It took many forms, like NREGA, Mid-day meal, girl child subsidy, etc. on one hand as well as complementary investment of state to promote private capital on the other in the form of schemes like JNNURM, Pradhan Mantri Gram Sarak Yojna, Indira Awas Scheme, etc. The difference of India from the more matured capitalist economies lies in the magnitude of this investment and the resulting outcome. India has not performed very well in terms of human capital development or in terms of infrastructure expansion. This perhaps signals the fiscal pressure on the Indian state as well as poor delivery mechanisms which is still dominated by rent-seeking agents.

### **The worries and way ahead**

As mentioned in the beginning, welfare theorems in a capitalist economy rest on the competitiveness of markets and compensation criteria from winners to losers. The second generation reform is trying to integrate the economy in several ways- one is to allow more competition and markets in inputs and services sectors. The second is to integrate the economy more with the global economic movements. But the government in a democracy cannot ignore the welfare conditions of its electorates. It will be useful to highlight some of the issues in this context.

The reforms proposed for the input markets basically target the land and labour markets. Regarding the land, the proposed amendment to the 1894 Land Acquisition Bill is a timely effort on the part of the central government. However, the problem is the lenses through which the amendment is viewed- does it see the existing law as a repressive measure on the part of state to acquire farmland for non-agricultural use or does it view it as a necessity for development of a nation? The right answer probably lies in a combination of the two with weightage given to the two objectives to be settled on a case to case basis. This requires a few conditions like (a) a clear principle regarding price of land to be acquired; (b) a proper rehabilitation package for the displaced persons; and (c) some freedom to the states to determine its own policy keeping in mind its specificities. One must understand that land is a non-renewable immobile input unlike capital and labour. So, the pricing of land is not similar to the pricing of the other major inputs. Further, when an asset like land is taken away, this needs to be compensated by some other asset, like physical capital or human capital. It is not clear whether reform is pursuing this line of thought.

The reform for the labour market is also contentious. The basic thrust of reform for this is to allow more flexibility in hiring and termination of jobs in the organized labour market (which incidentally is around 7 per cent as per the NSS statistics). The problem is that the big firms are increasingly practicing the policy of allowing informal norms for jobs in their companies. This is done through more casualization of jobs which makes the jobs non-permanent and devoid of retirement benefits. So the question is --does the labour reform try to make jobs more informal in nature within the ambit of formal labour market? This question is getting importance since in the existing discussions such informalization within formal labour markets hardly gets its due mention.

The other major thrust of reform is in the services sector. The first one which is already implemented is FDI in multi-brand retail trade. It is certainly possible that it will bring more funds in the sector through big foreign retail chains and may also create back-end infrastructure for agricultural supply. But the intrusion of big domestic capital in this sector is not new and is continuing for the last 10 years. Unfortunately, the central government fails to provide credible socio-economic surveys to highlight the impact of the 'malls' on local small traders as well as in agriculture (since the share of agricultural goods in the turnover of these big shopping malls is estimated to be less than 1 per cent). Again, the approach to welfare for Indian reform is left fuzzy and more to belief or faith in the efficiency of the present government.

A similar argument may be put forward to other service sector reforms. In the case of insurance sector, two types of major insurance enterprises exist- one is called life and the other is non-life. The life insurance affects the common man directly while the non-life insurance is dominated mainly by the corporate sector. In the insurance sector, private capital was allowed earlier and foreign investment was limited to 24 per cent for joint ventures. It is now contemplated that this cap will be relaxed. One may again question the welfare impact of such relaxation in the sense that common person gets the maximum benefit from a life insurance which has extensive coverage but with low premium. One has a right to know how much benefit the 'man on the street' will garner through infusion of more foreign capital in the insurance sector. The government uses so much

advertisement to highlight its policies, but a comparative picture about the division of life and non-life insurance for the joint venture insurance companies is hard to find in such advertisements. The fact is such an infusion of foreign capital will certainly help the private capital to operate more smoothly and the market mechanism will be strengthened since insurance is a safeguard against various types of business risks. But, welfare theorems suggest a clear idea about the relative gains and need for redistributive policies. This is missing in the preaching for second generation economic reform.

One may extend the list of examples. But the main issue highlighted here is the concern about the welfare and reform in the existing paradigm of India. The present philosophy clearly adheres to the supremacy of competitive market and efficiency of redistributive processes within the market mechanism in ensuring optimal welfare to the individuals. The reforms initiated in India have gone all the way to ensure the operation of competitive markets within its limitations. But what it lacks is the second part of the welfare theorems which requires a clear road map regarding compensation principle that is done through redistributive policies. One must note that despite existence of such social expenditures, India is still ranked lowly in human development index. It also has a poor infrastructure development which requires around 2 lakh crores of rupees for expansion in the next five years. The reports of the official commissions set up by the Indian government clearly show that the urban inequality as well as the rural urban divide has risen over the last twenty years or so with minor aberrations toward the end. Thus, either the so called accumulation or legitimation functions of the state, which must accompany the reform process or the redistributive politics of the state have fallen well short of what the standard welfare theorems suggest. This should be the main concern of the Indian state at the present moment and one hopes the political process will take appropriate note of it without much ado and delay.

### Notes & References

1. Robert Pindyck and Daniel Rubinfeld, Microeconomics, Prentice-Hall of India, New Delhi, 6th Edition, 2005, pp. 590-93.
2. Å Torsten Persson and Guido Tabellini, Political Economics: Explaining Economic Policy, (Indian Reprint), Pearson Education, New Delhi, 2004, p.70.
3. Jean-Jaques Laffont, 'Corruption and Development' in A.V. Banerjee, R. Benabou and D. Mookherjee, eds., Understanding Poverty, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2006, pp. 161-67.
4. S. Marjit, and A. Raychaudhuri, India's Exports, Oxford University Press, New Delhi, 1997, pp. 3-6.
5. M.S., Ahluwalia 'Economic Reforms in India since 1991: Has Gradualism Worked?' Journal of Economic Perspectives, Summer, 2002.
6. Joseph Stilitz, Globalization and its Discontents, Chapter 7, Allen Lane, London, 2002.

7. P. Ravindran, 'Second Generation Reforms: Definition First, Implementation Next' Business Line, February 28, 2000, Internet Edition.
8. Ibid
9. J. H. Foster and H. Szlajfer eds, The Faltering Economy, The Monthly Review Press, New York, 1984.
10. Persson and Tabellini op.cit., p. 115.
11. Ahluwalia, op.cit.

Ajitava Raychaudhuri  
*Professor, Department of Economics, Jadavpur University*

## **Re-figuring Global Narratives on Child Labour and Education: How much Safer is the School Option?**

**Anita Sheth & Elke de Buhr**

Most would agree that the rights of children as enshrined in the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child are paramount to any discussion of child labour, especially the guiding principles including non-discrimination (Article 2), primacy of the best interests of the child (Article 3), right to life and survival (Article 6), and right to express views (article 12).<sup>[1]</sup> Yet, consideration from children have been largely absent from the global narratives on child labour. In cases where children's voices have been factored in, they have been largely used to either substantiate adult-based arguments for the rights of working children to earn an income, or, more frequently, to argue against the exploitation of working children. Conceptually, the concern is framed within two aspects of the well-being paradigm, namely, protection of children and the right of children to learn and prosper.

Getting the balance correct between the right to be protected from exploitation and abuse and the right to acquire skills, knowledge and an income, has been an irksome and expensive task, even for those who explicitly or implicitly support children's right to work. Millions of dollars have been spent by NGOs, governments, companies and/or worker organizations to develop initiatives to address the global child labour problem. Based on recent estimates, 215 million children under the age of 18 years are involved in child labour (as defined by ILO Conventions No. 138 and No. 182).<sup>[2]</sup> In India, based on 2001 national census results, 12.6 million children were estimated to be working out of 210 million children aged 5-14 years. 5.77 million of these children were classified as 'main workers', and 6.88 million were classified as 'marginal workers', many of whom were engaged in activities known to be hazardous to their physical, emotional, or moral wellbeing. Among the total workforce in the country, 3.15 per cent were estimated to be children between 5-14 years. <sup>[3]</sup>

Most of the current initiatives focus on removing children from illegal work and relocating them in formal and/or informal school settings and preventing new children from replacing them in the workplace.

Rarely do we find commentary on how to assess safer options for these children and/or the quality of education and vocational training opportunities available to them, even though these debates do occur. It is often assumed in debates on child labour that attending school is always better than working on farms, in mines, on construction sites and in factories even though some authors have argued that the 'assumption that work and school are mutually exclusive alternatives is challenged by much empirical evidence and by working children's views.' <sup>[4]</sup>

While we have detailed information on work that children perform around the world in productive economic sectors, such as the ILO Child Labour Surveys, we cannot equally or as easily access lists of the violent or otherwise harmful activities that some children confront in the formal and informal school settings. According to Dunne, violence in schools has ,only recently emerged as a widespread and serious phenomenon' in developing countries ,with the consequence that our knowledge and understanding of it is embryonic; much of it remains invisible or unrecognized.' <sup>15]</sup> Even international campaigns calling for education as a first line of response for children living in conflict zones or exposed to humanitarian disaster rarely speak about the abuse that is possible in educational settings. They do include the terms of ,quality education,' presumably flagging the possibility of schools not being automatically better for children. This is not, however, followed by a list of cautions on exploitation that is indeed possible in and around educational sites. The current initiatives also do not tend to discuss protection mechanisms needed to ensure children's wellbeing after completing schooling such as safe migration to urban settings, especially in countries where urban environments are connected to gang or other violence, should teenagers or young adults wish to move to these areas in search of a more prosperous life or sustainable livelihood. <sup>16]</sup>

While representative statistics on violence and abuse in school settings are not available on an international or global level, an increasing number of journal articles has summarized individual research on the topic. According to the Violence Prevention Alliance's World Report on Violence and Health, violence is defined as ,the intentional use of physical force or power, threatened or actual, against oneself, another person, or against a group or community that either results in or has a high likelihood of resulting in injury, death, psychological harm, mal-development, or deprivation.' <sup>17]</sup> The same source further notes that there are generally ,four modes by which violence may be inflicted: physical; sexual; psychological attack; and deprivation.' <sup>18]</sup> Violence in educational settings can take any of these forms, as indicated by the following examples:

**Bullying and peer victimization in school: Based on research conducted with elementary school:** children in Turkey, ,students who had high scores for being exposed to bullying were significantly more likely to experience headache, feeling bad, crying restlessness, nervousness, sleeping problems, dizziness; whereas students who had high bullying scores were significantly more likely to experience only poor appetite.' <sup>19]</sup>

**Corporal punishment at school:** Corporal punishment is widespread in most developing countries including India where ,growing classroom violence of teachers' has resulted in calls to ban the use of corporal punishment in school settings. <sup>10]</sup> A study of 250 children in India, for example, found that ,ear abuse in school children is common in low socio-economic strata and is often associated a long-term morbidity in our country.' Among the children interviewed as part of this study, the ,incidence of ear abuse with long term learning deficit was found to be 18.4 per cent.' <sup>11]</sup>

**Sexual violence in school:** Research in Zimbabwe, Malawi and Ghana documented ,incidents of male teachers and older male pupils aggressively propositioning female pupils for sex, ,sugar daddies' preying on schoolgirls in the vicinity of the school,and generally high levels of corporal punishment and bullying.' <sup>[12]</sup> Similarly, a study conducted with junior secondary students in Ghana and Botswana found ,similarities in the pervasive and inequitable gender/sexual practices within schools across country contexts.' <sup>[13]</sup> Leach and Humphreys point out that violent sexual behaviour is not always heterosexual with the girls as the victims but also takes other forms including homophobic and girl-on-girl violence. <sup>[14]</sup>

**Violence on the way to or from school:** Few reliable statistics are available that quantify the physical dangers associated with getting to and returning from school but problems have been documented including in Africa's more violent slums such as those in Nairobi. <sup>[15]</sup>

Violence in schools is not limited to developing countries but might be equally prominent in parts of the developed world including the United States where, according to a nationally representative sample of students in grades 9-12 who attended public and private schools, 5.9 per cent of the students had not gone to school on at least one day during the 30 days before the survey because they felt they would be unsafe at school or on their way to or from school. <sup>[16]</sup>

According to a report issued by the Government of India's Ministry of Women and Child Development, ,India is home to almost 19 per cent of the world's children. More than one third of the country's population around 440 million, is below 18 years.' <sup>[17]</sup> . It is perhaps then no surprise that ,India has taken large strides over the last decade in addressing issues like child education, health and development. However, child protection has remained largely unaddressed.' <sup>[18]</sup>

In India, child safety issues at schools are largely assessed through the paradigm of natural disasters. For instance, the School Safety Initiatives in India looked at the earthquake disaster in Gujarat in 2001 and noted that 971 students and 31 teachers died and 1,884 school buildings were destroyed. <sup>[19]</sup> In fact, ,an International Conference on School Safety held on 18-20 January 2007 in Ahmedabad recognised that every child has both the right to education and the right to safe and sustainable living, and set the goal of achieving ,zero mortality of children in schools from preventable disasters by the year 2015.' <sup>[20]</sup> Even though the conference recognized that that every child has a right to safe and sustainable living, it interpreted this narrowly to mean protection to school building structures which is robust and can withstand trauma to the physical structure caused by natural disasters like earthquakes, hurricanes, fires and other occupational hazards. A few months later after the conference held in Ahmedabad, ,the Asia Pacific Regional Workshop on School Education and Disaster Risk Reduction held on 8-10 October 2007 in Bangkok came out with a ,Bangkok Action Agenda' addressing all stakeholders, on the following priority areas for action: (i) Integrating Disaster Risk Reduction into School Education; (ii) Strengthening Disaster Risk Reduction Education for Community Resilience; (iii) Making Schools Safer; and (iv) Empowering Children for Disaster Risk Reduction.' <sup>[21]</sup> In these deliberations, school safety is a response to natural disasters, where the focus is to prepare a ,generation from the wrath of



disasters that will really help to prevent disaster.’<sup>[22]</sup> Accordingly, advocates call for schools to take responsibility for life threatening impact caused by these types of disasters and perform annual audits for robustness of building structures, Emergency Management Plans and so forth.<sup>[23]</sup>

Beyond the deliberations of safety at school from natural disasters, there is a debate developing in the Indian media on the threat to life caused to school going children through kidnaping by criminals and organized criminal gangs. In August 2012, the Times of India reported a story of the town of Gaya protesting the kidnaping of a Class IV student from a local private school.<sup>[24]</sup> Earlier that year, reports emerged of a ‘body of a 14-year-old school boy, who was kidnaped, was found in Punjab’<sup>[25]</sup>, ‘a 12-year-old boy kidnaped on April 17, while he was on his way to school, was found murdered in East Godavari district’<sup>[26]</sup>, and ‘a 15-year-old student of an English-medium school in Pune, was allegedly kidnaped and later murdered for a ransom.’<sup>[27]</sup> In some States in India, kidnaping of school children is thought to have achieved ‘industry status’<sup>[28]</sup>, both in the incidence of crime committed and the responses made to prevent it by private parties, even though countrywide data is not available. For example, the Web in India provides recommendations to wealthy parents to ensure that their children are not kidnaped to and back from school. They suggest that private run schools are equipping school buses with GPS tracking devices so that parents receive text messages every time their child embarks and disembarks from the bus. Furthermore, private schools provide 24-hour security at the gate and on schools premises, which are monitored and children’s presence in school are checked and registered throughout the school day. These parents are also being advised to enquire for security arrangements in Indian schools before enrolling their children.<sup>[29]</sup> For children in public schools, some of whom also get kidnaped as the news items above indicate, there are virtually no suggestions available.

Another pertinent issue related to safety of children attending schools in India is the issue of traffic accidents and/or deaths in the urban context as well as walking long distances to and back from school, sometimes through difficult terrain and at night, which may expose children to snake-bites and other injuries, for children in rural settings. Globally road traffic injuries are the leading cause of death among young people aged 15-19 years and second leading cause among 5-14 year olds.’<sup>[30]</sup> Even though India rates as a country with the highest number of road accidents, there are virtually no studies conducted inquiring to the knowledge and/or experiences of road safety for school going children. An exception to this is a study published in 2011 on knowledge and behavioural patterns with regard to road safety, traffic rules and risk factors associated with road accidents among school children in a rural community in Tamil Nadu, India.<sup>[31]</sup> The key conclusions showed that more than half of the study student sample were unable to identify even one of the five given mandatory road signs. While school-going children had relatively better knowledge regarding risk factors associated with road accidents, a majority of them had driven a motorised two wheeler without a valid license and without wearing a helmet. In addition, more than 10 per cent of the participants reported being involved in road-related accident in the past year.

Another study, on snakebite mortality in India concluded that snakebites remain ,an underestimated cause of accidental death in modern India.’<sup>[32]</sup> This study also found that due to ,inadequate hospital-based reporting’ estimates of total annual mortality due to snakebites ranged between 1,300 and 50,000.<sup>[33]</sup> Even though systematic research on fatalities and injuries experienced by children in schools in rural settings through snakebites is not available, media reports indicate that they do occur. For instance, in July of 2012, the Times of India reports that ,three students of Swami Ramkrishna Niwasi Ashram School of village Makardhokda, about 7 km from Deori, are reported to have died due to snake bites suffered while they were asleep in the school. Three others are critical and have been admitted to Bajaj Hospital, Gondia.’<sup>[34]</sup>

A 2010 report published by Plan International noted that over 50 per cent of Indian children faced sexual abuse while over 65 per cent received corporal punishment in schools despite the fact that the practice is illegal.<sup>[35]</sup> A majority of such victims are in state schools. The Plan study also noted that ,caste and gender discrimination was the major cause of violence against children. It said many students abandoned their studies because of such humiliation, which included hitting with hands or sticks, making them stand in various positions for long periods and tying them to chairs. More boys (54 per cent) than girls (45 per cent) were subjected to corporal punishment.’<sup>[36]</sup> In the schools surveyed by Plan, there were ,at least five beatings of students a day; many among the students interviewed believed corporal punishment was sometimes necessary. Students in Assam, Mizoram and Utta Pradesh reported the highest rates of corporal punishment, while Rajasthan and Goa the lowest.’<sup>[37]</sup> Similar findings appear to be reflected by the Indian National Commission for Protection of Child Rights which noted this year that it has received the highest number of complaints (115) related to child abuse in schools from Tamil Nadu and 570 complaints altogether of beating, harassment, humiliation and sexual exploitation in schools across the country.’<sup>[38]</sup>

Anecdotal information also exists in the media of students leaving school to find work in the farm or fields because their teachers are often absent. For instance in August 2012, The Indian Express covered a story of ,Radha (10), a Class IV student at a government primary school at Kukarda village in Vadodara district’s Naswadi Taluka’ who was ,found during school hours working with her family members on a farm where she earns Rs 100 in daily wages.’<sup>[39]</sup> When she was asked when she attended school the last time, she noted, that there was ,no point attending school when there is nobody to teach.’ Instead, she came to help her ,family members remove weeds in the maize field when teacher doesn’t come to teach us.’<sup>[40]</sup> The article goes on to note that other students who were also found working indicated that even when the teacher comes to school, ,she hardly takes class. So it is better to work here and earn some money rather than waste time in the school.’<sup>[41]</sup>

Child rights NGOs in India and elsewhere have been calling attention to safe schooling in their efforts to ensure universal primary education for all children. However, while cases of violence experienced in schools do get reported at times in the media, for most part they are under analyzed and do not form part of the debate of whether or not a child removed from unacceptable work and placed in schools is indeed safe or better off. This is especially the case in developing countries

with high rates of child labor. With efforts underway to remove children who are working full time and place them in schooling, education in the child labour context is regarded as a preventive measure. The belief in education as response and solution to child labour is so deeply engrained that usually little effort is made to consult with previously working children and their caregivers to ensure that the children's quality of life and well-being has improved following their removal from work and that the education alternative is safe and the children feel protected in their learning environments.

When discussing the negative impacts of child labour on the health and wellbeing of children in the developing world, more emphasis has been placed on access to education than the quality of the education that the children removed from worst forms of child labour can expect to receive. Studies on the quality of education tend to focus on what students learn and not how safe they are and how well they are treated while learning. Given the global efforts to eradicate child labor, especially the initiative to eliminate the worst forms by 2016,[42] it becomes urgently important to factor into our current thinking and program designs efforts that concurrently address the violence and abuse that are possible in formal and informal school settings. Similarly, it is important that both the harm and the potential benefits of work performed by children are taken into consideration including ways to combine formal education with acquiring practical life skills.[43] Now more than ever the voices of the beneficiaries of child labour programming need to be heard. Child inclusive monitoring techniques are available and need to be used systematically to record young people's views about their work and school, and factor these views into the analysis, programs of actions, campaigns and other initiatives to ensure increased well-being. Who better to know what is needed to address exploitation and abuse of people below the age of 18 than the children themselves?

## Notes & References

1. [1] UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1989, available at <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/law/crc.htm>
2. [2] United Nations World Day Against Child Labour, 12 June, 2012, available at <http://www.un.org/en/events/childlabourday/background.shtml>
3. [3] ILO/IPEC Child Labour and Responses in South Asia " India, available at <http://www.ilo.org/legacy/english/regions/asro/newdelhi/ipecc/responses/india/index.htm>
4. [4] Bourdillon, Michael, Levison, Deborah, Myers, William, White, Ben, Education, School, and Work, in: Rights and Wrongs of Children's Work, Rutgers University Press, 2010, pp. 108-132.
5. [5] Dunne, Mairead, Gender Violence in Schools in the Developing World, in: Gender & Education, Jan 2006, Vol. 18 Issue 1, pp. 75-98.
6. [6] While little data on violence in schools is available from official sources, the UN Office of the Special Representative for Children and Armed Conflict has discussed

attacks on schools and the many implications of violent conflict on access to education. For more information see <http://childrenandarmedconflict.un.org/effects-of-conflict/the-most-grave-violations/attacks-against-schools/>

7. [7] Violence Prevention Alliance, World Report on Violence and Health, available at <http://www.who.int/violenceprevention/approach/definition/en/index.html>
8. [8] Violence Prevention Alliance, World Report on Violence and Health, available at <http://www.who.int/violenceprevention/approach/definition/en/index.html>
9. [9] Karatas, Hulya, Ozturk, Candan, Relationship Between Bullying and Health Problems in Primary School Children, in: Asian Nursing Research, 5(2), pp.81-87, Jun 2011; see also: Hong, Jun Sung, Espelage, Dorothy L., A Review of Research on Bullying and Peer Victimization in School: An Ecological System Analysis, in: Aggression and Violent Behavior, 17(4), pp.311-322, Jul 2012; Sherer, PenchanPradubmook, Sherer, Moshe, Violence Among High School Students in Thailand: Cultural Perspectives, in: International Journal of Intercultural Relations, 35(6), pp.867-880, Nov 2011.
10. [10] Hasan ,Suroor, Call for Punishment Ban, Times Educational Supplement 05/22/98, Issue 4273, p. 25.
11. [11] Rathore, P.K, Raj, Anoop, Mandal, S., Meher, Ravi, Girhotra, Manish, Ear Abuse in School Children, Indian Journal of Otolaryngology and Head & Neck Surgery, 2008.
12. [12] Leach, Fiona, Learning to be Violent: the Role of the School in Developing Adolescent Gendered Behaviour, in: A Journal of Comparative Education, Sep 2003, Vol. 33 Issue 3, p. 385; see also: Dunne, Mairead, Gender Violence in Schools in the Developing World, in: Gender & Education, Jan 2006, Vol. 18 Issue 1, pp. 75-98.
13. [13] Dunne, Mairead, Gender, Sexuality and Schooling: Everyday Life in Junior Secondary Schools in Botswana and Ghana, in: International Journal of Educational Development, 27(5), pp. 499-511, Sep 2007.
14. [14] Leach, Fiona, Humphreys, Sara, Gender Violence in Schools: Taking the 'Girls-as-Victims' Discourse Forward; in: Gender & Development, Mar 2007, Vol. 15 Issue 1, pp. 51-65.
15. [15] Bourdillon, Michael, Levison, Deborah, Myers, William, White, Ben, Education, School, and Work, in: Rights and Wrongs of Children's Work, Rutgers University Press, 2010, pp. 108-132.
16. [16] Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC), Youth Risk Behavior Surveillance System: 2011 National Overview, available at [http://www.cdc.gov/healthyyouth/yrbs/pdf/us\\_overview\\_yrbs.pdf](http://www.cdc.gov/healthyyouth/yrbs/pdf/us_overview_yrbs.pdf)
17. [17] Ministry of Women and Child Development, Government of India, Study on Child Abuse: India 2007, available at <http://wcd.nic.in/childabuse.pdf>

18. [18] Ministry of Women and Child Development, Government of India, Study on Child Abuse: India 2007, available at <http://wcd.nic.in/childabuse.pdf>
- [19]Gupta, Manu, School Safety Initiatives in India, available at <http://www.hyogo.uncrd.or.jp/school%20project/pdf/2006NepalWS%20Presentation%20Gupta.pdf>
19. [20]Safecommunities, Safety at School, available at [http://safecommunities.info/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=51&Itemid=54](http://safecommunities.info/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=51&Itemid=54)
20. [21]Safecommunities, Safety at School, available at [http://safecommunities.info/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=51&Itemid=54](http://safecommunities.info/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=51&Itemid=54)
21. [22]Safecommunities, Safety at School, available at [http://safecommunities.info/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=51&Itemid=54](http://safecommunities.info/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=51&Itemid=54)
22. [23]Quakeschool, Owner's Responsibility and School Safety Audits in India, available at <http://quakeschool.blogspot.de/2011/02/owners-responsibility-and-school-safety.html>
23. [24]Qadir, Abdul, Bodh Gaya Bandh to Protest Schoolboy's Kidnapping, available at [http://articles.timesofindia.indiatimes.com/2012-08-22/patna/33321398\\_1\\_bodh-gaya-prashant-gaya-police](http://articles.timesofindia.indiatimes.com/2012-08-22/patna/33321398_1_bodh-gaya-prashant-gaya-police)
24. [25]Press Trust of India, Kidnapped School Boy Found Murdered, <http://www.ndtv.com/topic/kidnapped-school-boy>
25. [26]Press Trust of India, Kidnapped School Boy Found Murdered, <http://www.ndtv.com/topic/kidnapped-school-boy>
26. [27]Press Trust of India, Kidnapped School Boy Found Murdered, <http://www.ndtv.com/topic/kidnapped-school-boy>
27. [28]Thakore, Dilip, Is India Dangerous for Children?, available at <http://www.educationworldonline.net/index.php/page-article-choice-more-id-700>
28. [29]ThinkVidya, The Importance of Security in Indian Schools "How Safe is your Child?", available at <http://www.thinkvidya.com/a/the-importance-of-security-in-indian-schools-how-safe-is-your-child>
29. [30]C. K.Priyanka Raj, ShibSekharDatta, Jayanthi V., Zile Singh, Senthilvel V., Study of Knowledge and Behavioural Patterns with Regard to Road Safety Among High School Children in a Rural Community in Tamil Nadu, India, in: Indian Journal of Medical Specialities, 24 August 2011.

30. [31]C. K. Priyanka Raj, ShibSekharDatta, Jayanthi V., Zile Singh, Senthilvel V., Study of Knowledge and Behavioural Patterns with Regard to Road Safety Among High School Children in a Rural Community in Tamil Nadu, India, in: Indian Journal of Medical Specialities, 24 August 2011.
31. [32]Bijayeeni Mohapatra<sup>1</sup>, David A. Warrell, Wilson Suraweera, Prakash Bhatia, NeerajDhingra, Raju M. Jotkar, Peter S. Rodriguez, Kaushik Mishra, Romulus Whitaker, PrabhatJha, Snakebite Mortality in India: A Nationally Representative Mortality Survey, in: Neglected Tropical Diseases, 12 April 2011.
32. [33]Bijayeeni Mohapatra<sup>1</sup>, David A. Warrell, Wilson Suraweera, Prakash Bhatia, NeerajDhingra, Raju M. Jotkar, Peter S. Rodriguez, Kaushik Mishra, Romulus Whitaker, PrabhatJha, Snakebite Mortality in India: A Nationally Representative Mortality Survey, in: Neglected Tropical Diseases, 12 April 2011.
33. [34]The Times of India, 3 School Kids Die of Snake Bites, 3 More Critical, available at [http://articles.timesofindia.indiatimes.com/2012-07-13/nagpur/32662933\\_1\\_snake-bites-three-students-third-student](http://articles.timesofindia.indiatimes.com/2012-07-13/nagpur/32662933_1_snake-bites-three-students-third-student)
34. [35]Rediff, 50 pc Indian Kids Face Sexual Abuse in Schools, available at <http://news.rediff.com/slide-show/2010/oct/27/slide-show-1-50-pc-indian-kids-face-sexual-abuse-in-schools.htm>
35. [36]The Times of India, 'More than 50% Indian Kids Face Sexual Abuse', available at [http://articles.timesofindia.indiatimes.com/2010-10-27/india/28272300\\_1\\_corporal-punishment-school-kids-sexual-abuse](http://articles.timesofindia.indiatimes.com/2010-10-27/india/28272300_1_corporal-punishment-school-kids-sexual-abuse)
36. [37]The Times of India, 'More than 50% Indian Kids Face Sexual Abuse', available at [http://articles.timesofindia.indiatimes.com/2010-10-27/india/28272300\\_1\\_corporal-punishment-school-kids-sexual-abuse](http://articles.timesofindia.indiatimes.com/2010-10-27/india/28272300_1_corporal-punishment-school-kids-sexual-abuse)
37. [38]The Indian Express, 'Highest Cases of Child Sexual Abuse, Exploitation in TN Schools', available at <http://www.indianexpress.com/news/highest-cases-of-child-sexual-abuse-exploitation-in-tn-schools/951028/>
38. [39] The Indian Express, Teachers a Rare Sight, Students Work as Farm Hands, available at <http://www.indianexpress.com/news/teachers-a-rare-sight-students-work-as-farm-hands/988163/>
39. [40]The Indian Express, Teachers a Rare Sight, Students Work as Farm Hands, available at <http://www.indianexpress.com/news/teachers-a-rare-sight-students-work-as-farm-hands/988163/>
40. [41]The Indian Express, Teachers a Rare Sight, Students Work as Farm Hands, available at <http://www.indianexpress.com/news/teachers-a-rare-sight-students-work-as-farm-hands/988163/>

[42] International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), see  
<http://www.ilo.org/ipeclang--en/index.htm#a1>

41. [43]Bourdillon, Michael, Levison, Deborah, Myers, William, White, Ben, Assessing Harm against Benefits, in: Rights and Wrongs of Children's Work, Rutgers University Press, 2010, pp. 155-179.

Anita Sheth,  
*Director Breakthrough Impact Development*  
*Toronto, Canada*

Elke de Buhr  
*Payson Center for International Development*  
*Tulane University*  
*New Orleans, USA*

## Patriarchal Modernity and the Resignification of the Sex Worker

Anuja Gupta

### Abstract

*Over the years sex workers have faced widespread humiliation from different quarters of the society. Whether the social stigma attached to their profession, the legal structure that looks upon their profession as a health hazard or certain feminists who believe sex work to be oppressive, what has been constant is the strangling of the voices and choices of sex workers themselves. This paper tries to understand how sex workers have tried to resignify their bodies and their sexuality by trying to combat and protest against the humiliation that society meets out to them. The first part of the paper tries to show how some sex workers believe that sex work defies patriarchal norms and have argued in favour of a possible inversion of patriarchy thereby setting up a parallel defiant life style or society alongside the patriarchal set up. The paper also points out other scathing critiques of patriarchy by sex workers and their organizations and how they have been combating the humiliation they are regularly subjected to through various attempts to resignify themselves. The second part of the paper points out how this resignification has remained incomplete and temporary. As a result the paper tries to argue that as modernity is patriarchal in nature, these resignification claims of sex workers have gone largely unheard. In fact, in the time of spatriarchal modernitys values of patriarchy remain deeply imbibed in sex workers themselves thus, making their attempts at inverting patriarchy only a myth. The paper takes up the movies sMandi: The Marketplaces (1983) by Shyam Benegal and sChamelies (2003) by Sudhir Mishra in order to substantiate its arguments. It concentrates mainly on the contemporary Indian society although it provides a brief historical narrative and certain references from the international sex work scenario as well.*

*women talk. Like the members of any repressed group, they are verbal persons, talking because they are permitted no other form of expressionBut womens talk has always been deliberately trivialized.s - Kate Millett<sup>11</sup>*

Sex work is often looked upon as the soldest professions. The Devadasi tradition in India can be traced as the beginning of sex work as a profession. Although Devadasis or sslaves of Gods were temple dancers who were respected and culturally enriched with a high position in society, the advent of patriarchal modernity adversely changed conditions for them. Laws banning temple dancing brought upon economic difficulties and cultural estrangement--pushing the Devadasis into selling their sexuality for money. The British in India began to encourage such sex work further in order to fill the sexual appetites of their soldiers. Whether baijis in kothas or whether sex workers in brothels, all became a means to satisfy the sexual urges of the British Indian army. Nevertheless, it was during this time that sex workers were forced to go through forced



health checkups to ensure that the fitness of soldiers could be taken care of, while the health of sex workers themselves remained unattended. Cases of trafficking were also on the rise and although the British themselves encouraged sex work, the double standards of patriarchal modernity did not hesitate to humiliate and insult sex workers. Even after independence the miserable plight of the sex workers in India did not come to an end. They continue to be humiliated on various grounds and face violence and rape while the law stereotypes them as fallen women and refuses to protect them.

Mikhail Bakhtin<sup>[2]</sup> points out the modern dichotomy between the canonized and the grotesque body. Following this it becomes clear that the ideal canonized body must be closed while the grotesque body is open. Thus, in patriarchal modernity, the ideal female body needs to be closed and must learn to contain her sexuality within a private space. She is expected to have only one sex partner and must concentrate on her role as wife and mother thereby reinforcing the values of the patriarchal family. Needless to say, the body of the sex worker stands in sharp contrast to this ideal image. Her body is open “this becomes clear through the depiction of the lips of the sex worker. Lips are considered to be an essential part of the body by Bakhtin as it connects the self to the others. The lips of a sex worker are mostly envisioned in red lipstick, thus accentuating them and as if inviting and seducing the world to her. Moreover, the sex worker spills her sexuality from the private into the public space and thus, defying the ideal image. This contributes in making her body grotesque. Thus, the body of a sex worker becomes the site of her humiliation and designates her, the position of a fallen woman. Nevertheless, sex workers today have refused to accept such unfair patriarchal stereotypes and use their body as the site of inversion of such humiliation. Their body not only becomes the repository of humiliation but rises up in protest and also serves as the site for resignification of the sex worker, her sexuality and her profession.

### **Inversion of patriarchal norms**

In many ways sex workers have been able to invert certain patriarchal norms and stereotypes that have been assigned to women. Unlike the structure of the patriarchal family that instructs women to preserve their virginity before marriage and be emotionally and sexually loyal to their husband, sex workers do not value the idea of sex after or within the confines of marriage. Most sex workers are unmarried and sex workers like Nalini Jameela<sup>[3]</sup> continued with her profession even after being married thrice. This leads sex workers to believe that they successfully defy the institutions of marriage and family. Jameela in *The Autobiography of a Sex Worker* points out that many women in India often choose sex work as it frees them from the confines of male domination. Sex workers are careful in pointing out that they do not support trafficking and make a distinction between those who are forced to enter or remain in the profession and those who have entered or remained within it through free choice. Sex workers like Jameela have emphasized on the point that many of them entered the profession by choice and thus, sex work must be respected just like any other profession. They point out that in reality the sheer defiance of patriarchy and its dictates by sex workers becomes a major reason for the humiliation of sex workers. This is because sex work challenges to invert patriarchy and the value laden family structure which in turn causes a

sense of alarm for patriarchal modernity. In an effort to resignify their body, sex workers point out a number of ways in which they successfully defy stereotypes and thus, argue that sex work makes them more emancipated than most straight women.

Sex workers point out that they have the freedom of choice that is absent for most women because they must follow the dictates of their husbands. As opposed to other women, sex workers do not feel the need to have a male head in their households. As they are economically independent, they can raise their own children and most times it is the sex worker and not the society who chooses the father of her child. They point out that many married women are simply tied to and enslaved by a single man all her life and being economically dependent, are forced to satisfy him and toe his line. However, sex workers are not tied to such patriarchal norms and are thus independent and free. They never become too dependent on a single man and believe that their sexuality is not restricted because they have the freedom to have multiple sex partners. It is true that not all their clients are attractive but they also quickly point out that many a times they have the freedom to choose or reject their clients. This becomes clear when Munni, a sex worker in Sonagachi, in her interview with UNODC (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime)[4] asserts that her brothel owner treats her with care and she likes some of her clients. She reveals that she came to the brothel due to trafficking and had her share of the hard life, yet when asked if she would like to leave she explains that she stays on out of her own choice and plans to marry her lover. While she would never want her future daughter to become a sex worker but for herself she chooses this life over one of humiliation which she fears she will face in the outside world. In this case, though Munni was trafficked she has come to find a place for herself in the brothel and finds comfort and autonomy within the brothel as opposed to the outside world.

A close look at the lives of sex workers through movies also clearly shows that they do not hesitate to use harsh abusive language with men in order to ward them off. The use of such language is also a clear defiance of patriarchal norms that expect women to be soft and tender. Standing in sharp contrast to such expectations, sex workers know how exactly to protect themselves against abuse. Their language and behavior is often successful in intimidating or scaring unwanted men including the police. In fact Rekha, a Sonagachi sex worker points out to writer Dilip DsSouza and photographer Tom Pietrasik that sex workers do not have inhibitions about their sexuality and are not insecure unlike many other women.[5] Sex workers thus, claim that the economic and emotional independence that sex work offers them is far more desirable than being married to and dependent on a tyrannical man. Thus, many sex workers cherish their freedom and their defiant life styles and condemn efforts at rehabilitating them. Christine Overall points out: sThe workers did not want others to speak authoritatively about their lives; they resented the assumption that their work was necessarily demeaning and never freely chosen. Instead they defended their rights to be prostitutes and the value, dignity, and liberty of the work, which many of them take to be a profession. Nor did they want to be targets of pity or rescue work.s[6] It is this vigour that claims that s...many sex workers identify with feminist values such as independence, financial autonomy, sexual self determination personal strength, and female bonding. 7

Such attempts to turn patriarchy on its head by defying and inverting patriarchal norms, is a clear sign of resignification through the body as a site of such inversion. The movie 'Mandi', directed by Shyam Benegal provides many such instances where sex workers in the brothel are shown as being defiant of societal rules. As a result, the movie successfully portrays the constant efforts of sex workers to invert patriarchy in order to invert the humiliation it metes out to them. In 'Mandi', whether it is the servant of the brothel played by Naseeruddin Shah, or whether it is the docile police constable played by Satish Kaushik, all male characters within the brothel had only a subservient status as compared to the breadwinners of the household, i.e. the female sex workers. The sex workers are seen to be bold and often rude to these men. In fact, Neena Gupta who played one of the sex workers also refuses to accept clients whom she detested and is not forced to entertain them. The movie further illustrates how the patriarchal society stands in opposition to sex work and shows how entrenchment of patriarchal modernity prompts women to pose the biggest threat to sex work. Thus, the powerful female NGO worker, who tries to uproot the brothel, is skillfully tackled by Shabana Azmi, the brothel owner, who is shown to have strong defiance for patriarchy. In fact, she is seen cursing Ila Arun (another sex worker) for giving birth to too many male children and celebrates the birth of a girl child in the brothel. This clearly shows how sex workers defy another essential patriarchal ritual of celebrating the male child more than his female counterpart. The movie in itself thus, successfully sums up how sex workers in contemporary India are working hard to defy patriarchal humiliation through resignification.

Unfortunately, sex workers find little support from certain feminists, like Carole Pateman, Christine Overall, Jean D Cunha<sup>[7]</sup> or Laurie Shrage<sup>[8]</sup>. Such feminists while supporting sex workers themselves condemn their profession. Sex workers like Nalini Jameela have risen in protest of such a standpoint. They claim that rehabilitation of sex workers or abolition of the profession will do little good to them and want their feminist sisters to stop strangling their voices. As ex-sex worker J, opines: 'I like to believe I have some kind of free choice. Some choice in my life. That I chose a lesser evil. I wanted to do it. And somehow I want that to be respected' Somehow their pity deprives me of my freedom of choice. I don't want to be saved! Something in me just resents this moralism, their uplifting.<sup>[9]</sup>

In an effort to resignify sex workers and their profession The Calcutta Sex Workers Union (1997) points out that there is the need to hear the voices of sex workers themselves. It offers a critique of patriarchal oppression while arguing for a shift in the prism through which their lives and work is viewed.<sup>[10]</sup> Its manifesto claims that illegal prostitution creates divisions between women, that is the Madonna and the whore.<sup>[11]</sup> Also the DMSC (Durbar Mahila Samanwaya Committee) in Sonagachi is an association that actively involves sex workers in the area and successfully fights patriarchal humiliation trying to create better working and living conditions for sex workers. Moni Nag believes that it 'can herald the beginning of a silent revolution among sex workers in the Indian as well as global arena.<sup>[12]</sup> This organization spreads awareness of AIDS and other venereal diseases in order to protect the health of sex workers. It denounces and combats forced health checkups of sex workers and makes sure that the voices, protests and demands of sex workers are heard. It actively involves sex workers themselves and provides them with recreation and a chance

to explore their qualities through various cultural, educational and artistic programmes. It tries to make sure that those women who want to leave the profession have a way out and those who want to remain within it have a dignified life. The DMSC denounces legalizing sex work as it will bring sex workers further under the scrutiny of the law and the society which will brand them as fallen/badgirls and increase humiliating practices like forced health checkups. It rather advocates decriminalization of sex work which will possibly remove the stigma attached to the profession. Such efforts at resignification that have been taken up by sex workers themselves clearly show that they refuse to succumb to patriarchal humiliation.

In Mysore, Hotel Ashodaya is a restaurant that is successfully run by sex workers. It attracts customers from all walks of life and serves as a means to resignify sex workers in the area by trying to integrate them into the society. This in turn helps to fight the social stigma that humiliates sex workers. In fact Naseema, the 26-year old daughter of a sex worker in Chaturbhuj Sthan, in north Bihar, has also started an organization called Pracham which tries to assure a better life for sex workers. It not only provides a doorway out of the profession for those who want to quit but also ensures that those who remain within the profession can expect better working and living conditions. Such efforts clearly show that sex workers are increasingly reclaiming their rights as citizens of the country and stand in strong opposition to the stigma and humiliation that patriarchy subjects them to.

## ,h2>Critiquing patriarchal modernity

Apart from standing in defiance and trying to show how sex work helps invert patriarchal stereotypes, many sex workers have also tried to resignify themselves by revealing the contradictions within patriarchal societies. They point out that sex is also an art and sex workers are those who have mastered this art. Further, they claim that if there were no sex workers, the sexual appetites of men would remain unattended. This would lead to the crashing down of the patriarchal family itself because men would no longer go back home to their wives. They thus point out that while patriarchy feeds and nourishes a manss sexuality by silently encouraging sex work, a womans sexuality has been considered as societys property to be used to further its aims. <sup>[13]</sup> They thus, point out that while the patriarchal society itself requires sex work to survive, the double standards inherent within it prompts it to humiliate the body and character of the sex worker and designate her as grotesque or sfallens. They also point out that ironically, sex work is sa crime in which the customer is not guilty. <sup>[14]</sup> They battle against these patriarchal double standards and claim dignity and respect from the society. However, they clearly state that they are not victims but professionals working in an area of specialization that is essential to society. They are brave enough to challenge patriarchal modernity through their body and their profession. In fact, in the film Mandi, Shabana Azmi addresses a group of so-called respectable men and women asking them how they would survive without sex work. She questions their sense of morality and bravely defends the position and respect of her brothel. Although such a standpoint does not directly invert patriarchy, it offers a scathing critique of it. Thus, sex workers through their life

style and their choices have constantly attempted to invert patriarchy whether through defiance of its norms or through their scathing critique of patriarchal modernity.

### **The incomplete inversion**

In spite of the struggle for resignifying sex workers, the inversion of humiliation or of patriarchy remains incomplete and temporary in many ways. As pointed out by Gopal Guru, the project of resignification through the body as a site is often limited and is reduced to a mere self-declaration. This has been the case for sex workers as well. Patriarchal modernity has refused to open its doors to sex work. Owing to the danger that the profession poses to the patriarchal set-up, sex workers have been continuously kept at bay. Their voices have been silenced by ignoring their claims and protests. In a way, this has also been a survival strategy for modernity because unless women's sexuality can be contained, the institution of the family will crash, thus destroying the very basis of patriarchy. In the battle between patriarchal modernity and sex workers, most often the latter has lost thereby overshadowing its efforts through the social humiliation that sex workers face.

In fact, what can be often noticed is that sex workers themselves have internalized patriarchal values. As we have already seen, Munni in her interview with UNODC while claiming to be part of the brothel as her own choice cannot hide her dissatisfaction at the course that her life has taken. She in fact clearly states her several attempts at escaping the clutches of the brothel and her determination not to make her daughter part of the profession that she was pushed into. Also, her entry into the profession was by compulsion and the main reason behind her sticking to it is her fear of rejection and humiliation in the outside world. Thus, even while sex workers critique patriarchy, they talk about how their profession serves as its basis. As a result, arguments about how without sex work patriarchal families would collapse, gain currency among sex workers. Even in justifying their work and critiquing patriarchy, they are not free from its value system. Moreover, what can be noticed is that many sex workers cannot give up the desire to have a normal relationship with a man and to be married. Also, they do reveal the need to be an accepted part of a society that is patriarchal. Thus, the bold ex-sex worker J points out, that the inability of sex workers to have a normal relationship was a major reason for her quitting the profession. Even Munni of Sonagachi expresses her desire to marry a client who has professed his love for her and is a taxi driver. Thus, though many sex workers claim that they do not need a man to be happy, most do fall prey to patriarchal stereotypes. It is also no secret that sex workers continue to be raped and tortured by the police and by pimps. This shows that though they may be economically independent they are still subjected to male dominance. This often prompts many of them to look for alternatives outside the profession. This became clear when more than 50 sex workers in North Bihar were enthusiastic about leaving the profession through Naseemas Pracham. Moni Nag points out that the Calcutta Sex Workers manifesto tries hard to justify the emotions of female sex workers and how contrary to popular belief, they do value motherhood just like all other women. Clearly, this shows the power of patriarchal control, which forces women to over-explain their positions, even while asserting themselves. [15]

The legal structure also does little to respond to the demands of sex workers. It is quite obvious that they never have a say in making the laws that affect their lives. As already stated, it is the sex workers who are faced with punishments and humiliation and never their male clients. Moreover, the law fails to protect them against constant violation and assaults as they are always looked upon as outcasts. In fact even the Supreme Court in February 2011, while acknowledging the plight of prostitutes pointed out that society should sympathize with them. The very idea of sympathy and the word prostitute itself are humiliating for sex workers as it nullifies their protests and demands. The court also called for legalization of the profession which too is in stark contrast to their demands for decriminalization of the profession.

Feminists like Carole Pateman point out that selves are inseparable from bodies<sup>[16]</sup> Thus, Pateman argues that in modern patriarchy, sale of women's bodies in the capitalist market involves sale of a self in a different manner<sup>[17]</sup> Thus, in a way sex work is claimed to objectify the sex worker and her sexuality and commodify her body. In spite of the strong refusal of such a viewpoint by sex workers like J, and Nalini Jameela, inconsistencies in their defence can clearly be noticed. In fact, in most cases sex workers do feel that the idea of having to be emotionally detached during repeated sexual encounters is not only difficult but also very taxing. Thus, in some ways it cannot be denied that the profession, within the patriarchal society, does alienate women thereby making a false and humiliating distinction between her body and her 'self./p>

Even among the Bedias where sisters are involved in sex work in order to run the households, the idea of patriarchy is in no way inverted. As pointed out by Anuja Agrawal<sup>[18]</sup> in her book, 'Chaste Wives and Prostitute Sisters: Patriarchy and Prostitution Among the Bedias of India, the Bedias hold onto the patriarchal family and their wives are never allowed to be economically independent and must look after household chores. Thus, only economic independence in many cases fails to emancipate sex workers. Most sex workers belong to poor and low caste families and they face much violence within the profession. However, it manages to feed and clothe them and their families and some also grow to like the work. As Nancy Fraser correctly points out, status subordination cannot be understood in isolation from economic arrangements and is often linked to distributive injustice. Their efforts at resignification and their claims to invert and critique patriarchy are thus, often traced to their need to remain within the profession coupled with their want of social and patriarchal acceptance. As Jagrees: | Id like so much to have the illusion that I had some freedom of choice. Maybe its just an illusion, but I need to think I had some freedom. Yet then I realize how much was determined in the way I got into prostitution, how determined my life had been (Emphasis added).<sup>[19]</sup>

Sudhir Mishra's film *Chamelie* successfully depicts how in many ways the project of patriarchal inversion has failed. Dhandewali hoon saab, koi bhikhaari nahis while Kareena Kapoor's address to Rahul Bose show that she prides her profession, the words *saab* simultaneously shows that she accepts him as her sexual and social superior. Moreover, the movie also signifies how sex workers are subjected to sexual and physical harassment at the hands of policemen. In spite of *Chamelie*'s bold nature she is forced to pacify a policeman (who beats her for her harsh language) by extending

sexual favours to him. She is also forced by her pimp to entertain a rich and powerful man who has sexually transmitted diseases. When she refuses, she is faced with much trouble and a taxi driver even comments how her life could well be in danger owing to her refusal. The fact that Chameli must depend on a man (Rahul Bose) in order to be rescued from the situation shows how sex workers remain helpless in their battle against patriarchal modernity. The movie also shows Chameli growing love and admiration for Rahul Bose thereby depicting the various ways in which sex workers while defying patriarchy succumb to its dictates. Chameli's tattooed hand is a reinforcement of her patriarchal label of a bad/fallen woman and how her body is marked with that humiliation.

Though sex workers try hard to resignify their bodies through their efforts at inverting patriarchy, many a times such efforts are incomplete and there is a reinforcing of the humiliation that patriarchal modernity subjects them to. Thus, in *Smita* the disillusioned Smita Patil realizes that she will find no freedom either in the confines of the brothel or in a romantic relationship with her beloved. She thus runs into the rising sun in an effort to deny her identity in society, hoping to resignify herself through anonymity. Theresa Saliba while reviewing the book *Woman at Point Zero* (1975), which is set in Egypt, by Nawal El Saadawi points out that Firdaus, the sex worker who dared to speak the truth and stand up against the patriarchal society by murdering her pimp, had to be silenced through death. Thus, in the eyes of patriarchal modernity, Firdaus's refusal to accept her position within their enslaving structure condemns her to death.<sup>[20]</sup> Such is the strength of patriarchy and the modernity that has been crafted out to suit its interests, that sex workers and their efforts to reclaim their self respect have often been thwarted. Nevertheless, the bold endeavor to use the body which is the site of humiliation as a means to resignify sex workers and to possibly invert patriarchy is rather commendable. Such efforts champion the high self esteem of these women that encourages them in this bold and brave project. Sex workers are yet to be able to change the way patriarchal society looks at them and have not been able to put an end to the humiliation that they face each day. However, work done by various sex workers and associations of sex workers in different parts of the country in order to bring about resignification and inversion could well be the necessary first step towards a much needed revolution that will not only free sex workers and their profession from social stigma but will also mark the beginning of a change that will finally allow all women to freely make their own life choices whether in terms of their profession or in terms of their sexuality.

### Notes & References

1. Coppa, Frank J., *The Papacy Confronts the Modern World*, (Krieger Publishing Company, 2003), 40-42.
2. 1. Kate Millett, "Prostitution: A Quartet for Female Voices" in *Woman in Sexist Society: Studies in Power and Powerlessness*, New American Library, 1972, p. 61.
3. 2. Mikhail Bakhtin, "The Grotesque Image of the Body and its Sources" in *The Body: A Reader*, Routledge (London and New York), 2005.

4. 3. Nalini Jameela, *The Autobiography of a Sex Worker*, Westland Books, 2005.
5. 4. <http://www.unodc.org/southasia//frontpage/2010/March/red-lights-of-sonagachi.html>
6. 5. [http://archive.tehelka.com/story\\_main39.asp?filename=hub170508the\\_golden.asp](http://archive.tehelka.com/story_main39.asp?filename=hub170508the_golden.asp)
7. 6. Christine Overall, "What's wrong with Prostitution? Evaluating Sex Work" in *Signs*, Vol. 17, No. 4, Summer 1992, p. 706.
8. 7. Christine Overall, op. cit., p. 707.
9. 8. Jean D'Cunha, "Prostitution Laws: Ideological Dimensions and Enforcement Practices" in *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 27, No. 17, Apr. 25, 1992, pp. WS34-WS44.
10. 9. Laurie Shrage, "Should Feminists Oppose Prostitution" in *Ethics*, Vol. 99, No. 2 Jan., 1989, pp. 347-61.
11. 10. Kate Millet, op. cit., p. 124.
12. 11. Geetanjali Gangoli, "Prostitution, Legalisation and Decriminalisation: Recent Debates" in *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 33, No. 10, Mar. 7-13, 1998, p. 504.
13. 12. Geetanjali Gangoli, op. cit., p. 504.
14. 13. Moni Nag, "Sex Workers in Sonagachi: Pioneers of a Revolution" in *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 40, No. 49, Dec. 3-9, 2005, p. 5151.
15. 14. Lise Fortier, "Women, Sex and Patriarchy" in *Family Planning Perspectives*, Vol. 7, No. 6, Nov. - Dec., 1975, p. 280.
16. 15. Lise Fortier, op. cit., p. 280.
17. 16. Christine Overall, op. cit., p. 504.
18. 17. Carole Pateman, "What's wrong with Prostitution?" in *Women's Studies Quarterly*, Spring-Summer, 1999, Vol. 27, No. 1 / 2, p. 60.
19. 18. Carole Pateman, op. cit., p. 60.
20. 19. Anuja Agrawal, *Chaste Wives and Prostitute Sisters: Patriarchy and Prostitution among the Bedias of India*, Routledge, 2007.
21. 20. Kate Millet, op. cit., pp. 124-5.
22. 21. Therese Saliba, "On the Bodies of Third World Women: Cultural Impurity, Prostitution, and Other Nervous Conditions" in *College Literature*, Third World Women's Inscriptions, Feb., 1995, Vol. 22, No. 1, p. 136.

Anuja Gupta  
*Guest Faculty, Asutosh College, Kolkata*



## **Caste and the Middle Class: Glimpses from Colonial Malabar**

**Sreejith K.**

In 1930, when the British government nominated the Thiyya, C. Krishnan, as a representative of the Madras Legislative Council, it must have been the crowning moment in an already illustrious career. Krishnan had, by then, completed successful stints as an advocate, banker and publisher. His wife was running an ayurvedic shop from home, whose products were in demand even abroad. And his subordinates in the office included several upper castes, some of whom were Brahmins. Around the same time, another Thiyya, Keeleri Kunhikannan, the circus artiste from Tellicherry was enthraling audiences around the state. His disciples, at least one of whom went on to attain fame in Europe, included castes lower to him. This was all a far cry from the scenario at the turn of the century when interaction between the castes was at a premium prompting Swami Vivekananda to dub the state a 'smental asylums!

In the breaking down of the barriers of caste, the middle classes played an important role. As Andre Beteille points out:

The whole idiom of purity and pollution which was the cement as it were of the old social hierarchy is antithetical to middle-class modes of life and work. It is impossible to organize work in a modern office in conformity with that idiom. Social exclusion on grounds of ritual defilement, if practiced consistently, will bring to a standstill the work of any modern institution, whether a bank, a laboratory or a newspaper. For all its many sins, it was the middle class that first grasped the significance of this and took the initiative in discrediting the rules of purity and pollution.<sup>1</sup>

This paper, by examining, among other sources, the autobiographical literature produced by individuals belonging to the Nair and Thiyya communities in colonial Malabar, seeks to explore the middle class interface with caste in the region.<sup>2</sup>

### **A Social order based on Caste hierarchy**

Caste inequities had been exceptionally severe in Kerala, with practices of untouchability and unseeability making life intolerable for the lower castes. The following passage delineates the hierarchy amongst the different castes and the equations between them in the early twentieth century:

At the top of the traditional hierarchy in Kerala were the Namboodiri Brahmins who, though only a small part of the population, occupied a distinct position with great prestige, sanctity and often extensive grants of land. "Under the Namboodiris, were the so-called foreign Brahmins who came from Tamilnad and Mysore. They were mostly employed in temples and as cooks in Namboodiri

and royal households. The Kshatriyas who came next in the social order were always few in number, in fact non-existent in some parts of Kerala. A group of Ambalavasis (temple servants) and Samantans (ruling chiefs) were placed above the majority of the Nayars. The Nayars, who come next in this hierarchy, were themselves divided into numerous sub-castes, all hierarchically placed, though the subdivisions vary from region to region. Below the Nayars came the various polluting castes, including the various artisans, toddy-tappers, agricultural workers, fishermen, hunters and semi-tribals. These castes were ranked according to the distance they were permitted to approach a Namboodiri or Nayar without polluting him. Thus, according to Logan, a Mukkuvan (a sea-fishing caste) could approach up to 24 feet of a Namboodiri, an Izhava or Tiyyar 32 feet, a Cheruman 64, and a Nayadi 72 feet. The only two numerically large polluting castes were the Tiyyars and Cherumans. <sup>3</sup>

Till the early twentieth century, caste barriers, though no longer as strong as in the past, prevailed. The time for the abolition of untouchability, and entry for the lower castes into temples still remained distant. Those among the middle class who had their early education in the villages remembered how caste played a determining role in their everyday lives. For instance, Thikkodiyar, who went on to acquire fame as a radio broadcaster and dramatist, writes of how in the village school he attended in the early part of the twentieth century, upper caste boys like him were segregated from the lower castes, and how the master, in order to avoid pollution, would not beat a low caste student, but instead would throw the stick on him from a distance! <sup>4</sup> C. Krishnan recounts how, while at Madras Presidency College, the college Canteen maintained two rooms for upper castes from Kerala, where the lower castes including Thiyyas were not allowed. He, along with others, drew the attention of the principal to this problem, following which, a separate room was kept aside for the Thiyyas and others. <sup>5</sup> It is not as if the lower castes were always at the receiving end. C.H. Kunhappa, editor of Mathrubhumi, and a Nair himself, talks of how numerically dominant Thiyya boys in Tellicherry during his school days used to make fun of Nair students calling them, among other things, 'sNairkuttu Naikuttys literal translation of which would be 'sNair children are puppies. <sup>6</sup> Despite interaction between the castes in a newly emergent public sphere, interdining took a long time to come about. Mozhikunnath Brahmadattan Namboodiripad, a rare Hindu hero of the Malabar Rebellion writes in his Memoirs of his excommunication by the community for having indulged in interdining during political work. <sup>7</sup> Casteism remained institutionalised amongst the Indian officials in the colonial bureaucracy. On 31st September, 1906 Vivekodayam condemned the Town magistrate of Calicut, Gopala Krishna Ayer who, in the open court, observed that a Thiyya who had not got out of the way of a Nair on the road was 'slucky [that he was ] not killed and that 'such people deserve to have bones of their body broken's <sup>8</sup>

### **Overcoming the distinctions of Caste**

Impact of colonialism with its concept of equality before law, and indigenous reform movements led to the decline of caste in Malabar by the turn of the twentieth century. <sup>9</sup> Missionary activities and the coming into existence of factories, where there was the free mixing of castes, weakened the hold of Brahminism on society. It is not argued that caste overnight; far from it, the division

persisted. With regard to marriages and inter-dining at home, among other things, the institution took a long time in breaking down, and, in many ways, persists to this day. But what is evident from contemporary sources is that as an institution in preventing social interaction there was a clear undermining of its role. Adrian Mayer, in his account of Malabar in the mid-twentieth century, talks of an occasion when a Nayadi walked up and talked without embarrassment while he was with a Brahmin, only for the latter to comment later that such a thing could not have happened a few years ago.<sup>10</sup> Caste was modified during this period in accordance with the contemporary requirements in society. In an urban milieu, the middle classes in Malabar devised ways to overcome the distinctions the institution prescribed and thereby facilitated interaction between the different castes in the public arena.

Gaining access to higher education, and consequent employment in the government service had been one of the means through which the lower castes, especially the Thiyyas, had acquired social mobility. Malabar Christian College at Calicut and Brennen College in Tellicherry, both with missionary background, had been in the forefront in providing higher education to the lower-castes. The Zamorinss college in Calicut, later renamed Guruvayoorappan College, for a long time, remained a preserve of the upper castes. Alongside lower-caste attacks on this institution for its caste centric policies, there were misgivings expressed even by some high castes regarding the continued discrimination the Thiyya community had to face in matters of admission despite their economic progress. In a letter to Mitavadi, the Thiyya newspaper, one Brahmin was to write: 'Of all the difficulties in the way of Hindu progress, none deserve our attention more than the refusal to admit Thiyyans, a highly respected class into the Zamorinss college!' Those who take pride in the refusal of admissions are violating the most sacred of relations among the Hindus themselves's<sup>11</sup>

In the early twentieth century, associations like the Samudaya Bahishkarana Sangham set up by K.P.Gopalan, a Thiyya Congressman, tried to weaken caste feelings by boycotting those who held caste prejudices and to encourage inter-dining among members of different castes. There were some upper caste social activists as well who were involved in such movements. A Gauda Saraswat Brahmin, Lakshmana Surendranatha Prabhu, a public prosecutor in north Malabar, as well as a freedom fighter, who had once led a hunger strike at the Tellicherry Saraswat temple demanding equality in worship, organized inter-dining at home.<sup>12</sup> The philanthropist, Nayanar, had a Muslim cook at home.<sup>13</sup> Taboos concerning eating habits were being dismantled. Recently introduced beverages like tea and coffee on which traditional taboos did not exist were widely used during meetings and get-togethers. One reform-minded Nambuthiri, writing in defense of these changes, wondered 'show one would find in the Sruti Smritis instructions whether Brahmins can have such things as coffee, tea, and soda lemonade which did not exist in those days, and whether to interact with today's new and numerous castes.'<sup>14</sup> Once in Kozhikode, when the Brahmin government vakil M's. Ramakrishnayyar got the 'sRao Bahadurs title, he organized a dinner for officials and prominent citizens at Edwards Victoria hotel, catered by a Thiyya, Panangadan Sanku. The journalist, Murkoth Kumaran could not help taking a dig at the turn of events. In Kerala Sanchari, Kumaran wrote that the newly decorated Rao Bahadur had, by hosting a party for the beef-eating Englishmen, whose leather-chappals desecrated the cowdung floors, with one shot, given a blow

to the fortress of time-honoured customs and traditions which even the British guns had found difficult to conquer! <sup>15</sup>

In the earlier times, the upper castes had zealously tried to maintain the division of labour based on caste and to prevent any possibility of admixture of blood between the different castes. In Kerala, due to the extreme level of untouchability and unseeability practiced, it was imperative to distinguish the caste of the body at the very sight itself. And, as a consequence, for the different castes, there were identity markers which included the wearing of dress, ornaments, and even hairstyle. According to B. Rajeevan, 'æthe style of clothing, the shape and position of the tuft of hair and the differing styles and materials of the ornaments functioned as the caste marks of the bodies. The clothing of Malayalees up to the beginning of the 20th century was not primarily related to the sense of nakedness of the body. Clothing functioned as a sign system to designate the caste of the body. <sup>16</sup> Even the style of conversation indicated the superior/inferior status of the different castes. A Nair while conversing with a Nambudiri described his house as 'srubbish heaps, food as 'sold kanjis while the food of a Nambudiri was termed as nectar. <sup>17</sup>

In the twentieth century, there were efforts to give up caste“markers. If in the south, attempts along those lines, following calls by Ayyankali - who exhorted the harijans to give up their stone necklaces which distinguished them as depressed - had been marked by violence on the part of the upper castes, in Malabar where the caste rigidities were relatively milder, under direct colonial rule, they were smoother. In some cases, the upper castes consciously parted with their caste markers, notably, kuduma. If Madhavan, the hero of Indulekha, written in 1889, still clings on to his kuduma, by the 1920s, many had got rid of them. K.P. Kesava Menon, the Congress leader, recalls in his Memoirs how while studying in Madras, he removed his kuduma, as a consequence of which, when he came back home, his father scolded him. <sup>18</sup> Staying away from home, it seems, provided the protagonists with the necessary freedom to break free of the caste shackles. E.M's. Nambudiripad, cites the occasion when he and friends collectively got rid of theirs“ a virtual kudumamuri prasthanam- while leading a hostel life in Trichur during their college days. <sup>19</sup> This was followed by a Poonool pottikkalprasthanam, whereby the sacred thread was broken and burnt by E.M's. Nambudiripad and eleven of his friends. <sup>20</sup>

In effect, Kerala society, under the dual impact of colonial modernity and indigenous reform movements had turned its back on external factors or exteriority in determining oneness status in society. Instead, interiority was emphasised. What was novel in early 20th century Kerala was re-interpretation of human beings as a biological species which could be proved by rational scientific empiricism. Sree Narayana Guru, for instance, combined ideas of egalitarianism with science, as when, during his encounter with Gandhi who had reservations in the total elimination of the institution of caste, famously told the latter that the semen from any human male can impregnate any human female. 'sThese argumentss, according to Osella 'sare essentially modern in their appeal to an essential inner essence, to an empiricism which eschews appearance for positivist examination of reality, and to the triumphal authority of experimental proof's<sup>21</sup> Love between couples belonging to different castes, at least theoretically, was encouraged. As the principal of

Zamorins College, in defense of love marriage, put it, 'the heart should decide. Caste, religion, Smartha Vicharam and astrology cannot restrict love between man and woman<sup>22</sup> In practice, the odd intermarriages like the one between the author of Sukumari, Joseph Muliyl, a Thiyya convert to Christianity and a converted Antarjanam did take place. Similarly, C.H. Kunhappa talks of a love marriage involving different castes at Brennen College during his intermediate days.<sup>23</sup> By the thirties and forties, in certain educational institutions, especially ones in the north like Government Brennen College, caste was not very much a feature of campus life. A young girl, Gladys Ambat, in her 'Responses to the Toast of the Colleges in 1939, observed how 'Caste system and class distinction are practically unknown within our college walls. Students mix freely with one another's<sup>24</sup>

The erosion of caste hierarchy and inequities, at the symbolic level, was made possible partly through what M.N. Srinivas has called 'Sanskritisations. In Kerala, the best example of such an attempt would be Sri Narayana Guruss plan of action implemented by the SNDP yogam which included elimination of superstitions, blood sacrifices, and worship of evil Gods which were to be replaced by worship in temples, introduction of schools and libraries, industry, commerce and modern means of agriculture, frugality, and cleanliness.<sup>25</sup> Mayer observed that 'seven as many high caste folk now take meat, though often in private or at hotels, some Tiyas and Pulyas have turned vegetarian, by preference or in imitation of the higher caste habits's<sup>26</sup> Sanskritisation was reflected in marriage rites as well with the Tiyas now including 'the sacred fire as witness of the marriage vows, a Brahmin rite not previously followed by them' and the Pulayas resorting to 'exchange of rings, tying of the tali thread and the mutual garlanding of the couple as additions to their old rite of exchange of clothes's<sup>27</sup>

In an urban milieu, thus, caste identities in public life was eroded. The Thiyya spiritual leader Vagbhadanandan attracted upper caste disciples.<sup>28</sup> Friendships cutting across caste lines became common, similar professions and common public interests bringing them together. The period threw up several close friendships between the Nairs and the Thiyyas despite the latter occupying a distinctively lower status than the former in the traditional caste hierarchy. Murkoth Kumaran, a prominent Thiyya literary figure, while staying at Tellicherry, was a friend and neighbour of K.T. Chandu Nambiar, a well known criminal lawyer as well as a leading literary critic. Regarding literature, they had their differences which they made public through their respective columns in the leading magazines of the period. Later, Murkoth and Nambiar started separate newspapers - Katora Kutaram and Ramabanam respectively - where they continued their literary dispute, which, however, did not, in any way, affect their friendship. Infact, Chandu Nambiar was Murkoths Shashtipoorthi celebration committee's chairman, reading out his Mangalathram on the occasion.<sup>29</sup> As G. Arunima points out 'sharing the same literary space created a community of intellectuals with at least one shared concern "of engaging with the experience of modernity that was shaping and often, confusing them.<sup>30</sup>

There were other instances as well. Murkoth Kumaran, a good friend of Chandu Menon, the famous early Nair novelist of Kerala, who was later to write a biography of the latter highlighting

the subject's close friendship with E.H. Krishnan, another prominent Thiyya of Tellicherry. "It was only natural that both of them being accomplished, honest and innocent, they would get attracted to each other. While Krishnan was a natural scientist with a keen interest in plant and animal life, Chandu Menon was an expert on human affairs, caricaturing their faults and exalting their qualities. Both were interested in hunting's<sup>31</sup> Similarly, the Thiyya, C. Krishnan, a former lawyer before turning to business and publishing, had a number of upper caste friends like Sir C. Sankaran Nair, Sir M. Krishnan Nair and Dr. T.M. Nair. His secretary, for some time, was Anantaramayyar, a Brahmin. There were upper castes men like Thelappurathu Narayanan Thampi and Koyippilly Parameswara Kurup who acted as sub editors in Mitavadi, a predominantly Thiyya magazine C.Krishnan brought out. In fact, his closest friend was Manjeri Sundarayyar, one of the prominent Brahmin vakils of Malabar who used to frequent the former's house in the evenings. In 1917, when the acting collector, Thoran, under pressure from the Samoodiri, had banned the Thiyyas from using the approach road to the Tali temple, the two friends had traveled together in Krishnan's horse cart, and along with Madhavan Nair and others, had flouted, and thrown the offending signboard into the nearby pond.<sup>32</sup>

### **he Lingering Legacy**

Following secularization and westernization, caste and religion did not disappear from the soil of Kerala overnight. Instead, they took new forms like the caste associations. According to M.N. Srinivas, the birth and proliferation of caste associations in modern India was a consequence of the modern adaptation of traditional caste forms, with western instruments of modernization like colleges, books, pamphlets and journals being utilized to create communal or caste consciousness.<sup>33</sup> The first significant articulation of the demands of the people of Kerala was not on the basis of any segment but holistic. In Travancore, for instance, initially, the natives had organized themselves as Malayalis to protest the dominance enjoyed by the migrant Tamil Brahmins in government services through the Malayali Memorial of 1891. But, later, it gave way to a segmentary approach, each part agitating for its particularistic demands - the Ezhavas who set up the SNDP Yogam in 1903, and the Nairs who gave shape to the NSS in 1914 forming separate caste associations to put forth their demands separately. In 1896, the Ezhavas had already submitted the Ezhava Memorial. This, then, was the rather tortuous road taken by a hierarchised society to attain a semblance of democracy and egalitarianism "communal road to a secular Kerala, in the words of George Mathew.<sup>34</sup>

But, the caste associations aiming to protect caste interests were more of a southern phenomenon, mostly active in Travancore - Cochin, the princely states where appointments to government services were more arbitrary than British Malabar, though the branches of the SNDP Yogam and the NSS could be found in the northern parts of the state as well.<sup>35</sup> Significantly, there was no equivalent of the Ezhava Memorial in Malabar "no Thiyya Memorial, for instance. Having said that, however, caste feelings persisted well into the twentieth century in Malabar as well. Despite public expression of friendships across caste faultiness, and the all too infrequent inter-caste marriages, a genuine breaking down of the caste barrier, especially at the personal level, still

remained a distant dream. Dilip Menon, in his provocative essay on E.M's. Namboodiripad, argues that even communism did not help the latter overcome his upper caste bias while reconstructing Keralass past. <sup>36</sup> Murkoth Kumaran is said to have confided in private his anguish that his good friend O. Chandu Menon, in his first and most famous novel, Indulekha, did not include as a character a single Thiyya, a community numerically dominant, and by then educated and decently employed. <sup>37</sup> That all was not well is indicated by a few events in the lives of some of the characters we saw above. The biographer of Muliyl Krishnan, one of those Thiyyas who 'smades it, having become, among other things, a teacher at Presidency college in Madras, recounts how Nair friends of Krishnan used to say good things about him on his face, while pouring scorn on him behind his back, and how they would take food from his home, but would be wary of others coming to know of it! <sup>38</sup> One incident shows how material success did not always ensure respect for the lower castes. Once, during Onam celebrations organized by the Malayali Club in Madras, while prominent Malayalis in the city were being felicitated on stage, all except Krishnan were garlanded. <sup>39</sup> When Churyayi Kanaran, a Thiyya, who went on to become a Deputy Collector at Ponnani, was appointed as Head Munshi, his Nair superiors (Sirasdars) harassed him, giving him only a mattress to work on, instead of a chair, prompting H.V. Conolly, the Collector, who had appointed him, to intervene on his behalf. <sup>40</sup> Though caste differences were not publicly acknowledged, at a subtle level, caste feelings got played out in the organizational structures, meetings and functions of the clubs the Malayalis gave shape to in Madras. According to someone who has worked on the Malayali population in Madras during the colonial period, the Thiyyas resented the dominance exerted by the South Malabar Nayars in the Kerala Club - where even refreshments would be first served to the latter " and gradually drifted to the more 'ssubalterns Kerala Samaj. <sup>41</sup>

The ultimate destinies of the two characters we began the story with " C. Krishnan and Keeleri Kunhikannan - would help put things in perspective. Caste inequities had been a concern for C.Krishnan from his college days in Madras, where, as we had seen earlier, he, along with others had fought against caste discrimination in the hostel mess. Later, he had been involved, while in Calicut, in violating, along with his upper caste friends, the restrictions on lower castes to use the Tali temple approach road. Ironically, he ended up converting to Buddhism, which would suggest that he never felt quite comfortable with his Hindu identity, where, in spite of his material success and public fame, he continued to occupy a lower position in the caste hierarchy. Similarly, we find the egalitarian, democratic illusions regarding caste Keeleri Kunhikannan had upheld in his youth falling by the wayside towards the end of his life. Keeleri, who had married a Vannan woman, trained lower caste disciples, and joined the Brahmo Samaj, found, to his utter dismay, that no Hindu was willing to marry his daughter as his wife belonged to a caste lower than his! Ultimately, Keeleri had to take refuge in Christianity. <sup>42</sup>

I am grateful to Prof. K.N. Panikkar and Urmita Ray for their comments on an earlier draft of this essay.

## Notes & References

1. Andre Beteille, 'The Social Character of the Indian Middle Class' in Imtiaz Ahmad, et.al., ed., *Middle Class Values in India and Western Europe*, Social Science Press, New Delhi, 2002, p.83
2. It was the lower strata of the upper castes (Nairs) and the upper strata of the lower castes (Thiyyas) who, by acquiring English education, and, consequently, obtaining government jobs, constituted the majority among the Hindu middle class. On the other hand, the Nambuthiris, the erstwhile privileged group in society took time to adapt to the new circumstances. Of course, a radical intelligentsia did emerge from among the younger generation in the group in the context of the reform movement led by the Yogashema Sabha. But, for a significant section amongst the community as well as a few elite Nair feudal chieftains, loss of political power did not put an end to their illusions of grandeur. Turning their back on English education, they tried to maintain the indulgent life of the past, still possible through the possession of extensive lands.
3. Joan P. Mencher, 'The Nayars of South Malabar', in M. F. Nimcoff ed., *Comparative Family Systems* Houghton Mifflin, Boston, 1965, pp. 166-7

Thikkodiyan, Arangu Kanatha Nadan, DC Books, Kottayam, 2008, p. 24. Through a reading of the autobiographies of people like R.K. Narayan, MSS Pandian observes that upper castes who came under the influence of colonial modernity shows a marked reluctance to talk about caste as if 'to talk about caste as caste would incarcerate one into a pre-modern realm', and,

4. instead, throughout the narrative the institution masquerades as something else. M's's. Pandian, 'One Step Outside Modernity: Caste in the Middle Class Imaginary' in Sanjay Joshi, ed., *The Middle Class in Colonial India*, OUP, New Delhi, 2010, p. 241. However, in Malabar, R.K. Narayan's Malayali counterparts, especially those who came under the influence of Left-radical movements are more forthright in describing their experiences in relation to caste.
5. Changarakumarath Sankaran, C. Krishnan, Sidhartha Book House, Trichur, 1967, p.5
6. C.H. Kunhappa, Smaranakal Matram, Mathrubhumi Press, Kozhikode, 1981, p.76,
7. Muzhikunnathu Brahmadathan Namboodirippad, Khilafath Smaranakal, Mathrubhumi Books, (place of publication) 2010 (first published in 1965), pp. 143-51
8. Vivekodayam, 31st September, 1906 in NNPR for the week ending 31 September, 1906, pp. 346-7



9. There is a vast literature on Caste system in India In the nineteen sixties, Louis Dumont, in his highly influential work, highlighted the significance of caste in Indian society, which for him, was a feature from the earliest times. Louis Dumont, *Homo Hierarchicus: The Caste System and its Implications*, University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1980. However, critique of Dumont appeared in the 70s and 80s where it was pointed out that a rigid caste system as well as the stereo-typical Indian village were very much colonial constructs. Cohn, for instance, wrote, that 'in some sense it might be argued that the British created the Indian village' and that 'they rigidified some groups and institutions, which formerly had been contingent and flexible' such as castes. Bernard Cohn, 'Is there a new Indian History? Society and Social Change Under the Raj' in *An Anthropologist among the Historians and Other Essays*, Oxford University Press, New Delhi, 1970, pp. 195-196. Nicholas Dirks has argued how, during the colonial encounter, following censuses, Gazetteers, etc., Caste became the sole basis of one's identity subsuming others. Nicholas Dirks, *The Hollow Crown: Ethnohistory of an Indian Kingdom*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1987. In the context of Kerala, Muralidharan has argued that the modern forms of community came into existence in Kerala during the colonial period as a result of British administrative policies, Christian missionary activities and socio-religious reform movements. M. Muralidharan, 'Hindu Community Formation in Kerala: Processes and Structures under Colonial Modernity', *South Indian Studies*, 2 (Roman numerical), July-December, 1996. In more recent times, the extreme views have given way to a more balanced approach to the institution of caste. Bayly, for instance, holds the view that both the old idea of timeless India and the newer revisionism which almost claims that colonial administration made India into a caste society are erroneous. According to him, the 'traditional Indian society' was not created out of nothing by the British, but that, under them, the institution, flexible originally, became consolidated and, caste hierarchy got more pervasive; the Brahminical interpretation of society which was theoretical earlier now became fully entrenched. C.A. Bayly, *Indian Society and the making of the British Empire*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1988.
10. Adrian C. Mayer, *Land and Society in Malabar*, OUP, Bombay, 1952, p. 38
11. A.R. Narayana Iyer, Letter to The Editor, *Mithavadi*, Vol.3, No.2, February, 1915, p.43 As the institution of caste got de-legitimised from the early twentieth century, interestingly, there were stray attempts by individual upper castes to blame others for the horrors of caste. In an article brimming with injured innocence, one Namboothiri in *Mithavadi* lamented about the unfair criticism the naïve, weak, and frightened Nambuthiri lot had to take for the practice of untouchability and oppression of the lower castes, when in fact the 'middle castes' [read Nairs] were responsible for the same. Moothiringottu Bhavathrathan Namboodiripad, 'samudaya Maithri', *Mithavadi*, Vol.4 (R.N.) , No.6, June 1916, p.46

12. Mekkunnath Krishnan Nair, 'sri Laksmana Surendranatha Prabhu: Oru Anusmaranam', Mathrubhumi, Vol. 22 (R.N.), No. 5, April 16, 1944, p. 3
13. 'Nayanar', unsigned article, Mathrubhumi, Vol. 23 (R.N.), No. 12, June 3 1945, p. 1
14. M. Rajavarma Thampan, 'Achaara Navikaranam', Unni Nambuthiri, vol.6, no.1, 1926, p.38
15. Quoted in Murkoth Kunhappa, Murkoth Kumaran, Sahitya Pravarthaka Co-operative Society Ltd., Kottayam, 1975, p. 149
16. B. Rajeevan, 'From Caste to Sex: A Study on Sexuality and the Formation of Modern Subject in Kerala' in M.A. Oommen, ed. Rethinking Development: Kerala's Development Experience, Vol. I, Concept Publishing House, New Delhi, 1999, p. 46
17. T.K. Gopala Panikkar, Malabar and its Folk, G.A. Natesan and Company, Madras, 1901, p. 202
18. K.P. Kesava Menon, Kazhinja Kaalam, The Mathrubhumi Printing and Publishing Company Limited, Calicut, 1986 (first published 1957), pp. 26-7
19. E.M's. Nambudiripad, Atmakatha, Chintah publishers, Trivandrum, 1985, pp. 128-9
20. E.M's. Nambudiripad adds that, as free food was provided at the Math, they used to wear the sacred thread again while going there for lunch. Ibid., p. 130
21. Osellas, 'Once Upon a Time in the West: Narrating Modernity in Kerala, South India' in Jaqui Parry and David Arnold, eds. Life Stories in South India, Oxford University Press, New Delhi, pp. 46-7
22. M.Rajavarma Thampan, op.cit., p.36
23. C.H. Kunhappa, op.cit., p.115
24. Gladys Ambat, 'Response', Government Brennen College Magazine, Vol.VIII, No. 1, December 1939, p. 87
25. Cyriac K. Pullapilly, 'The Izhavas of Kerala and their Historic Struggle for Acceptance in Kerala Society', in Bardwell L. Smith, ed., Religion and Social Conflict in South Asia, Brill, Leiden, 1976, p. 37
26. Adrian C. Mayer, op.cit., p. 43
27. Ibid., p. 40
28. E.M's. Namboodiripad, Keralam Malayalikalude Mathrubhoomi, Chintha Publishers, Thiruvanthapuram, 2009 (first published in 1948), p.250
29. Mangalat Raghavan, 'Poyi Poya Thalamurakal' in Thalasserry: Sarada Krishnayyar Memorial Fine Arts Society Smaranika, Chitra DTP Solutions, Tellicherry, 2002, p. 73 In his presidential address on the occasion of the Sashti-poorthi of Murkoth Kumaran, Ulloor waxed (?) eloquently of his friendship with the former. According to him, both of them, vassals at the temple of Saraswati, the Goddess of knowledge, enjoyed a special bonding, 'taramaitri', possible due to compatibility of their respective star signs. Sreeman Murkoth

- Kumarante Sashtipoorthi Aaghosha Vivaram, Imperial Printing works, Tellicherry, 1934, p. 2
30. G. Arunima, .Glimpses from a Writer's World: O. Chandu Menon, His Contemporaries, and Their Times', Studies in History, 20, 2, n's. (2004), p. 213
  31. Murkoth Kumaran, Oyarathu Chandu Menon, Kerala Sahitya Akademi, Thrissur, 1996(first published in 1932), p. 36
  32. Changarakumarath Sankaran, op.cit., p. 20
  33. M.N. Srinivas, Social Change in Modern India, Orient Longman, New Delhi, 1977, pp. 94-100.,
  34. George Mathew, Communal Road to a Secular Kerala, Concept Publishing House, New Delhi, 1989.In later years, these caste associations which at one point of time played a revolutionary role were to become quite reactionary under a conservative elite leadership.
  35. Reform movements, of course, were carried forward within the respective communities by organizations like the Yogakshema Sabha among the Nambudiris.
  36. Dilip M. Menon, .Being a Brahmin the Marxist way: E.M's. Nambudiripad and the Pasts of Kerala', Daud Ali, ed. Invoking the Past: The Uses of History in South Asia, OUP, New Delhi, 1999.
  37. Murkoth Srinivasan, .Apoomamaya Oru Atmakatha', Mathrubhumi, Vol. 22, No. 16, July2, 1944, p. 1
  38. K.M. Nair, Muliyl Krishnan, Norman Printing Bureau, Calicut, 1932, pp. 72-3,/li>
  39. Ibid., p. 73,/li>
  40. .Churyayi Kanaran' Unsigned article, Deepam, Vol. I,No.7, Kumbham 1930, p. 20
  41. Susan Lewandowski, Migration and Ethnicity in Urban India: Kerala Migrants in the City of Madras 1870-1970, Manohar, New Delhi, 1970, p. 153
  42. Sreedharan Champad, Circusinte Lokam, Mathrubhumi Books, Kozhikode, 2008, p.153

Sreejith K.  
*Assistant Professor, Dept. of History, Chandernagore College*

## Love and Sexuality in the African Modern Novel: Two Female Characters in the Lens of African Male Writers

EL Hassen Ould Ahmed

As soon as one invokes love and sexuality some ears will immediately prickle and faces may frown as a result of the reminiscent of the taboo the African society has woven around sex and sexuality. To what extent sexuality is present in the African novel? How does the African writer depict such natural biological woman to man relationship? I do insist here on woman to man and not man to woman. This is because in most of the times people consider that when sex is concerned it is man who is expected to take the initiative rather than woman, however the other way round is very frequent and down to earth. It is also partly because usually people tend to overlook the immoral side of male perverted sexuality, while at the same time they put the whole responsibility and disgrace on the female partner.

And in order to provide a satisfactory answer to these provocative questions it is considered more useful to lead the reader smoothly through the different facets of the issue, rather than to hand over an immediate Yes or No answer. Human beings make love for two main reasons: An immediate one and a far reached one. The immediate one is to satisfy the animal instinct and the far reached one is to procreate children, which ensures the continuity of the existence of the human species.

However, the Javanese feminist argues that, ssexuality is a cultural construct and not altogether biological and immutable<sup>[1]</sup> therefore its implications go farther to reach the way our societies are ruled. This idea is supported but Giddens (1992), who contends that sexuality is sa social construct, operating within the fields of power, not merely a set of biological promptings's<sup>[2]</sup>. The relationship between man and woman as established by the traditional African society is largely disadvantageous to women. It is a man biased patriarchal institution.

Implications of love and sexuality into politics vary from one novel to another in function of the authorss awaited effect on the readership and the perspective from which he opts to tackle the subject of dictatorship and corruption. Thus, Achebe and Ngugi dealt with sexuality and politics in a very realistic way in fictitious African societies. Achebe's socialist society is shared by Ngugi whose opposition to capitalism and oppressive political system is inexorably growing up; and

unequivocally defended throughout all his fiction, plays and criticism. On the other hand, Achebe campaigns for setting up a democratic state, in Nigeria, which guarantees human rights and the transparency of the management of the public funds. Achebe's main targets are dictatorship and corruption and how to rid Nigeria from the federation of these two lethal diseases.

Ngugi devotes much energy to construing the linkage between capitalism, oppression, poverty, and sexual harassment and abuse. Through the course of troubling events in *Devil on the Cross* all the facets of sexual slavery in post-independent Kenya are brought under full light providing for the reader a revealing image of what the rising bourgeoisie is capable of doing. The widening of the gulf between the poor and the rich in Africa in general and in Kenya in particular triggers out, among many other social compromising phenomena, the spread of prostitution and insane sexuality. The petty bourgeoisie after getting its account full to bursting with ill-gained money, indulges itself into bodily pleasure.

The abject poverty of the workers and peasants in *Devil on the Cross* creates an enormous feeling of dependency among the bottom of the pyramid of the society. In their struggle for the survival of the workers, particularly the females are confronted with a hard choice to make; they either accept the advances of the bosses or lose their sole opportunity to gain their miserable daily bread. Conscious of the predicament of their subjects, the capitalists abuse of the situation by imposing the service of the thighs of mature girls as a prerequisite for any recruitments. Thus, when man's mentality is collapsing, inevitably his bestiality will take control of his behaviour and then the worse is to be expected. And this is exactly what happens in *Devil on the Cross*. There is no morality, ethics, spirituality, no dignity, and no humanity. The only thing that matters is wealth and how to accumulate the largest deposit of money and valuable material. The testimony of Nditika Wa Nguuaji leads to the crux of the matter of sexual exploitation enmeshed with corruption. The character made an interesting revelation about the life of the rich and the poor. He suggested that rich man must be enabled to have two mouths, two bellies, two hearts, and mainly two cocks. So that, When an old man like (him) had a sugar girl, instead of falling asleep soon after the first engine has stalled, he would simply start up the other engine and continue with the job in hand, the two engines supporting each other all night long, so that on waking up in the morning he would feel that his heart and body were completely relaxed... We could purchase immortality with our money and leave death as the prerogative of the poor. <sup>131</sup>

This great desire to quench one's sexual thirst is emphatically underscored by Ngugi in his work to show the capacity of African women to do other things than sex, in spite of the persisting prejudice they are suffering. Despite, the secondary role the African society gives to woman; she

can assume a leading role in the same way as man. Hence, the sexual exploitation and domination of women shall not be misunderstood as an acceptance of the way things used to be. On the contrary, the writer wants to confer a heroic status on women.

But let us start with the negative image of women as presented by Ngugi. For example, a girl named Beatrice comes from a village searching for a job in town, and she falls as usual on sexual exploiters who take her as an object of poor quality. These men resort to the service of Beatrice's thighs in the last moment and for the shortest time. The plight of this barmaid is twofold on the one hand; the reader is being given a portrayal of a poor girl wobbling from place to place, like a scared bird, before landing in a bar to serve as a barmaid. But on the other hand the issue is darker and has a deeper significance. That is, girls have no consideration apart from their sexuality; and even when their sexuality is solicited; it is always with contempt and inhumane sullen attitude. Therefore, the writer is trying to draw the attention to the incontestable link between perverted sexuality, which is rapidly growing like mushrooms all around the continent. Beatrice's adventure on the road of success was a perilous journey through a thorny path. Deceived from the beginning by the owner of the white cream Peugeot who left her sleeping in a hotel, and then sacked out from her job, and finally arrested by the police as a thief, Beatrice seems to be doomed to failure. Along this journey Beatrice thought about putting an end to her life just like Wariinga, the heroine of *Devil on the Cross*, did. They are both predominantly symbolic of oppression, mainly male oppression. But he paid for her body as he would pay for a bag of potatoes or a sack of cabbages<sup>[4]</sup>

However, Ngugi endeavours in his texts to bring about a solution at the level of womanhood symbolism. A woman is not a weak lame creature that lives according to male rules; she can also play a central role in the liberation and development of society. It is not woman's physics, which has a pre-birth domination over the rest of her body, but it is society which moulds woman's cast of mind. For example, the representation of woman as a truthful reflection of the status of the nation is succinctly displayed in the testimony of Mwireri during the Devil's feast, when he metaphorically exhorted foreigners to return back home busy themselves with the thighs of their own mothers and leave the Africans the task of raping their mothers: go back home and rape your own mothers, and leave me to toy with my mother's thighs.<sup>[5]</sup>

In spite of the social value Ngugi intends to confer on women, he could not discard the male bias even though that may be unconsciously done. Wariinga is well-equipped to undertake a heroic action and gain heroic stature; she is being lifted from the stature of objectification and commodity to the stature of indomitable strong character that can vie with male in an arena that was exclusively masculine. The importance of woman's role in *Devil on the Cross* stems from the writer's

conscious awareness of the necessity to create a female character to promote an active African female involvement in the struggle against neo-colonialism. In a similar way to the socio-political eminent role of women in *Anthills of the Savannah*, both Achebe and Ngugi carved in the history of the African literary tradition an indelible mark. It can be considered a turning point in African male writing to have women equipped with the required tools and intelligence to undertake key responsibilities. Commenting on *Devil on the Cross* and *Anthills of the Savannah*, Stratton argues that, While Ngugi creates a heroine who is more courageous, resourceful and intelligent than any of the men in his novel, Achebe takes on gender as a category of socio-political analysis and privileges feminine values. Moreover both authors represent women as being in the forefront of history. While Wariinga takes the lead in engaging in class warfare, Beatrice presides over an assembly which signals the possibility of a new social order coming into being.<sup>16]</sup>

Albeit, Achebe attempts to balance his vision and historical conception of the female gender in *Anthills of the Savannah*, in his satirical novel *A Man of the People* the role allotted to women remained insignificant and very classical. Elsie, Edna, Eunice and the step-mother of Odili represent a myriad of instrumentalised human beings who are good and creative only as long as sexuality is concerned. And it is, seemingly, this traditional binary of male/female, which entails oppressor, oppressed, exploiter/exploited and master/slave relationship that triggers this recent reaction of Achebe to mend the image of women in African male writing. African authors feel the need not to be content with the socio-cultural organisation existing in the era they describe, but also to take the lead and mirror what they think the role of females must be in patriarchal society. Women in Africa shall be looked at from new different perspectives; a progressive ideology and conception of African women are occupying the minds more than ever regardless of their origins. Mrs Munir argues that, the roots of women's oppression are buried deep in patriarchy's sex/gender system. The male-female relationship is the paradigm for all power relationships, and unless the clinging to male supremacy as a birthright is finally foregone, all systems of oppression will continue to function (Millet 1970, p. 25). Because male control of the public and private worlds is what constitutes patriarchy, (4) male control must be eliminated if women are to be liberated. To eliminate male control is no easy task. It must, first of all, eliminate the prevalent gender relations constructed under patriarchy., Of course, we cannot neglect the heroic reaction of Eunice to the murder of her boyfriend. She takes out a pistol and shoots two bullets in the chest of chief Koko the murderer of Max. Besides Eunice has not heroic characteristics and is not even prepared to take any leading position. That is why in the last sentence of the novel Odili could not manage to hide his surprise at the retaliation of Eunice and also the high esteem he has for her.

She stood like a stone figure, I was told, for some minutes more. Then she opened her handkerchief, took out a pistol instead and fired two bullets into chief Kokoss chests... A very strange girl, people said.<sup>17]</sup>

The issue of sexuality, as Achebe and Ngugi present it, is deeply rooted into the wider socio-economic situation, which is mainly due to the encounter of the two cultures. Between the two writers Achebe and Ngugi, one can discern the initial leading role Ngugi has chosen for the female gender. The difficult start of the heroine of *Devil on the Cross*, Wariinga as a schoolgirl in Nairobi is a case in point of the long process of shaping her personality. Wariinga's sufferings and hardships spring from her being a voluptuous young girl. The growing familiarity of the heroin with the Rich Old Man to whom the husband of her aunt, who is a squander of the corrupt class, introduced her is going to be the source of her troubles. The young girl was fascinated and misled by the gleam of the wealth of the Old Rich Man. He offered her exuberant luxury, evening riding in his nice Mercedes Benz to what they called love hotels. It is only after her pregnancy that Wariinga realised the real person of her dishonest lover. The Old Rich Man in reality took her as a mere accommodation. She used to serve him as a sex machine to satisfy his sexual cravings. sHe asked her why she had not taken care of herself, like other girls, what had prevented her from taking pills, having a coil fixed inside her, or being injected.' <sup>18]</sup>

Scornfully, the Old Rich Man did not delay pouring his wrath on his simple prey. According to him she was the sole person to bear the whole responsibility of her pregnancy, because it was her fault not to take any contraceptive measures. Leaving her deep to the knee in the mire, the Old Man thrust her out of his way to search for the real culprit somewhere else: "Go away and look for the young man who got you into trouble, and tell him to marry you or to take you to the forest or somewhere else for abortion.'<sup>19]</sup>

And suddenly the young Wariinga finds herself stranded on an island of sorrow and grievance. The dazzling glare she uses to see vanishes in a wink of an eye. She lost all she had, her integrity, her virginity, and her school. Ruefully, she watches her future fading away and leaving her alone as a castaway among the tall buildings of Nairobi hotels. This incident exemplifies the larger phenomenon of teenage pregnancy, which is still ravaging the African society because of the vulnerability of the variables and the temptation of luxury. The increase of poverty favours the practice of prostitution among the youngsters. Particularly in urban societies where well-off men are obnoxiously greedy about sex purchasing. The point which can be deduced from this scene is that Ngugi in his struggle against neo-colonialism wants to scorch all its aspects even the most intricate ones. He succeeds in establishing the link between the destructive effects of capitalism both economically and physically. The bourgeoisie is not only squandering the national resources but also ruining the youth of the nation. For contemplating the uprise of the percentage of girls school dropout because of the burden of pregnancy, one can only conclude that the countrys future is uncertain and gloomy.



Contrariwise, in Devil on the Cross young girls are left at the mercy of sex hunters, who strive to have sex with the maximum number of partners in function of their wealth. Although the Christian religion does not allow polygamy, the rich allow themselves to conquer as many sugar girls as they desire. They always find a way to dodge the law of the church: ONE WIFE ONE LIFE (but countless mistresses if you wish). 'I am a man of the church. I just want you to be mine. I'll find my own ways of coming to visit you. Just like the old times.'<sup>[10]</sup>

Knowing pertinently that the Old Man cannot marry her, Jacinta Wariinga sets him in a difficult situation by asking him whether he intends to marry her or not. He retorts that because of his religion he cannot he can frequent her secretly instead. This clandestine fornication is not alien to married people in A Man of the People. For example, Odili has stolen somebody's wife and in much the same way, or even worse, he would have his snatched from him by chief Nanga. The American lady Jean invited both Nanga and Odili for dinner but she found herself with one guest (Odili) because Nanga was urged to join another acquaintance in the International (a hotel) to share dinner with her. 'Agnes is she who must be obeyed.'<sup>[11]</sup>

Here the scenario of sexual infidelity takes a decisive turning point, which must not be underrated since it provides a new insight into how things are going on in the high sphere of political class. But it seems as if Odili did not really digest the message; the fact that he slept with another man's wife coupled with his certainty that his host (Nanga) must have done the same with Mrs. Akilo in the International hotel, did not prevent him from scandalising Elsie's moral laxity vis-à-vis Nanga. Odili's sexuality from the beginning seems impulsive and casual; therefore, such behaviour can be an ill-auger for what is yet to come to the hero and his lover. Achebe once more proved a high sense of subtlety in presenting things throughout flashbacks. The whole trouble with Odili has its origins into his own past, charity starts at home; the swiftness of his love affair with Elsie should have served him for a good lesson about her morality.

In A Man of the People the first girl introduced to the reader is Elsie, the mistress of Odili. She is a girl who settles in the city and adopts the so-called modern life style. She does not care much about loyalty to her fiancé or lover instead; she would seize the first opportunity to fulfil her physical lust. She is better portrayed ethically by Odili as follows:

Elsie was, and for that matter still is, the only girl I met and slept with the same day -in fact within an hour. I know that faster records do exist and am not entering this one for that purpose, nor am

I trying to prejudice anyone against Elsie. I only put it down because that was the way it happened. <sup>[12]</sup>

Such a picture of a young girl is not glamorous at all; on the contrary it takes the reader back to the question of principles and social ethics of both Odili and Elsie. Why does Odili display a sense of harshness and bitterness toward his newly conquered girlfriend? In fact, Odili is not as ruthless as Sirres nonetheless; he unconsciously imparts to us his lack of confidence in a girl of the calibre of what the Old Rich Man in Devil on the Cross calls sready to yields. Thus, the fact that Elsie succumbs to the charisma and mainly to the luxury of Nanga could be foreseen through her reaction to Nangass glittering Cadillac. She jumped hilariously at the sight of the car saying: 'Ah this na the famous Cadillac? I no think say I done seen am before. She was full of girlish excitement. Na tough car! Eje-je-je! You think say these people go go another heaven after this?' <sup>[13]</sup>

And under the same umbrella one can subsume what Armahss narrator calls sthe gleams which enthrals most of its women seers. Whereas in The Beautiful Ones Are Not Yet Born the seduction of corrupt people by the splendour and glamour of buildings and cars reflects material corruption, in A Man of the People and Devil on the Cross such luxury is used as bait for catching young girls and prey on their fresh thighs. The morality in these novels is collapsing rapidly. In the same way as Elsie, Wariinga succumbs to the gleam of the Old Manss car.

While Achebess approach to insane sexuality in his novel A Man of the People is much more the consequence of the negative part of cultural encounter, Ngugi furnishes a deeper social and economic dimension of the upsurging condescending behaviours of men toward women in Kenya urban society. Furthermore, women are the victims of social stereotypes and prejudices, which assign them to domestic activities. In fact, Ngugi comes halfway with Kate Millet in her revolutionary approach to feminism, which she argued emphatically in her book entitled Sexual Politics.

Throughout this book Millet contends that a literary criticism must go beyond interpreting canonised texts to play a linchpin role into womens liberation from oppression. In the view of Millet they are the victims of oppression and social injustice whatever their particular circumstances, by patriarchy; in such a social stratum one group controls another. That is, women are subordinated to men. There is also the ideological pressure, which forces them into assuming the role of family raising, serving one generation of wage earners and producing and socialising the next. This unequal treatment of more than half of the population stems from the social framing and shaping of girlss and boyss psyche into different moulds. Along the same line, Ngugi attempts

to break the social barriers that unjustly endow women with inferior status, by proceeding first to a demonstration of how girls are being treated by society, and then underscoring what a girl is really capable of doing. A girl can be as dextrous and crafty as a boy if she is given the chance to express her talent. 'For the day on which they (Kareendis of modern Kenya) are born; is the very day on which every part of their body is buried except one -they are left with a single organ' <sup>[14]</sup>

And it is this remaining organ that generates all the woes of girls in modern Kenya. The story of Wangari (another main character of Devil on the Cross) is a case in point. Wangari was a woman who toiled outstandingly during the hard days of Kenyass Mau Mau guerrillas struggle for independence. She boldly slipped through the enemys lines to bring munitions, food and medicine to freedom fighters.

With great deception Wangari found herself bumming up and down Nairobiss large avenues looking for a job in the shops of what she considers her Kenya, without any lure of hope. The hardship and struggle have just started, seemingly, because it was not enough to defeat colonialism, but also to wipe out neo-colonialism seems urgent in the context of Kenya. The henchmen of the new black capitalists contemptuously rejected Wangariss application. What affected Wangari deeply was not that they refused her a job, but to her great surprise a black man, whom she considers a brother and a kinsman, sarcastically blows her hopes to shudders when, she collapsed with laughter! He told (her) that the only job he could offer (her) was that of spreading (her) legs, that women with mature bodies were experts at that job.s <sup>[15]</sup>

Henceforth, Wangari discovers the truthful reality of her country as a state that is still under the influence of foreign powers, although the new control is made possible by the collaboration of black men. It is this bitter sense of deception, which leads Wangari to rebel against the system of the Shamba in Kenya. However, it must be borne in mind that all of Wangaris's, and Odiliss rebellion is, either mainly or partly, sexually triggered by the discriminative treatment she was subjected to because of her sex gender, Wariinga and Odili are mainly motivated by a love deception and sexual betrayal.

Through a simple juxtaposition of the minds of Odili, Wariinga, and Wangari one can find out that all of them are revolting against their political and social functioning. Odili, Wariinga, and Wangari are initially revolting because of perverted sexuality. As a result, another common feature shared by the heroes is the implication of sexuality in their reactionary attitudes, despite the

different motivations of the writers while shaping the personality of their novels main characters. Toward the end of *Devil on the Cross*, for instance, the process of building up the strong personality of Wariinga comes to maturity. Ngugi purposefully aimed at giving a heroic characteristic to African women in general represented in the person of Wariinga. It is just a part of a larger scheme as the writer himself explains plainly in chapter five in flashbacks. He went back to give a reminder of the various snags Wariinga met in the beginning of the novel: Early pregnancy and giving birth to Wambui, learning secretarial staff, having a job at Champion Construction Company, and later on learning mechanics where she really excelled mens performance. All these hard-won qualifications reflected the important role Ngugi decided to allot to a female character. He explains the reason why he does so as follows:

Because the women are the most exploited and oppressed section of the entire working class, I would create a picture of a strong determined woman with a will to resist and struggle against the conditions of her present being. Had I not seen glimpses of this type in real life among the women of Kamirutu community Education and Cultural Centre? Isn't Kenya history replete with this type of women? s.. Wariinga will be the fictional reflection of resistant heroine of Kenya history. Wariinga heroine of toil s.. she walks. <sup>[16]</sup>

The first thing to incur from this quotation is that the heroine is no longer the same; she has changed. Wariinga undergoes an enormous behavioural and mental change. Now she has developed a positive vision of things, mainly about the status of girls and what they are able to achieve. Girls are not born to serve as decorative ornament in the offices of Boss Kihara and the likes. The writer shapes a new personality of Wariinga as a human being first and foremost, not only as a girl. Her qualification as a mechanical engineer specialised in motor vehicle and other internal combustion engines; lifted her to a respectful position among men and turns her into a recommendable archetype to be copied by others. Now, s this Wariinga is not the one we met two years ago (she is) Wariinga of the mind and hands and body and heart.s <sup>[17]</sup>

There is a new status acquired thanks to self-reliance and determination of the heroine. She is naturally beautiful, intelligent and dextrous. Therefore, Wariinga strives to evince that women are victims of social clich's and stereotypes. They are not only excellent in bed, but also competitive in all other fields of life. The traditional vision of girls as sexual objects is outdated and backward. For instance, the incident when Wariinga found a group of specialised men sweating over a car engine for hours long without being able to detect what is wrong with it; and she offered her help; they welcomed her sarcastically. But she brilliantly spots the defect without having recourse to engine dismantle. Henceforth, they start to respect her, though that is only an intelligent test. Now,

she undergoes a physical test, when a womaniser tries to start playing with her the game of the Hunter and the Hunted. While she is busy trying to fix his car, the man has his mind and eyes scrutinising Wariingass bosom and bum. He starts teasing her, talking about her beauty innocently. But she warns him firmly that her body is not part of the job; she is here to work for him and that is all. But he insists touching her breast. She taught him bitter lessons by turning like a lightning and storming him with a series of Judo and Karate kicks till he took to his heels cowardly. Here once again Wariinga confirms her physical supremacy.

Dealing with sexuality and women's status in society, Achebe, and Ngugi portray different images for different purposes. Achebe and Ngugi, heedfully, conjure up different images of African woman as she is perceived by man. In the person of Elsie and the American lady, Jean, Achebe paints a negative image of women as mere accommodation. Furthermore, the implication of the American lady deserves another reading; did the writer intend to indict the Western civilisation as the main responsible for spreading the culture of infidelity and sexual laxity among young Africans?

Indeed, Achebe claims that the encounter of the two civilisations has disastrous effects on the African one. Along the same line, Ngugi presents how the negative image of African women gained momentum through time. An intricate net of stereotypes, clichés and prejudices was woven around the female gender in Africa in general and Kenya in particular. And that is why Ngugi decides to probe the mystery of women's incapability of doing something other than bed and sex. The advantage of Ngugi's approach is that it proposes a solution to the problem. Ngugi tries to establish the link between capitalism, neo-colonialism, oppression on the one hand and sexual exploitation on the other hand. From the beginning toward the end of *Devil on the Cross* the writer contends vigorously that there is a clear link between the political and the economic power of the upper class and its sexual cravings. Because the poverty of the vast majority of the population coupled with women being ushered in the second place, encourages further capitalist oppressors to inflict on women all kinds of sexual harassment and violence.

Notwithstanding, Ngugi does not content himself with defending Kenyan women theoretically, but he proves that they are as competitive as men. Their external appearance can be beautiful, soft, and attractive, whereas their inner side is as tough as iron. Thus, the demonstration of girls' intelligence and physical aptitude is embodied in Wariingass handling of the various difficulties she comes across in her strenuous life. For Ngugi, the beautiful African girls are worth far much more than serving as flowers decorating the secretariats of irresponsible bosses, or rendering the service of sexual tourism in huge hotels in African capital cities.

The picture drawn by the different writers about the socio-political and moral conducts of the oligarchy justifies the permanent fear among dictators. Their position as the sole and indisputable masters of the whole state leads them to a state of permanent anxiety about how to maintain themselves in power. They make use of all conventional means to attain their aim. Intellectuals are set completely aside and the masses are downtrodden in order not to be able to build any force that may threaten the existence of the oligarchy. This is made possible by the denial of freedom of thought to the intellectuals and psychological domination of the proletariat.

Another more efficient policy of the oligarchy is the destruction of the morality of the population. The writers try to have an effect on the evolutionary process of societies. Furthermore, the fact that the plague of corruption affects both political elite and ordinary men is relevant in many respects. Indeed, the writers intention is to tell the reader that political regimes may work to corrupt the masses morally, while keeping their minds sane. For instance, the introduction of sexuality as a manifestation of moral corruption among the capitalist class and as an opium that contributes to duping the narrow minds of the commons in the other novels is a good way of depicting the level of the implication of humans natural instincts into politics when the reign of oligarchs is at stake.

Now, the juncture of various socio-political elements elucidates further what the oligarchs are capable of doing. The individuals are set in a disadvantageous situation concerning the management of their daily political affairs. On the one hand, tyrants usurp all powers and on the other hand, the same tyrants encourage the corruption of the masses. Indeed, the societies depicted in the two novels are presented as being set under two pressures. They are dominated by the rulers and undermined from within.

### Notes & References

1. . L.Z. Munir, SOJOURN: Journal of Social Issues in Southeast Asia, 2002, p.191.
2. . A. Giddens, The Transformation of Intimacy: Sexuality, Love and Eroticism in Modern Societies, Standford, Standford University Press, 1992, p. 23.
3. Ngugi Wa Thiong'O, Devil on the Cross, Heinemann, London, 1980, p. 180.
4. Ngugi Wa Thinog'O, African Short Stories: Twenty Short Stories From Across the Continent, 1987, p. 79.
5. Ngugi, Devil on the Cross, op.cit., p. 168.
6. F. Stratton, Contemporary African Criticism and the Politics of Gender, Routledge, 1994, p. 170.

7. Chinua Achebe, *A Man of the People*, Heinemann, London, p. 143.
8. Ngugi, *Devil on the Cross*, op.cit., p. 146.
9. Ibid., p. 146.
10. Ibid., p. 253.
11. Achebe, *A Man of the People*, op.cit., p. 48.
12. Ibid., p. 24.
13. Ibid., p. 58.
14. Ngugi, *Devil on the Cross*, op.cit., p. 26.
15. Ibid., p. 42.
16. Ngugi Wa Thinog'O , *Detained a Writerss Prison Diary*, Heinemann, London, 1981, p. 10-1.
17. Ibid., *Devil on the Cross*, op. cit., pp. 216, 218.

EL Hassen Ould Ahmed  
*Assistant Professor, Dept. of History, Chandernagore College*

## Revisiting the Role of the Paraiyans in the Madras Presidency Army, c.1801-1894

Manas Dutta

### *Abstract*

*Lower caste group or rather the marginalised groups was one of the important pillars of the Indian army under the colonial rule. It played a significant role to maintain the colonial hegemony during the British rule in the sub-continent. Very little work has been done on the marginalized or untouchable or labourer castes role in the Army. These gropes played a very important role in the Army basically in lower rank as sepoy, guards, watchman and so on which was overlooked by the military historians like Kaushik Roy, Dewitt C. Ellinwood and Cynthia H. Enloe, Douglas M. Peers, David Omissi, Zakaria Haji Ahmed, Lanny Bruce Fields, William R. Heaton, Carol Hills, Henry Russel, Henry Dodwell, W. J. Wilson. The English company has given new opportunity to the lower caste which gave the occupational social mobility and new socio-economic and cultural strength. Recently, Raj Sekhar Basu's monograph has explored the role of the Paraiyans in the Madras Presidency army under the colonial rule. It also, described the rise and decline of the Paraiyans in the army higherarchy and subsequent changing attitudes of the British military officials as well as the colonial government about them. This article tries to explicate in greater details of the Paraiyan caste's involvement in the colonial Madras army and how did they provide the valuable service in the army from 1801 to 1894 in the subcontinent.*

Rarely do we recognise the importance of armies and warfare in shaping the course of modern Indian history. The Army in India, which included the Sepoy Army commanded by the British officers as well as the British units stationed in the subcontinent, had a dominant presence in the colonial era. Till the 1890s, the Sepoy Army included the Bombay Army, Bengal Army, Madras Army and the Punjab Frontier Force. The Sepoy Army or British-Indian Army offered the largest government employment to the colonized Indians. Annually, the Sepoy Army, or Colonial Army enlisted about 15,000 Indians in peacetime. Indeed, the colonial army was the biggest item of expenditure for the colonial regime. About 30 percent of the British-Indian Empire's revenue went to feed the military establishment in the subcontinent. Military service moulded the structure and ethos of colonial Indian society.<sup>1</sup>

Compared to ancient and medieval Indian history, the database for colonial India's military history appears more solid. This is due to the book keeping activities of the colonial bureaucracy, as well as a host of unofficial monographs and articles written by the colonial military officers recording their glorious activities in an exotic environment. The memoirs and journals of the British officers



as well as soldiers simply signified their activities in the sub-continent and these kinds of writings become popular both in India and Britain.<sup>2</sup>

However, army played an important role in the lives. It gives immense source of social occupational mobility. Army as an occupation acquired an immense honourable place in the society. Military establishments have important social implications, particularly in developing societies. In attempting to determine the relationship between the army and society, several points must be considered. Social attitudes to military service were important. It regarded as an honourable profession.

The relationship between citizenship and military service is significant. This may range from democratic egalitarianism in which full citizenship included at least the possibility of military service, to pure expediency and efficiency, in which only the best qualified and most willing are called upon. The function of the military as an agency of social occupational mobility may be considered in two ways, does or should the structure of the military establishments replicate the social stratification pattern of society, and does it or should it attempt to alter these patterns?

### **The Occupational Caste groups**

Writings on caste very often fail to ignore the popular conceptions associated with this phenomenon. Caste as a concept speculates interest among the sociologists and historians around the world. Caste played a very significant role in Indian society and certainly it also gave an impact on Indian army. In India, the caste system derives its ideological sustenance from sacred Hindu texts, which emphasised on a principle of binary opposition, in terms of purity and pollution. There is an overarching impression that all castes, whether be high or low conformed to the single, as well as somewhat fixed textual hierarchy. But, there is considerable difference between what the textual view propounds and what actually takes place at the ground level. In fact, different castes groups adopt different strategies to interrogate the hierarchies and to establish their own notions of hierarchy and social standing. This explains the persistent attempts on part of 'lower castes', to repudiate the bonds of subordination that had been imposed on them, on the basis of the Hindu theory of *karma* and birth. This is equally true in Indian army since the colonial period. Three Presidency armies followed different strategies to incorporate this concept. Among these, Madras army exceptionally maintained this policy to make army more viable and ladder for social mobilization for those particular caste groups who are in need.

After the Streynsham Master, the Yale's administration was one of military activity. Among the governor's earliest acts were placing of the native contingent on an improved footing. Records points out that there being 280 peons in pay for the watch and guard of the suburbs who in this disorder they were scattered about be of little credit or force to the place. He also passed order to call the Portuguese army and trained the peons and moor inhabitants according to their ability. He also made rule and passed order for the military government. The period of Harrison's rule was marked by considerable military activity. He appointed many peons for watching the black

town. Records mentioned that apart from the official deployment, the occupational castes were employed for securities for the town. The military establishment consisted in 1732 of a gunner, his first and second mates, 68 Europeans, 2 tindals and 27 lascars. General Return of the troops in the Honourable East India Company's garrison of Fort St. George showed that the remarkable presence of the occupational caste groups and their power were utilised to capture and extend the British dominion in Indian subcontinent and overseas as well. H. D. Love has referred about the various occupational caste groups, who were employed in the Madras army in 1759.

Historians are divided on the issue of social implication of army on society. Some say that it has given a negative impact on the society because of their racial discrimination. Some say that it was boon for the lower caste. The historian like Stephen P. Cohen is of the view that army was much beneficial for the Indian untouchables. Meaning thereby caste and race, assumed colonial ethnographers, were the principal ingredients of Indian history, and had divided Indian society hopelessly. The new scholarly term for 'race' seems to be 'ethnicity' which was introduced into academic discourse by American political sociologists. For Stephen P. Rosen, Indian society is characterised by caste divisiveness. Hence, the colonial army remained an agglomeration of various castes. In somewhat similar tune, DeWitt C. Ellinwood and Cynthia H. Enloe, following the historical sociological approach, argue that Indian society is ethnically fragmented. Ethnic identity is the product of primordial attachments resulting from religion, culture, language, and political influence. So, the sepoy army, assert Ellinwood and Enloe, Reflected ethnic imbalances. For Rosen, divisions in the host society were automatically reflected in the army. Unlike Rosen, Enloe gives space to the programmes of the power elites. For Enloe, the degree and nature of ethnic imbalances in the armies were to an extent shaped by the politicians in power. David Omissi notes that the ethnic make-up of the colonial army was not only shaped by the policies of the politicians and the generals, but also by the attitudes of the ethnic communities of the subcontinent. Only those ethnic groups who calculated that they would gain from military services joined the army.

So the ethnic composition of the colonial forces was the result of a fusion of the policies of colonial strategies and the dispositions of the various ethnic groups. In a plural social set-up (in an ethnically heterogeneous society), ethnicity has enormous social and political importance. In a way, ethnic policies are the products of political manipulations as well as 'natural' divisions within a society. The presence of ethnic communities with distinct characteristics, and jostling for power within the military bureaucracy, reminds one of Namierite factions. This is because the advocates of ethnicity accept that ethnic identities are closely related to interest-group orientations. For the political sociologists, ethnic policies pave the way for political socialization and subsequent mobilization. The persistence of ethnic groups which are leftovers from the pre-colonial state system even in modern armies somehow challenges the modernization theory .

A group of scholars within the War and Society framework view that the army as a modernizing agency which transformed the peasant recruits into progressive individuals. This group could be categorized as the modernization school. The modernization theory became popular with

American political scientists during the 1960s. Ellinwood and S.D. Pradhan widen the analytical frame of the Modernization theory, and claim that modernization for global warfare not only modified the social relationship and mentality of the soldiers, but also transformed colonial society as a whole. The modernization theorists occasionally view the army as modernizing the state apparatus and culture of the marginal groups such as women, lower castes, and untouchables. In Cohen's view, during the emergencies the colonial army functioned as an instrument of modernization for the low castes .

### **Oppressive caste discrimination and the practice of untouchability**

In India, the untouchable communities constitute a major segment of the Hindu society. For a long period, they had been considered as 'untouchables' and had been physically segregated from the mainstream of all social transactions-the only exception being the use of their labour for production. Such a system of dominance had been sanctioned by the Hindu *Dharma Sashtras* and had been pursued with the same degree of rigour in all the regions of the country. Oppressive caste discrimination and the practice of untouchability had characterised Indian society over the ages. The all-India scenario remains to be the same while in case of the issue of untouchability since the colonial period. So, it was initiated to get more and more employment in the colonial army among the marginal communities or the untouchables in the eighteenth century onwards. In north India, they are termed as Dalit. The southern part of the subcontinent, especially in Madras, they are termed as Paraiyans. In the past several decades, scholars dealing with 'untouchable' communities have focussed on a wide range of issues. In the first place, there had been an inclination to understand the reasons behind the origin and development of agrestic servitude in different parts of India. Scholars involved with such studies had been more interested in unearthing the specificities of the historical context in which the system of bondage emerged and developed some of its distinctive features. Secondly, in some other studies, scholars placed a greater deal of emphasis in understanding the factors responsible for the formation of distinct lower caste consciousness, role of caste associations and the political strategies pursued by the 'lower caste' politicians in the wake of the institutional concessions offered by the colonial government, as well as, by the governments of the native states. During the colonial period onwards, the usage of the terms such as national community and national culture reflects the story of upper caste domination over different subaltern social groups within the nation. There have been some studies, which have tried to understand the contemporary social behaviour of the 'untouchable' communities. Scholars engaged in such studies have tried to explore the attitudes of the 'untouchable' communities towards the prevailing caste system.

The narrative on agrarian bondage should essentially begin with the opinions expressed by Dharma Kumar in this regard. In her research, Mrs. Kumar had argued that the bonded labourers belonged to the lowest rung of the Hindu castes and were in many places just 'untouchables' having no recognised position in the caste system. She argued that caste not only confirmed the social and economic disadvantages of the agricultural labourer, but also gave him some rights, some of which were economic, while others were of a social and ritual nature .

### **Social composition of the Madras army**

Despite an initial bias for recruiting men of high caste origin, the Madras army was composed mainly of Muslims, middle-caste Hindus, some low castes, and only a few high castes. For instance, the 1<sup>st</sup> Infantry regiment, which could be taken as a microcosm of the Madras infantry in 1824, was composed of 45 per cent Muslims, 25.6 per cent Telingas and 14.5 per cent Tamils, 5 per cent low castes, and 9.2 per cent high castes. While most of the high castes came from Hindustan, (Purab, that is, west Bihar, Eastern and Southern Awadh/Oudh, especially the Bhojpur region) the other communities came from Karnataka, Mysore, and Andhra Pradesh. Douglas M. Peers ascribes this preference for middle and low-caste soldiers to the fact that military service was not the preserve of high caste communities in south India. Then too, the Bengal army monopolized the better sorts of higher-caste recruits from north India, leaving second grade recruits for the Madras army. However, we feel that the induction of low and middle-caste recruits on part of the madras army not entirely due to the non availability of high caste soldiers. There were deeper ideological underpinnings involved. Probably this decision to recruit low caste recruits was intended to isolate the Indian contingent of the madras army from local attachments and sensibilities. General Harris, one of the main proponents of low caste recruitment, noted that the lack of religious prejudices and local attachments, among others, as qualities of the low-caste recruits .

However, many caste and communities were taken as sepoy in the Madras army. Ardythe Basham, a Canadian scholar has taken up the study of untouchables in the western army, pointing out that Madras army consisted of low caste Hindus, untouchables, Christians converts. Besides, there were Pathan, Rajputs, Muslims from Northern states, Brahmins from Oudh, Bihar and Rohilkhand. According to Stephen P. Cohen, Madras army exclusively recruited the Untouchables caste soldiers so that it could follow the orders of the colonial government. In this respect, Madras army employed the paraiyans caste and within the short time they earned the important place in the army. the Paraiyans used to incorporate themselves in the colonial army so that they could explore their physical ability as well as earned the maximum respect in the society. However, the Streynsham Master, the earliest governor of Madras, was a person who made several discipline and rules for the Madras army. He gave order to train the all-rank officers and paid heavy discipline. This gave a new opportunity and new power to the occupational caste groups like the Paraiyans in the Madras army.

### **The Paraiyans and the Madras Army in the nineteenth century**

The advent of British rule in south India provided the Paraiyans and the kindred classes with opportunities of employment in the army. The Paraiyans, as part of a degraded humanity were

scattered throughout the Tamil speaking districts of the Madras Presidency. Their population was concentrated heavily in Chingleput, South Arcot, North Arcot, Tanjore and Trichinopoly districts. Like the other caste groups, they too had many sub-divisions. Interestingly, these districts provided larger soldiers for the colonial army. They were for long treated as 'untouchables' and their social inferiority was utilized by the upper castes to maintain their economic dominance in the agrarian sector. They had also been considered as agrestic slaves in Tamil Nadu. Naturally, there was a search for the upliftment of the socio-economic condition within the Paraiya community. They were looking for alternative employment which will give them economic freedom as well as societal respect. The colonial army at the second half of the eighteenth century started to form an army establishment in the south and this opportunity both way help the Paraiyans and the British. The Paraiyans since the 1760s and 1770s had constituted the bulk of the foot soldiers in the Company's army. In the following decades too, they continued to find employments in the military department. The military depots, functioning in Madras and Trichinopoly, often served as recruitment centres for the Paraiyans. The British army bosses praised the Paraiyans recruits highly for their submissive nature and dutiful conduct. The high ranking British officials expressed the opinion that opportunities to serve in the army had inculcated among the 'untouchables' a certain degree of self respect and independence. The Paraiyans also sometimes expressed their satisfaction for being offered employments in the British army, as it provided them with the privilege to experience the civil equality enjoyed by the other British as well as Native subjects. The extremely docile and loyalist attitude of the Paraiyan soldiers towards their British seniors, more than often accounted for their promotions.

Significantly, by the early decades of the nineteenth century, recruitment in the British army brought about important changes in the self-perceptions of the ordinary Paraiyan soldiers. In fact, they might have realised that sincerity and devotion could guarantee an improvement in their economic status. Thus many of them adopted an overtly loyalist line to gain promotions to the ranks of non-commissioned officers in the regiments. The performance of the military rituals and drills also invoked in them a sense of belonging to a martial race. The award of the King Emperor's uniform instilled in them an idea that caste discriminations could no longer keep them tied to bonds of servitude and exploitation.

The Paraiyans were exclusively recruited for one of the regiments of the Indian army, more popularly known as the '*Queens Own Sappers and Miners*' till about the middle of the nineteenth century. But, after the Great Rebellion of 1857, there was a shift in the British Government's military recruitment policy. At this time, the British military superiors felt that the recruitment policy needed to be based on the 'martial race' theory. It was argued that while recruiting soldiers from the various native communities, the military, social; and environmental perspectives needed to be taken into account. In other words, different aspects of the martial race theory were employed to recruit native soldiers for the Indian army. Jats, Gurkhas, Sikhs and Pathans were recruited in large numbers in the Bengal, Bombay and the Madras armies. These communities were believed to be more trustworthy, tough and hard working than the native soldiers belonging to the other communities. The Company's military officials had frequently praised the Paraiyan soldiers for

their submissive nature and dutiful conduct. Some of them had opined that opportunities to serve in the army had inculcated in these recruits a degree of self-respect and independence. The Calcutta Review of 1859 pointed out that serving the Company's army was very much a satisfying experience for the Paraiyans, as it provided them with the opportunity to experience the civic equality enjoyed by the other subjects of the Company. The Paraiyans also thought that the performance of military rituals and drills instilled among them the idea of belonging to a martial race. There was a belief that the prestige associated with a military uniform would ultimately pave the way for elimination of all forms of caste discrimination, and the 'untouchables' would no longer be kept tied to the bonds of exploitation and servitude.

### **Changing attitudes of the colonial British military officials**

In view of these changes in the recruitment policy, there was an appreciable decline in the number of Paraiyan soldiers. In the 1870s, the British military officials favoured the recruitment of upper caste Hindus, Christians and Mussalmans. However, the Paraiyans did have an impressive presence in some of the branches of the military department. In fact, as late as the 1890s, they enjoyed virtual monopoly as sappers and miners. The upper caste apathy for menial occupations was partly responsible for the impressive presence of the Paraiyans in certain branches of the army.

In the early 1890s, the disbandment of the old Presidency armies as well as the increasing recruitment of North Indian martial races denied the Paraiyans further opportunities of future recruitments in the army. The Paraiyan community leaders were greatly disturbed by these developments. Most of them believed that military employment could act as a channel for their economic and social mobility. The memoranda and petitions sent to the British government by the Paraiyan community leaders like Pandit C. Iyothee Thoss clearly brought out the importance that the community members attached to military service. In a memorandum sent to a government official in 1894, Iyothee Thoss emphasised that government intervention was needed to improve the conditions of the 'untouchables', since they had displayed great valour and sacrifice as soldiers. But, Iyothee Thoss was not the lone person to raise the issue of preferential treatment in lieu of the long standing military service offered by the members of the socially despised communities. The small coterie comprising of Paraiyan ex-servicemen and army pensioners, also raised this issue to establish themselves as the real representatives of the community. Thus, it could be argued that a long standing involvement with the British Indian army served as one of the key elements behind the growth of Paraiyan community consciousness in the Madras Presidency.

## Conclusion

The present article on the Paraiyans of south India has attempted to trace the transformation of this community from a marginalised group to become one of the best employers in the colonial army and ultimately their subsequent declining position in the military department under the colonial rule. Though they depended primarily on agriculture for their survival, a larger section among them also recruited in the army. The Madras army has given much benefit to the occupational caste groups. It becomes a source of social occupational mobility. It gave a new identity and new power. Their caste becomes empowered. They got education and trained from the English which produced some marshal castes like Paraiyan become much empowered. Army were however, quasi-mercenary forces commanded by a foreign group of officers, who had established their sway by force. Consequently, the question of national loyalty did not arise. Loyalty in a quasi-mercenary army could only mean loyalty towards commanding officers who, by exhibiting dynamic leadership, sought to win allegiance. The British initially tried to ensure personal loyalty by encouraging a very personal and heroic style of leadership. With the transition to an impersonal style of leadership, both the armies suffered to an extent, especially in times of crisis caused by contractual violations, flouting of long standing traditions, and so on. Consequently, in mutiny like situations where the privileges, both the armies were extremely vulnerable and mutinies were often marked by a total collapse of the command mechanism. While the Indian officers sided with European officers in maintaining day-to-day discipline, they could not be relied upon in times of acute or mass discontent. Then the European officers were left helpless spectators.

## Acknowledgement

I would like to extend my gratitude to Dr. Raj Sekhar Basu, my Supervisor, without whose constant encouragement this article would not have been possible and Ministry of Defence Fellowship programme whose funding made this research work possible.

## Notes and References

1. The Paraiyans who were scattered over a large part of Tamil Nadu comprised the largest 'untouchable' agricultural labouring community in the early nineteenth century Madras Presidency. It was widely believed that they derived their name from the Tamil word *Parai*, which usually denoted a musical instrument resembling a drum or a tom-tom. In their writings, the English officials frequently referred to them as community of drummers, who performed during the funerals and village festivals. The term Paraiyan, in

terms of a caste, or more correctly an occupational nomenclature is believed to have first appeared in a poem of Mangudi Kilar of the second century AD.

2. Kaushik Roy, ed., *War and Society in Colonial India* , Oxford University Press, New Delhi, 2006, p. 1.
3. Ibid., p. 4.
4. Ardythe Basham, *Untouchable Soldiers: The Mahars and the Mazhbis* , edited by Bhagwan Das, Gautam Book Centre, New Delhi, 2008, p. 19.
5. Ibid., p. 19.
6. Dipankar Gupta , *Interrogating Caste: Understanding Hierarchy and Difference in Indian Society* , New Delhi, 2000, p. 1.
7. Dipankar Gupta, Towards Affirmative Action, in Ira Pandey, ed., *India 60*, India International Centre, Quarterly, Winter 2006 and Spring 2007, New Delhi, 2007, p. 153.
8. Records of Fort St. George, Diary and Consultation Book, 1778, TNA, p. 107.
9. Ibid., pp. 108-9.
10. Records of Fort St. George, Diary and Consultation Book, 1714, TNA, p. 133.
11. Records of Fort St. George, Diary and Consultation Book, 1732, TNA. This describes the various duties of the occupational castes groups. These are as follows- 8 persons were disposed at the inner Fort gunroom, 21 were at the Saluting battery, 12 were at the new Power house, 9 were at the Garden point, 6 were at the Queen point, 2 were at the bridge point, 2 at the spur point, 2 were at the Clark point, 2 were at the Clark gate, 2 were at the Madepollam point and 2 were Fleet point and the total was 68 persons who were in charge of the all round security of the garrison.
12. The return shows that the presence of the occupational caste groups. The numbers are as follows- Troops of Horse were 35, Royal Artillery were 132, the Honourable Company's Artillery were 64, His Majesty's 64 th Regiment were 195, the Detachment of Marines were 100, the Honourable Company's 1 st Battalion were 625, the Honourable Company's 2 nd Battalion were 375, Supernumeraries were 32 in numbers and the total was 1758 where as the officers were in these said Battalions were only 94. For more detail, see Records of Fort St. George, Diary and Consultation Book, 1749-50, p. 32 and see the list of servants in the page no. 202 in the same record, TNA.
13. H. D. Love, *Vestiges of Old Madras 1640-1800* , Vol. 2, Asian Educational Services, New Delhi, 1996, p. 140.
14. Stephen Peter Cohen, *Indian Army: Its Contribution to the Development of a Nation* , Oxford University Press, USA, 2001, p.45.
15. Stephen Peter Rosen, *Societies and Military Power: India and Its Armies* , Oxford University Press, New Delhi, 2006, p. 5.



16. DeWitt C. Ellinwood and Cynthia H. Enloe, 'Preface', in Ellinwood and Enloe, ed., *Ethnicity and the Military in Asia*.
17. Cynthia H. Enloe, 'Ethnicity in the Evolution of Asia's Armed Bureaucracies', in Enloe and Ellinwood, ed., *ibid*, pp. 2-14.
18. David Omissi, 'Martial Races: Ethnicity and Security in Colonial India, 1858-1939', *War and Society*, Vol. 9, No. 1, 1991, pp. 2-27.
19. Zakaria Haji Ahmed, 'The Bayonet and the Truncheon: Army and Police Relations in Malaysia', in Ellinwood and Enloe, eds., *ibid.*, pp. 209-10.
20. Lancy Bruce Fields, 'Ethnicity in Tso Tsung-T'ang's Armies: The Campaigns in North West China, 1867-80', in Ellinwood and Enloe, eds., *Ibid.*, pp. 55-74.
21. William R. Heaton, 'The Chinese People's Liberation Army and Minority Nationalities', in Ellinwood and Enloe, ed., *Ibid.*, p. 177.
22. Constance M. Wilson, 'Burmese-Karen Warfare, 1840-50: A Thai View', in Ellinwood and Enloe, ed., *Ibid.*, 19.
23. For a discussion on these aspects see Jonathan R. Adelman, 'The formative Influence of the Civil Wars: Societal Roles of the Soviet and Chinese Armies', *Armed Forces and Society*, Vol. 5, No. 1, 1978, pp. 93-116.
24. DeWitt C. Ellinwood and S.D.Pradhan, 'Introduction', in Ellinwood and Pradhan, *India and World War I*, New Delhi, 1978, pp. 2-18.
25. Carol Hills and Daniel C. Silverman, 'Nationalism and Feminism in Late Colonial India: The Rani of Jhansi Regiment, 1943-45', *Modern Asian Studies* (henceforth MAS), Vol. 27, No. 4, 1993, pp. 742-60.
26. Stephen P. Cohen, 'The Untouchable Soldier: Caste, Politics, and the Indian Army', *Journal of Asian Studies* (henceforth JAS), Vol. 28, No. 3, 1969, pp. 453-68.
27. Raj Sekhar Basu, *Nandanar's Children: The Paraiyans' Tryst with Destiny, Tamil Nadu 1850-1956*, Sage Publications, New Delhi, 2011, p. xxiv.
28. The term Dalit in popular parlance represents a wide range of meanings, all of which convey a tale of exploitation and discrimination. See, Sagarika Ghosh, *The Dalit in India*, *Social Research*, Vol. 70, No. 1, 2003, p. 86.
29. Raj Sekhar Basu, *Reinterpreting Dalit Movements in India*, *Indian Historical Review*, Vol. 3, No. 1, 2006, pp. 72-3.
30. Dharma Kumar, *Land and Caste in South India: Agricultural Labour in the Madras Presidency During the Nineteenth Century*, (Reprinted with an Introduction), New Delhi, 1992, p. 34.
31. Henry Russell, *Select Committee for Indian Affairs, 1831-32*, Minutes of evidence, Vol. 13, p. 567, Tamilnadu Archives (henceforth TNA).

32. Henry Dodwell, *Sepoy Recruitment in the Old Madras Army*, Superintendent of Government Press, Calcutta, 1922, Appendix, p. i.
33. Douglas M. Peers, 'Habitual Nobility of Being: British officers and the Social construction of the Bengal Army in the Early Nineteenth Century,' *Modern Asian Studies* (henceforth MAS), Vol. 25, Issue 3, 1991, pp. 551-2.
34. Kaushik Roy, 'Recruitment Doctrines of the Colonial Indian Army, 1859-1913', *Indian Economic and Social History Review*, Vol. 34, No. 3, 1997, pp. 345-6. Here he argues that a lobby existed in the pre-1857 madras army, which pursued an open door policy of recruitment. General Harris was one of the prominent proponents of the open door policy won against the selective enlistment school due to certain factors. One of the reasons was that since Awadh and Bengal Army had the first choice of Brahmin and Rajput recruits in these areas. As a result, the Bengal Army acquired the better variety of Purbiya recruits, leaving the second grade high caste personnel for the Madras army. So the Madras army decided to go for the non-high caste men.
35. W. J. Wilson, *History of the Madras Army*, Vol. 3, Govt. Press, Madras, 1883, p. 151.
36. Ardythe Basham, op. cit., p. 9.
37. Stephen Peter Cohen, op. cit., pp. 453-68.
38. Records of Fort St. George, Diary and Consultation Book, 1678, p. 122. See also, Diary and Consultation Book, TNA, 1679.
39. General Order of the Governor, Vol. 3, No. 4, 1852, p. 145, TNA.
40. T. P. Kamalnathan, *K. Veeramani is refuted and the Historical facts about the Scheduled Caste Struggle for Emancipation in India*, Tiruppathur, 1985, p. 35.
41. Calcutta Review, Vol. 33, 1859, p. 143.
42. Raj Sekhar Basu, *Nandanar's Children: The Paraiyans' Tryst with Destiny, Tamil Nadu 1850-1956*, Sage Publications, New Delhi, 2011, p. 160.
43. Ibid., see also V. Geetha and S.V. Rajadurai, *Towards a Non-Brahmin Millenium: from Iyothee Thoss to Periyar*, Calcutta, 1998, p. 72.
44. T. P. Kamalnathan, *Veeramani is Refuted and the Historical Facts about the Scheduled Caste Struggle for Emancipation in India*, Self Respect Rational Publishing, Tiruppathur, 1985, p. 34.
45. For more details, see Stephen P. Cohen, "The Untouchable Soldier: Caste, Politics of the Indian Army", *The Journal of Asian Studies* (henceforth JAS), Vol. XXVIII (28), No. 3, May 1969, p. 456.
46. Calcutta Review, Vol. 33, 1859, p. 143.
47. V. Geetha and S.V. Rajadurai, *Towards a non-Brahmin Millennium: From Tyothee Thoss to Periyar*, Samya Publications, Calcutta, 1998, p. 72.

48. Madras Army Records, Box. 10, Series-II, January 1872, TNA cited in Raj Sekhar Basu, op. cit.,
49. T. P. Kamalanathan, op. Cit., p. 34.
50. Pandit C. Iyothee Thoss, Open letter to the Hon'ble Srinivasa Raghavaiyengar (Inspector General of Registration), Madras, 1894, Theosophical Society Library, Adyar, p. 4 cited in Raj Sekhar Basu, op. cit.
51. Raj Sekhar Basu, op. cit.

Manas Dutta  
*Assistant Professor, Deptt. Of History, Malda College*

## Performance as Subversion: Case Study of the Svang (Pantomime) of 20th Century Bengal

Mimasha Pandit

"The essential principle of grotesque realism is degradation, that is, lowering of all that is high, spiritual, ideal, abstract Mikhail Bakhtin<sup>1</sup>.

Grotesque occupied the popular and folk world of the swadeshi era in different forms. They were critical and introspective. As a perceptible tone of criticism and subversion began to grow in the public opinion of the day during the early twentieth century, grotesque discovered a secured ground to grow and flourish in the folk performances of the day.

Public opinion at the turn of the century emerged as the locus of legitimacy. Hence, both the government and the critic of the government eager to win public support deployed media in its service. A variety of media like newspapers, fictional and non-fictional books, songbooks, dramas, etc., used propagandistic means to influence the imagination of the people into communion. Commonalities alone, however, did not bind the community together; it was also referential. The public imagination of an Indian community depended to a large extent on the juxtaposition of an "other's group. The "other's, in this case the British, supposed to act as an antonym of the "us's had to be imaged in such light that it lost its consequentiality in the opinion of public. The British Raj suspected that the "double influence's of the "local bar and of school-masters's as well as that of some local "landlords's played a significant role in moulding public opinion<sup>2</sup>. It was the opinion of the Raj that this educated section of the society was responsible for directing public opinion in a subversive direction making it derisive of the image of the Raj. What was especially worrying to the government was that the Bengali media systematically eroded the perception of invincibility of the British Raj rooted in public mentality. Thus, the British administration concluded that the spirit was essentially moulded by the influence this section of the society came to exert on the imagination of the people making them pro-agitation, and by extension anti-government. The influence that the aforementioned section exercised over the people was exerted through various public opinion-building mechanisms that caricatured the British Raj and engendered an adverse image about it in people's imagination. These mediums though having different methods of dissemination, orality and visuality, respectively, promoted a common image, i.e. caricature of the British and the Indian public life. The caricatures associated a grotesque figure, which was degrading and lowering in its stance, with the image of the Raj.

In this paper, I have chosen to discuss this subversive aspect of public opinion as expressed through svang or pantomimes to show how a gross picture of British life, Indian public life and of the British administration was created in the imagination of the public that made Bengali public

opinion to take a seditious turn during the swadeshi and boycott agitation. The caricatures derided the image of the British Raj so far held by the public and made their opinion take an antithetic turn favouring mass agitation and disruption of the administration established by the British government in India. This new imagination attributed a ridiculous stature to the government and their rule established by law. I will discuss few of the pantomimes to show how a gross picture of Indian public life and the British administration was created in the imagination of the public as a result of which Bengali public opinion took an unfavourable stance towards the Raj during the swadeshi and the boycott agitation.

### **"GROSS CARICATURE"<sup>s3</sup>: DYNAMICS OF BENGALI CARICATURE**

The caricature and parody has been present in Indian art form since the ancient days. Since the days of the Puranas parody has been in use in an introspective capacity. The form was not uncommon to the popular oral stories about Gods and Goddesses either. But the colonial intrusion enhanced the faculty of the form to critique. In the hands of the disillusioned colonised people, it became a "systematic weapon for social criticism"<sup>s4</sup>. The colonisers were scared by the popularity of the art form. Their concerns found expression in the diatribe they levelled against the caricaturing tendency of all native amusements pointing,

"Among the causes which have served to bring discredit on the Government of the country amongst the semi-educated [are]...places of amusement...favourite resort of the ne'er-do-weels and idlers, whose feelings are played upon by gross caricatures of English life and society...for the most part a reflection in a more or less exaggerated form of the ugliness of the Indian public life..."<sup>s5</sup>

The ire of the colonisers arose from the apprehension they had regarding these caricatures. The caricatures were "gross" because it had the capacity to exaggerate and distort the policies of the Raj into a perverse intention earning for itself the role of an agent involved in unmasking the hidden.

The art of unmasking involved not just removing the facade that hung over the popular notion of Raj. It went a step further and claimed to reveal the true picture that lay hidden behind the facade. The hidden image that the Bengali caricatures publicized were always attended by disproportionate and beyond normal body and facial features and gestures. The project of unmasking the Raj through exaggerated representation of their features/gestures in grotesque formats rendered them visible and laughable. Visibility was dangerous but more so was its ludicrousness. The formidability of the perceived image of the Raj was threatened by such prospects. Hence, the Raj dealt diligently into every oral and performative entertainments and amusements of the Bengalis to detect every attempt to heap ridicule at the administration and life of the Raj. The officials of the British administration found that such attempts amply pervaded almost all amusements of the Bengalis. In this article, I shall look closely at svang or pantomimes a popular form of amusement to understand the larger project of communication and propaganda deployed by the Bengalis during the swadeshi and boycott agitation.

### Svang or Pantomime

"Moder e Svang noy sudhu kali mekhe svang shaja,

Noyko sudhu halka hasi, noyko sudhu maja.

Sansarete sajar opor sajen jinni je ja,

Tari choobi dekhai shobe sohoj bhasay shoja."<sup>6</sup>

This Svang of ours is not a mere costume parody, neither is it a mere joke, nor simple fun. In the world the layers of makeup people paint on their face, we mirror their true picture in front of people in simple language]. The performers of the Kasundia Svang party sang this song as a prelude to their performance.<sup>7</sup> Svang as a popular form of amusement had been present in the Indian culture since the ancient times. The art of expressing ideas through physical and facial gestures is an ideal definition of Svang. They can be held somewhat similar to the European pantomime tradition in constitution which were "performances played in the language of action's.<sup>8</sup> The Svang performing parties usually went about the city and the village to which it belonged in procession and caricatured various social and political personalities and issues through ribald gestures, make-up, and chhara. However, its immense popularity made various other forms of entrainment to insert it in their performance. That is why in the years to come Svang became a synonym for vigorous or exaggerated gestures meant for revelation in the Bengali colloquial vocabulary. Therefore, more than its spatiality it was for its melodramatic gestures i.e. Svang as a performance genre that it became an integral part of the Bengali public sphere for dissemination and discussion of nationalist ideas.

The pristine form of Svang performance used exaggerated body language to expose the shortcomings of colonial administrative laxity and the public life under the influence of the foreigners. Such performances were exhibited either in public processions of the Svang parties or by individual mimics known as bahurupi [one capable of assuming various forms] in rural Bengal. A vernacular newspaper noted, "bahurupis or professional mimics who appear in various disguises for public entertainment...help the spread of sedition in the public minds...'<sup>9</sup> Literary doyen Parimal Goswami reminisced in his autobiography that in his village a bahurupi had once dressed like an Englishman pretending that he was seated on chair that was being carried on head by a native.<sup>10</sup> The bahurupi kept abusing the native who was supposedly carrying the chair and prodded him to move faster. The bahurupi had actually created an illusion by placing a wooden leg in front of a chair and dressed the legs and the upper part of his body in English clothes whereas he dressed his legs in native clothes that was visible partly below the chair. The illusion was excellent but ludicrously dangerous. The picture of the British, it had the power to invoke in the minds of the onlookers, was explosive, hence, it was potent.

In another portrayal, the mimic artists of the Svang parties turned their axe of critical review against the sycophants of the English administration. Various couplets or chhara were composed caricaturing such men. The couplets used ribald remarks to illustrate a grotesque image of the sycophants. They were painted as "gadha's [donkey] who could not be converted into horses even through the club of the law enforcer. Thus, the svang performers caricaturing them sang:

"Dandadhari gadha pitle,  
Ghora kobhu hoy na.  
Dhore jokhon kan mola dey,  
Tokhon baka thakte pare na."<sup>11</sup>

[Even if a law enforcer beats up a donkey, it can never become a horse. When their ears are boxed, they cannot keep their countenance.] Such couplets when recited in public processions accompanied with equally ludicrous body action could evoke roll of laughter from the audience. The performer, therefore, mimicked the object under review both in words and in deed. The svang of Khidirpur often used the duo of methor-jharudar [sweeper] in a symbolic way to point out such mucks of the society that needed cleansing.<sup>12</sup> The symbolic usage of the character of sweepers enabled the svang party to use the lingo of the masses and to attack those evils of the society that needed cleaning making the performance ludicrous yet comprehensible and significant for the audience. However, often the mimic dressed like the individual they reviewed and exposed their drawbacks before the masses through ridiculous dresses, body movements, and songs. Thus, one of the svang performers dressed up like a native emulating British ways and sang:

"Dhape dhape bhinno bhangi,  
Brahman bongshe Tesh-Feringhi."<sup>13</sup>

[Different actions in different social strata. A Tesh-Feringhi in the house of Brahmins]. Such a man was critiqued as a Showman and the svang mimicking him would appear in European clothes and sing in the similar language they [the Tesh-Feringhi] spoke but in a much less refined manner to analyze the public life organised under the Western, by extension British, influence. So, the svang in its act of reviewing was introspective too. Nevertheless, even while adopting an

introspective stance they found fault with the British, whom they held responsible for the evils that had crept in the society.

The potency of the art form lay in its adaptability to various other media of entertainment and dissemination. Svang as a seditious gag could be introduced in various dramatic performances. It was a major concern for the colonial vigilantes. They noted plays and jatras that supposedly entertained and introduced seditious gag or svang in their performance. The list of Bengali dramas prepared by the Criminal Investigation Department noted two jatras, Mahishasur Badh and Marut Jagna, which were being played in Nadia and in the Bahera hat, respectively. <sup>15</sup> The list reported that the jatra play Mahishasur Badh was "objectionable's and "easily admits the introduction of seditious gag's whereas the jatra play Marut Jagna was "unobjectionable's but "admits of seditious gag's. <sup>16</sup> Introduction of skits closely resembling a burlesque could, and often did, caricature the British and the Indian public life. One such pantomime was reported to the home department of the colonial administration which enacted a crude portrayal of individuals, institutions and events associated with the British in India. <sup>17</sup> A swadeshi circus party of Poona visiting the town of Rajshahi and Rangpur in August 1907 reportedly performed this pantomime. <sup>18</sup> The pantomime that the circus party performed at Rangpur was described as "offensive's. <sup>19</sup> The pantomime critically examined the moral conduct of the wife of a European medical missionary. The narrative showed the wife of the medical missionary making love to Indians who came to her husband under the pretext of consulting him. <sup>20</sup> When the husband found out about the illicit relationships, a person who wore the badge of national volunteer uniform beat him up. The topic of the pantomime was unsophisticated and its portrayal transformed the play into a slapstick comedy. Nevertheless, the mayhem or chaotic situation that the slapstick could generate in the pantomime made the process of appraisal simpler, popular, and credible. <sup>21</sup>

## **LAUGHING WITH CONTEMPT: CARICATURE AS SUBVERSION**

Satires and caricatures share a kinship in their puritan attitude of exposing and separating the good image from the bad image, and then laugh at the bad image with utter contempt. The few caricatures of the swadeshi era that I have discussed in this paper had similar temperament. These cartoons or parodies mirrored various practices of the contemporary politics and society. In every mirrored practice, it illustrated a good image that was suppressed and oppressed by the bad image. But owing to its nature, the caricatures always distorted the image of the bad and their act of badness to such an extent that they became ludicrous. The laughter that such portrayals could inspire was tinged with contempt. Thus, the political cartoons, the satirical songs and svang that caricatured the foreign government and the Indian public life, inspired by them, painted everything foreign as bad and laughably grotesque in appearance.

What was so rebellious about the images that these media painted? They made one look bad and laughable but were that enough to inspire feelings of insurrection. As a matter of fact, they actually did inspire such feelings. The audience of these media were encouraged to laugh at the images of the foreigner and their sycophants. The laughter bred seditious. The encouragement to laugh by



the performers at their portrayals inspired sedition. Portrayal and subsequent encouragement was actually an act of eroding the glorious image of the British Raj, one that had emerged from their imagination of Queen Victoria of England as their mother whose powers were omniscient and omnipotent, embedded in the psyche of public. Once the image of the Raj faded, it shook from the people's imagination the myth about its invincibility. Therefore, the act of the author and performer of the caricatures incited contempt, hatred, and disloyalty towards the government and between the different classes of subjects of Her Majesty's government i.e. the Natives and the Europeans.

## CONCLUSION

Grotesque is the lifeblood of popular folk culture in every part of the world. Mikhail Bakhtin in his analysis of Rabelais's works, a Renaissance litterateur, revealed the wonderful world of folk wisdom reflected in the popular elemental forces like the farces, proverbs, and words of the mouth of a fool. In the entire gamut of folk elements, one thing makes its presence righteously felt "the grotesque. It appeared repeatedly in folk elements; it was rude in its gesture, bawdy in its language, and rash in its tongue. But, its presence was integral and inviolable. Popular as they were, grotesque forms in folk elements lay between life and art. They were artistic in their imagery, upholding a material bodily principle in its grotesqueness. On the other hand, they were life itself, in their universalistic overtures. As Bakhtin saw it, "The cosmic, social, and bodily elements are given here as an invisible whole. And this whole is gay and gracious."<sup>22</sup> This was grotesque realism in its most unadulterated form.

The swadeshi svang or pantomime world of grotesque was equally gay and gracious in its representations. It was re-creating life in an artistic form that was ancient, full of revelry, and popular. A combination of many unlikely qualities, its crowning glory was the grotesque image that it created. A visual and oral product, grotesque became the definitive element of the folk pantomime culture. Combining life and art, swadeshi pantomime brought alive onstage a unique image that could be universalized. Association of grotesque with the Raj came as a corollary to the background in which the wisdom of the representation unfolded. The events of swadeshi and boycott agitation, and the subsequent ideas proliferating in the Bengali intellectual world, contextualized the swadeshi grotesque realism. The effect was drastic. A corrosive power was unleashed that gradually began to eat away into the carefully raised and constructed image of the Raj, demeaning and lowering it in public estimation. Thus, subversion was performed in the arena of svangor pantomime performance. It reduced public faith in the Raj and broke down the facade of invincibility that surrounded its image. A change was at hand; a gap had been found; and it was only a matter of time before the edifice, like the image, lost its legitimacy.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to extend my gratitude to Dr. Shukla Sanyal, my Supervisor, without whose constant encouragement this article would not have been possible and UGC-JRF programme whose funding made this research work possible.

## Notes & References

1. Mikhail Bakhtin, *Rabelais and His World*, Indiana University Press, Bloomington, 1984, p.19.
2. West Bengal State Archives-Home Political (Political) (hereafter WBSA-HP), F. N. (J)/1905, Report on the Agitation against the Partition of Bengal. Reprinted in Basudeb Chattopadhyay, *Bengal Partitioned: Selections from Confidential Records*, Kolkata, West Bengal State Archives, 2007, 27- 112, p. 31.
3. WBSA-HP (Confidential), F. N. 129/1911, Extract from the Report on Native Papers (hereafter RNP) for the week ending the 25th June 1910.
4. Partha Mitter, "Cartoons of the Raj's, *History Today*, Vol.XLVII, 1997, p. 16.
5. WBSA-HP (Confidential), F. N. 129/1911.
6. Birehwar Bandopadhyay, *Bangladesher Svang Prasange* [Regarding the Svang of Bangladesh], The Asiatic Society, Kolkata, 1972, p. 68.
7. Kasundia Svang of Howrah was also known as "Svang bahar". During the Charak festival the Svang party used to be flagged off from 21 Ganesh Majhi Lane'ss Sitala temple. Charles Aubert and Edith Sears, *The Art of Pantomime*, Courier Dover Publication, New York, 2003, p. 3.
8. WBSA-RNP, *Dainik Chandrika*, 5th December 1908.
9. Birehwar Bandopadhyay, *opcit.*, p. 111.
10. *Ibid.*, p. 90.
11. *Ibid.*, p. 58.
12. *Ibid.*, p. 196.
13. The word Tesh-Feringhi was commonly used in Bengali colloquial to refer to people who tried in manner and language to adopt British or European ways foregoing their native identity. Basudeb Chattopadhyay, *Bengal Partitioned: Selections from Confidential Records*, West Bengal State Archives, Kolkata, 2007, pp. 67-69. Also see, WBSA-HPD, *List of Bengali Dramas Noted in Political Branch, C.I.D., Eastern Bengal and Assam*, with Notes on each.
14. *Ibid.*, pp. 67-69.

15. NAI-PB (Confidential), F.N. 76, October 1907, Political A, "Fortnightly report from the 4th to the 9th of September, Shillong, 25th September 1907's.
16. The Bengalee, 30th August 1907.
17. NAI-PB (Confidential), F.N. 76, October 1907, Political A.
18. NAI-PB (Confidential), F.N. 76, October 1907, Political A.
19. Pantomimes make use of chaotic acts to create mayhem and excite the audience into a state of involvement. Millie Taylor while evaluating the British pantomime performance tradition notes that such absurd actions were deliberately used in the performance to make the audience feel involved in the narrative process. M. Taylor, *British Pantomime Performance*. Chicago, University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 2007. Pp. 33-51.
20. *Ibid.*, p. 19.

Mimasha Pandit

*Assistant Professor, Dept. of History, Victoria Institution College, Kolkata*

## Nanotechnology Ideology: Perfunctory Policies and Economic Impulse

Shane Feyers

*Abstract: Nanotechnology ‘ molecules of our design and control ‘ is a complex material science that has resulted in practical development at a microscopic level. Quickly becoming a general-purpose technology, it is believed that nanoparticles will drastically alter our cultures, economies, and societies. Industries and countries all over the world are actively engaged in comprehensive investment, study, and use. What continues to be overlooked are the unknown factors; nanotechnology is in our environment, and will be in our bodies. Without entirely understanding the implications of this and recognizing these uncertainties, continued use with no nano-specific policies is careless and potentially dangerous. While the United States government invests in nanotechnology and appoints industry the blame of weak policy, some countries are using this as a model to follow, while others are using this as a standard to avoid. Although there is some positive prospect of nanotechnology policies, on a global basis these statutes and regulations must be strengthened if we intend to avoid consequential impacts to our environment, public health, and future ecosystem integrity.*

### I

#### Introduction

Nanotechnology has emerged as a widespread and technologically transformative contrivance, the next stage of hyper-industry. Nanoscience has been established in countless research and development mediums across the globe. From more efficient consumer products to more effective energy cultivation, nanotechnology contributes to a range of products and applications by providing miraculous attribute boosting properties. Interconnected with almost every imaginable trade, nano-industry is simultaneously creating an invisible anthropogenic presence that now resides in many of our ecological systems and bodies.

On a global scale, countries, economies, and industries are actively engaged in nano-investment and use. The leading country of development, the United States is establishing a benchmark: involving this material within government, military, consumer industries, science, and energy applications. Pursuing this lead, China, Japan, and India (among many) have dedicated wide ranging efforts to nanoscience, becoming three top competitors in development. Although numerous differences arise in policy dictation, scientific responsibility, and governmental accountability, all have in common their vast investments in research, commercialization, and funding, while maintaining little focus on policy.,

Despite differences in application, countries involved in nano-development increasingly share rings of competition, while they synchronously create a complex system of international collaboration and transnational economic nexuses. In this complexity, overlooked interactions and

bypassed studies convey inevitable dangers and unpredictable outcomes. 50 years after the concept emerged, definitive policy has neither been built nor gathered for nanomaterials. Without entirely understanding implications and recognizing uncertainties, our continued use without dedicated policy is careless and potentially dangerous. Regulations need to be drafted if we intend to avoid indistinct risks.,

We have manipulated entire ecosystems; run out of scientific pioneering space; and indiscriminately seek out opportunity for tinkering at any level. Prioritizing nano-development over policy is prematurely liberating technological omnipotence. We are now corrupting the environment in an unknown way, at a scale previously free from our reach evolving our waste products from visible and hazardous, to unidentifiable and consequentially enigmatic.,/p>

In order to understand why proper nano-policy is such a crucial endeavor, in this paper I familiarize the reader with the basics of nanotechnology; the current investments of finance and research; the scientific understandings; and the status of policies worldwide. It begins by introducing nanomaterials, and through the presentation of risk consideration, perspectives, as well as local toils and global enterprises, it intends to assemble an internal inquiry: is international economic competition worth such undetermined risk?

As we pressure our economy forward to maintain our title, we press nanotechnology further into nature, ignorant of the danger. An icon for innovation, the United States' absence of nanotechnology policy misleads by example. Shaping the future in part, we have a responsibility to local and international communities, as well as the environment, to guide our policy decisions by responding to sound hypotheses, well researched academics, and the educated consensus. Governments worldwide have a social obligation to catch up to the pace of industry and account for the scruples of nanomaterial.

## II

### Discussion

#### Nanotechnology

First envisioned by a physicist in 1959, Richard Feynman is recognized for inspiring the creation and development of nanotechnology. Since that time scientists and researchers have slowly discovered the specifics of manipulating matter at the molecular level, capable of arranging single atoms into products of their choice.<sup>1</sup> These visionary ideas came to fruition and are now a common material throughout our everyday lives, found in industries of medicine, food, clothing, energy generation, national security and defense, environmental cleanup, electronics, computing, construction, and cosmetics.<sup>2</sup> Reflecting on our current cultural mentality, the overseers of industry predict that the results of nanotechnology will be a revolutionary control over matter, comparable to the ability to manipulate text in a document.<sup>3</sup> This commercialization, beginning in

the mid-1990's<sup>4</sup> has evolved from 'emerging' to rapid - the production rate nearing three or four market-ready products with nanotechnology attributes released a week.<sup>5</sup> With an estimated nanotechnology market of over \$ 91 billion dollars in the United States, nanomaterials are predicted to become a general-purpose technology by 2020, contributing to more than a \$ 3 trillion dollar marketplace that is expected to double every three years after that.<sup>6</sup>

The research taking place at the atomic, molecular, or macromolecular levels is the core principle of nanoparticle development. These are materials that we can synthesize and manipulate to our whims, easily modifying their size, shape, and core properties.<sup>7</sup> With the ability to microscopically engineer matter comes many benefits such as the potential to improve our degraded soil, water, and air quality throughout the environment; to improve pollutant detection technologies as well as remediation methods.<sup>8</sup> These benefits are recognized internationally as governments across the globe quickly enter themselves into a nanotechnology development race.<sup>9</sup>

Setting nanotechnology as a top priority in the United States, the White House made the National Nanotechnology Initiative (NNI) one of the President's prime pursuits in 2000,<sup>10</sup> exemplifying a case where the government took a strategic role in '...selecting the technology, mobilizing potential stakeholders to enact a new program around that technology, and arranging large scale public investment in an effort to assure a commercial payoff...' <sup>11</sup> Justifying the convergence by claiming the private sector cannot '...commit the long-term investments that are clearly required for broad, complex, expensive, and risky areas such as nanotechnology,' <sup>12</sup> federal agencies pushed to prioritize nanotechnology through building a large base of stakeholders, then determining the direction of policy decisions.<sup>13</sup> The NNI, a major propellant for nano-development in the United States and World, has been the recipient of over \$ 12 billion in funding since its start in 2000, making it one of the largest civilian and science technology investment in the United States, second only to the space program.<sup>14</sup> Coordinating the nanotechnology activities of 25 Federal departments and independent agencies by 2010, found in Table 3 in the Appendix, the NNI has set its focus on advancing world class research and development; providing a transformative medium to involve these technologies in our products; with plans to create and implement a working foundation of resources and a skilled labor force; while supporting responsible development.<sup>15</sup>

Aware of these investments and developments, the actions of the United States led nanotechnology to becoming a global interest, governments having spent more than \$ 18 billion dollars while trying to acquire more funds.<sup>16</sup> Tables 1 and 2 demonstrate the economic activity and growing financial investment of nanotechnology worldwide. By 2010 this global industry represented more than a 100 billion dollar enterprise, with more than 1,000 products commercially available at the time; expecting revenues to reach 2 to 3 trillion dollars by 2015.<sup>17</sup> Not only is this capital paying off in the consumer market, but as much of our technology has spawned from militarized R&D, nanotechnology quickly established itself into applications across our offensive and defensive capabilities, drawing attention to importance of nanotechnology in arms control.<sup>18</sup>

The versatility of nanotechnology is both its strength and weakness. Whitman explains: ‘...by embedding the funding, research, and development of nanoscience and nanotechnology in such a wide but interconnected range of institutions ““ government, military, industrial, academic, medical ““ the sense in which progress in these fields is considered to be ‘...fundamental’ is greatly strengthened, and the number and coherence of 'outsider' institutional interests is greatly diminished.’<sup>19</sup> The integration of so many social cogs may seem like a good thing, but because of this it is likely that legitimate or precautionary public concerns will carry little political weight, simply because of the magnitude and variability in the interests and investments to this field./p>

Countering these concerns, industry originally denounced doubt and misinformation for the hesitation of nanotechnology acceptance. In their studies they discovered that an assortment of nanoparticles exist on the planet, both in biotic and abiotic aspects of ecological infrastructure. Research is even demonstrating that some organisms have the ability to synthesize nanomaterials naturally. Additionally from our anthropogenic activities of industrial combustion, emissions, mining, and land desertification, we have actually ourselves unintentionally created unique nanoparticles that have consequential impacts on environmental chemistry.<sup>20</sup>

It is inherently accepted that if nanoparticles exist in nature; can sometimes be used by nature; and are already created by us incidentally, then the R&D of such will only act to improve our knowledge of nanomaterials, allowing for modification in such a way that humans and the environment can only benefit.

Clear need for scrupulous caution

The difficulty in properly regulating nanotechnology does not just result from government and industrial hesitation, but emerges from a number of biological and ecological reasons as well. Able to exist in many forms ““ one, two, or three dimensional films, rods, or particles ““ and sizes, ranging from molecular levels to bulk scales, their properties and biological behavior all depend on these variables. Possessing heterogeneous characteristics, nanomaterial is able to change its function as its size changes, dramatically altering the nature of its conductivity, solubility, elasticity, surface structure, composition, and hardness, making it difficult to predict the complex interactions within the environment and our bodies, while simultaneously making it very attractive to commercial industry.<sup>21</sup>,

These particles, classified as half the diameter of ultra-fine particles, have unknown consequences. Although studies show that they have a short residence time because of their quick diffusion, coagulation with other particles, or deposition on other surfaces,<sup>22</sup> it is these properties that at the same time lead to worry, allowing for some nanomaterials to accumulate or camouflage themselves in a number of our natural systems. Scientists have already begun to collect and compare research data, finding similar correlations and concluding that there are sufficient warning signs to prompt the need for individual nanoparticle testing.<sup>23</sup>/p>

While we understand nanotechnology can be engineered to requester emissions, remediate contamination sites, or purify our drinking water, we still do not know enough to justify this multidisciplinary application. In our complex ecological matrices we are unable to devise any simple method to identify or characterize foreign-introduced nanoparticles. If we plan to clean our waters and apply these materials to technology, then there is urgent need for further comprehension of behavior and risks; nanoparticles will accumulate in our waterways as contaminants, and travel as pollutants through our water systems.<sup>24</sup>,/p>

Beginning well after nanotechnology was brought to market, nano-toxicology studies may be able to convey some of these risks.<sup>25</sup> Emerging evidence describes that marine ecosystems are acting as a 'sink' for nanoparticles, and that water contamination has already begun.<sup>26</sup> Imperative to toxicology experimentation are parameters of concentration and time, factors easily measured for single chemicals using dose/response scenarios,<sup>27</sup> but variables that are very difficult to measure in relation to nanoparticles. With such irregular behavior, our studies must go beyond the assumption of laboratory toxicity: some results demonstrate that it is toxic there but inert in the environment; while others provide overwhelming evidence that show exposure to low concentrations has a negative impact on primary producers of carbon and nitrogen cycling.<sup>28</sup> Studies need to simulate exposure to the original nanomaterials or composites. It is possible for these particles to become widely distributed into a biological environment, and through abiotic and biotic transformations result in newly formed toxic contrivances that could potentially act as ecological Trojan-horses.<sup>29</sup>

We know that some nanoparticles have natural sources, but readily acknowledge once purposefully emitted into the environment, and transmitted in the atmosphere, they freely transform their attributes; possibly resulting in complete alterations of their size, function and composition.<sup>30</sup> Although presumed inherently helpful in current applications, these nanoparticles are prone to unintended cloud formations that can then be transported over large distances and absorbed into the environment or our bodies.<sup>31</sup> They are highly mobile, yet we know nothing of their fate.<sup>32</sup>

Two uses already common are the implementation of nanoparticles into fullerenes and the manufacturing of carbon nanotubes. These technologies are being used in decontamination circumstances, drug delivery cases, solar cell infrastructure, and many other applications,<sup>33</sup> but are just as much the subject of contemplation. Carbon nanotubes and fullerenes have been shown to: induce cell death; deplete cellular compounds and molecular resources; and damage the mitochondrial membrane, reinforcing the idea that these materials may act as 'Trojans' in our body as well ““ infiltrating as masked invaders into the workings of our anatomy, then becoming difficult to identify and unlikely to degrade.<sup>34</sup> Toxicological studies have found carbon nanotechnology causing damage to bacteria, plankton, cells, and organisms. It is asserted that ‘...their impacts are 3 fold due to their ability to firstly penetrate membranes, secondly, form aggregates and thirdly, their ability to interact with different biochemical compounds.’<sup>35</sup> Further studies indicated hormonal uptake in organisms, illuminating how an engineered material could critically threaten the reproduction cycle of an entire aquatic species.<sup>36</sup>,/p>



We must deduce that engineered nanoparticles (ENPs) have an undetermined future within our environment, unpredictable outcomes that controlled laboratory studies will not be able to test for;<sup>37</sup> discovery of potential consequences are lagging far behind that of development. Fortunately no environmental spills or critical ENP issues have yet to arise, but industry and agencies surmise that until that happens we will not be able to accurately document their true impacts.<sup>38</sup> It is predicted that entrance into the environment will happen over a number of different ways, most likely resembling exposure scenarios similar to contaminants such as pharmaceuticals, flame retardants, and other toxic chemicals currently disrupting natural environmental chemistry.<sup>39</sup> Nanotechnology is described to be ‘...assimilating to the fate of plastics, where...nanoparticles accumulate in the environment and become part of [the] nutritional and reproductive environment of humans and animals.’<sup>40</sup> With bio-persistent characteristics compared to asbestos, and deposition of carbon nanotubes estimated at a rate of more than 150 tons per year and increasing,<sup>41</sup> it is not surprising that there are already reports of nanoparticles reaching places as far away as the Arctic, and in remote regions of the Pacific.<sup>42</sup> Although no known studies to date have documented ecological changes from exposure to nanoparticles, fewer than 12 published reports have examined and predicted the potential ecological ramifications of ENPs.<sup>43</sup>

Having already demonstrated its ability to gain access to the body via inhalation, absorption, or ingestion, the impact of nanomaterials on cells is not yet fully understood.<sup>44</sup> There is major concern that once these particles have permeated into the body, other organs will be reached through the bloodstream and biodistribution ““ crossing natural barriers such as the air-blood barrier in the lungs, or the brain-blood barrier; as well as bioaccumulation in the liver, spleen, heart, and brain.<sup>45</sup> Research has reported that nanoparticles are even able to enter the nuclear envelope of cells, creating further question of its genotoxicity and ability to negatively affect our DNA.,/p>

With these hazards identified, further summarized in Tables 4, 5, and 6 in the Appendix, some biologists believe this widespread translation of nanomaterials within the body is enough evidence to take these risks seriously<sup>46</sup> and prompt swift regulatory action. Understandably not all of these risks can be discovered or addressed. But with the ongoing regulatory delay, in the past several years alone both industry and the public have become puzzled by the lack of data assessing the risks of manufacture, use, and disposal.<sup>47</sup> The scientific community believes more research is crucial; the public is slowly realizing risk management has been overlooked; and the private industry has begun to proceed with caution. Meanwhile, laws and regulations still remain absent in the US.

#### Scientific input and inquiry

It is not just the general public that believes regulations need to be revised. A growing number of studies show that nanomaterials can potentially have adverse health effects on organisms, creating an increasing concern among scientists regarding the toxicity of nanomaterials.<sup>48</sup> They recognize

that it is imperative we understand the environmental and health impacts of nanotechnology, yet in 2003 only \$200,000 dollars of the \$700 million dedicated to research was spent on determining the environmental impacts.<sup>49</sup> Some of our environmental protection laws are over 40 years old, with many of them unmodified for decades. An outdated system that is forcing our policy makers to ineffectively apply the law to this new complex science.<sup>50</sup> For instance the E.P.A.'s current Toxic Substances Control Act regulatory guidelines exempts some categories of chemicals, including those produced in low volumes of 10,000 kilograms or less a year “ a small mass for most chemicals, but nanotechnology can exhibit a high degree of (re)activity at or below those levels.<sup>51</sup> Policy can not be accurately updated when minimal research is dedicated to determining our regulatory needs; nothing can be standardized because we have insufficient review and documentation.<sup>52</sup> Because of this lack of data coupled with regulatory lagging, researchers are beginning to feel pressure from the public's uncertainty, noting that it is important the regulations remain dictated by the science.<sup>53</sup>

Institutions such as the Center for Biological and Environmental Nanotechnology summarize that ‘...[w]e are in this awkward middle territory where we have just enough information to think there is an issue, but not enough information to really inform policymakers about what to do about it.’<sup>54</sup> Although some government funding is dedicated towards developing a rigorous understanding of how ENPs will interact with organisms and ecosystems, researchers know it is not enough.<sup>55</sup> To predict the impacts of any nanomaterial, Bernhardt et al. describe we must consider: (i) the form, the route, and the mass of nanomaterials entering the environment (characterization and risk assessment); (ii) the fate and transport of nanomaterials in environmental media (bioavailability); (iii) organismal responses to nanomaterial exposure (ecotoxicology); and (iv) the effects of nanomaterial inputs on ecological communities and biological processes.<sup>56</sup>

It will not be until these areas of study are collaborated among researchers in multidisciplinary fields that we will be able to sufficiently and safely regulate nanotechnology.<sup>57</sup>/p>

Scientists agree that there is a pertinent need to create regulation limiting exposure, based off of objective research from realistic human exposure scenarios, rather than laboratories ill-equipped and unprepared to test the impacts of nanotechnology.<sup>58</sup> However, in 2007 an incident involving exposure to nanoparticles in a Chinese paint factory resulted in seven people contracting lung disease, in which two of those individuals passed away.<sup>59</sup>,

In a commentary authored by authority officials from a number of Scientific Agencies, they acknowledge that although there is a growing library of scientific literature disseminating the impact and safety implications of nanotechnology, decisions have yet to be made by regulators as they are confronted by complex choices in the face of nanomaterial.<sup>60</sup> These officials recognize that a life-cycle perspective of risk assessment is highly relevant, but until more data is acquired the scientific policy analysis will be persuaded by international economic and political interests.<sup>61</sup> Researchers “ and therefore regulators “ have insufficient data to determine specific uses and adverse impacts, creating a known discrepancy and an exploited loophole, between what the

scientific community would like to know before decision making, and what they currently know.<sup>62</sup>,

A recent survey took place to learn of the current perception and urgency of communication among nano-scientists. Results showed that although there is conflict in what medium of information sharing scientists should follow, there was mutual agreement in the need to communicate ideas about appropriate regulation for nanomaterials. But public perception and the resulting judgments present conflict in the accuracy, intention, and viability of their input, creating uncertainties and insecurities among information reporting.<sup>63</sup>

Implementing a Voluntary Stewardship Program, the E.P.A. is trying to collect accurate nanoparticle information before it can actively regulate the industry.<sup>64</sup> They acknowledge the input from the authors in the research community, but state that their advice must be scientific and legally sound, fitting within the already developed regulatory framework.<sup>65</sup> They recognize the current lack of environmental health and safety precautions, and assert that considerable time and a significant amount of input from industry will be necessary before policy can be effectively applied to nanomaterials.<sup>66</sup> Developing better screening tests, more hazard determination, and more protocols is necessary.<sup>67</sup>

However, As Marchant, Sylvester, & Abbot describe ‘...there are no accepted test methods or validated data that can be used to prepare scientifically credible quantitative estimates of risk of specific nanotechnology applications at this time.’<sup>68</sup> These models are not equipped to handle risk management of nanotechnology because there are undeclared uncertainties and currently no way to calculate them. Problems arise in both the identification and quantification of risks of nanotechnology, impeding the ability for any of the normal risk management methods to be effective.<sup>69</sup>The management must account for both the public perceptions and scientific research; we know nothing of the long term respiratory effects, toxicity levels, nor environmental interactions.

Our ability to make and apply nanotechnology is outpacing the important step of determining the risk, with little incentive to relinquish its place. A new risk management model must be developed.<sup>70</sup> As demonstrated in the aforementioned tables, all of what we know about the risks have been identified in laboratory conditions,<sup>71</sup> yet unimpeded use outside of the laboratory continues. Now integrated into the foundation of our social infrastructure, nanoscience has become a significant economic and political program, seemingly given an impunity to its potential dangers because of the easily calculated benefits overshadowing the costly and hidden risks.<sup>72</sup>

These officials admit that the next best timely approach would be to encourage researchers and risk managers to work together to first limit exposure, and then to identify and address the potential hazards. Results will take time to emerge, adding that regulatory agencies must act in the absence of complete data at this time, as scientists are still unable to quantify exposures and close information gaps.<sup>73</sup> Sharing with the public that current promising studies are taking place,

independently sponsored testing of our most widely used nanomaterials has begun. Yet these officials continue to assert that the responsibility of further testing, risk discovery, and active policy direction falls on industry, proclaiming that regulations will be slow to develop until they contribute more.<sup>74</sup>

Policy and Regulation: clouded oversight, shrouded agenda

In creating regulations for our science and technology, the ideal formulation is dependent upon an objective, apolitical scientific method of experimentation to learn the most accurate data that can be used to guide our decisions.<sup>75</sup> Although there is growing production and expansive distribution, there are no regulatory requirements assigned to nanotechnology beyond the established commercial chemical policies.<sup>76</sup> Since its inception and decade long industrial employment, minimal research into the environmental impacts and health and safety implications have taken place, studies seemingly just beginning in 2005.<sup>77</sup> With their substantial investment, the US Government is now struggling to convince the public that the current regulatory system is sufficient to address the policy needs of nanotechnology.<sup>78</sup>

Maintaining the regulatory status as an industrial chemical, our current policy structure is designed to promote economic stimulation, requiring minimal information for the review of any new chemicals, and assigning the burden of proof to the government regulators. Our policies are generally perceived as market-rational, being described as ‘...a smoothly functioning market [being] to the greatest advantage of the greatest number,’ requiring a ‘politically passive...hands-off attitude in matters of legislation and decision making.’<sup>79</sup> Augmenting our trust in this regulatory system is the further belief that the market will manage risks, as negative externalities would have a negative impact on business. If a product arrives to market and risks are found it is then that they are more thoroughly studied and new policies are implemented. Therefore nanotechnology has fallen into a regulatory gray area, needing only direct regulation if novel products are generated or can be designated as new chemicals.<sup>80</sup> Since most forms of nanotechnology are involved with existing materials, accordingly, they are not recognized as new chemicals and require no new regulation.

Although it is obvious nanotechnology is able to exploit regulatory loopholes, many challenges arise when contemplating what policies should be modified or developed; the information deficiencies reinforce our lack of understanding, and consequently result in this weaker regulation.<sup>81</sup>

The current pace of the regulatory process is straggling behind the R&D and marketing of nanotechnology, and does not appear to be struggling to keep up.<sup>82</sup> Although flawed, it is pertinent to acknowledge that nanotechnology is not free to reign in nano-anarchy. Everyone, from the laboratories conducting research to the small start-up companies and large corporations, are subject to a labyrinth of legislation, codes of practice, guidelines, images, standards, contractual laws,

consumer protection laws, and occupational health and safety laws.<sup>83</sup> Still, none of the framework yet mandates more specific regulation of this invisible technology.

In the governance of the nano-industry, Cynthia Selin of the NanoFutures project, an academic enterprise created by the Center for Nanotechnology in Society at Arizona State University explains there are two main challenges to the development of nano-policy, the first of which is ‘...dealing with the insufficiently diverse and reflexive decision making that marks contemporary governance; and [second]...coping with rapid technological change uncoupled from the capacity for socio-political responses.’<sup>84</sup> These struggles have scattered uncertainty throughout the regulatory process, leaving educational systems, appropriately developed policy, and social choices behind.<sup>85</sup> In what was described as one of the ‘...longest and most detailed U.S. [nanotechnology] stud[ies] to date,’ Whitman presents the National Science Foundation (N.S.F.) and Department of Commerce's (D.O.C.) strong assign: justify; “>Government has an important role in setting long-term research priorities, respecting the ethical and social aspects of ...technology, and ensuring economic conditions that facilitate the rapid invention and deployment of beneficial technologies. Technological superiority is the fundamental basis of the economic prosperity and national security of the United States, and continued progress...is an essential component for government agencies to accomplish their missions... 86

By this reasoning it is inferred that the motivation to regulate may be limited because of the motivation to accelerate. Highly selective in its chemical bans, the Environmental Protection Agency (E.P.A.) explains if it does not have enough data applicable to determine or evaluate the health and environmental effects of a chemical, it can only regulate manufacture and use if they are able to present evidence of unreasonable risk.<sup>87</sup> However, accounting for the monumental R&D and substantial fiscal investment by both government and industry, their relationship and interconnected interests seem to prefer any regulations remain voluntary.<sup>88</sup> Since so little is known about the implications and there is so much to gain, our economic needs and social expectations have quietly authorized the creation and utilization of nanotechnology.

By 2008 there were already hundreds of nanotechnology products on the market, unknowingly exposing consumers and workers throughout their daily lives. At that time the E.P.A. issued a White Paper providing a time line for appropriate oversight and declaring that sufficient risk knowledge would be collected by 2012, with a systematic approach for management to follow.<sup>89</sup> All of us having been exposed to this ultra-fine particle technology by now, there is still no dedicated policy in sight. After recruited to find a response to the social, political, economic, and ethical implications of nanotechnology, Cynthia Selin describes the ‘...Collingridge dilemma:’

outcomes cannot be predicted until a technology is adopted, yet once path dependencies materialize and technologies get ‘...locked in,’ control or modulation becomes difficult as markets, cultural values, institutions and policy become rigid. 90

Past lessons and outgrown innovation models taught us that we cannot make an accurate prediction of emerging social/technological relationships, nor should we remain passive and allow for their implementation impacts to teach us “neither is viable nor responsible.”/p>

In order to manage society's ability to appropriately govern technology like ENPs, we must work together to ‘...understand uncertainty strategically,’ by creating a learning environment and invoking an awareness that will allow for the development of complex social choice<sup>91</sup> and educated regulatory decision making. This perspective is still not shared with current policy makers and the majority of industry. Narrated in the above mentioned N.S.F./ D.O.C. report, these agents again assert:

It may be possible to influence the ways convergent technologies will change economics and society...by providing leadership and support for a nationwide, collaborative effort...This effort should have many stakeholders in education, healthcare, pharmaceuticals, social science, the military, the economy and the business sector . . . 92

Boldly, officials reinforce the perceived importance of putting economic incentives and technological progression before policy appropriation. While respecting our ethics is a concern, the development of technology appears to be the priority.<sup>93</sup>/p>

Independent and international portraits: leaders and laggards

With the United States government slow to act, some non-governmental organizations (NGOs) are teaming up with industry to initiate their own policy directives, hoping their actions will influence others to follow suit, and believing a self-governing framework will establish models to augment a complete nanomaterial regulatory system.<sup>94</sup> Many firms are arguing for independent soft-laws to prevent unsafe practices of nanotechnology, believing ethical behavior, good judgment, professional practices, and cultural consideration will be even more effective than forceful regulation.<sup>95</sup> There is some question however, to the effectiveness and outcomes related to voluntary programs rather than mandatory policies. Reflecting on the E.P.A.'s voluntary Nanoscale Materials Stewardship Program, having taken 3 years for the program to launch, by 2009 there were only 29 basic information submissions, representing less than 10% of the nanomaterials commercially available at that time.<sup>96</sup> With the economic potential offered by nanotechnology, researchers speculate as to why any industry would rush to share data when products are already commercialized; or search for risks when testing is not required, creating unnecessary financial burdens and regulatory hurdles for themselves.<sup>97</sup>

In an attempt to establish a policy framework of their own, the United Kingdom ran a Voluntary Reporting Scheme similar to the E.P.A.'s Stewardship Program in 2009. Like that program, and much like a program attempted by Denmark “which yielded so few submissions that no analysis was even conducted<sup>98</sup> ‘only 11 submissions occurred over a two year period, prompting the U.K. to decide voluntary programs would not be sufficient to safeguard the public and environment

from the hazards of nanomaterials. Since that time the United Kingdom has educed the use of the precautionary principle in place of voluntary measures.<sup>99</sup> Nanomaterials are impossible to detect except through voluntary disclosure from the manufacturer; because the right to know and the right to choose are core principles of European Union policy, the EU decided nanomaterials would face new labeling laws, informing consumers through product packaging about ‘...the origin, quality, safety, intended use, environmental impact, storage, expiry, method of production, composition, and content’ of the nano-substance.<sup>100</sup> Many other countries including the US do not consider the precautionary principle as effective or appropriate, leaguing with Canada, Australia, and Japan in deciding to continue the use of traditional regulatory framework.<sup>101</sup> In 2009 however, Australia announced plans to require all nanomaterials used in the workplace to be labeled; while Canada became the first country to introduce mandatory safety reporting from nanomaterial production companies.<sup>102</sup>

Countries across the globe are struggling to decide what policies would keep pace with the market, while at the same time how to protect their citizens. Taiwan has followed the EU's lead, introducing labeling requirements for certain nano-products, while smaller nano-economies in Brazil, South Africa, Thailand, Vietnam, and Malaysia are beginning to show evidence of more stringent nanotechnology policy measures as well.<sup>103</sup> Table 7 in the Appendix compares some of the nano-ideologies of Eastern and Western cultures. From many different perspectives there seems to be increasing global collaboration and sometimes even cooperation. China PR and the US have created a global partnership in nanotechnology R&D, providing both parties with the mutual benefit of information exchange. This partnership is considered to be a primary contribution towards the rapid increase of commercialization.<sup>104</sup> Not only partnered with the US, the EU and China PR made a mutual agreement in 2002 to exchange safety testing data in order to hasten research in consumer safety. Another strong relationship, researchers predict that their regulatory system will eventually share similarities with the EU, incorporating risk assessment with management and data submission. One notable difference, however, is that in China PR the responsibility of hazards and risk determination is assigned to the scientists, whereas in the US and EU these responsibilities are appointed to the government.<sup>105</sup> A high priority for China, their R&D of this frontier technology has resulted in more than 30 research organizations involved with toxicological and environmental research, while 120 organizations are conducting general research.<sup>106</sup> Between 2005 and 2010 the government and private sector invested over 2 trillion dollars towards nanotechnology. Additionally, the Pentagon estimates that in 2007 alone, nearly 129 billion was invested into military projects with some relation to nanomaterials.<sup>107</sup>

India is also a leader in nanotechnology R&D, quickly developing their science in this field and obtaining substantial public funding. Taking the example of the US, EU, and China, India originally established research initiatives through governmental legislation. Since those investments in 2001, outsider industrial interests and research institutes have become involved, all led by the Department of Science and Technology. With most of their efforts applied to research, there is little attention onto the environment, health and safety aspects. Because of minimal communication between research fields of study, there has been little discussion of risk

governance. Although it is up to the Ministry of Environment and Forest to manage these risk-related areas, no current acts or legislation identify nanoparticles as hazards.<sup>108</sup> With a budget that started at 44 million, it has been slowing increasing alongside the pace of nanomaterial research. It has become clear that they need to develop more interdisciplinary regulatory and research framework if they expect to keep up with the pace of worldwide industries.<sup>109</sup>

### III

#### Conclusion

There are undeniably amazing benefits that emerge from the production and use of nanomaterials. They have given the United States a way to remain a leader in the global economy, and have improved our technology, our lives. But apart from the apparent observations and current applications, we know nothing about this material, propagating the question: should a potentially irreversible technology become general-purpose if so little is known? The priorities of this country and the economy have hastened our actions, leading us to a point where the appropriate time for regulation is passing by. The probability of unintentional exposure is growing exponentially, while the public awareness is minimal. Accompanied by an ignorance of the dangers makes the application of this technology one with both ‘...great promise and peril.’<sup>110</sup> Pressure from scientists onto industry; from industry onto the government; and from the public onto scientists would seem to be an effective way to encourage and implement efficient policies. Yet none of these efforts have encouraged any better U.S. regulations to date. In a world of interest groups, it is difficult to find a clear solution.

Even with the apparent negative outlook, there is indefinite research and development ahead. Some believe that any precursory regulations are bound to fail as they address no manifested risks. The immense interests and vast investments have led us to believe that ‘...no amount of government policing will work without cooperation from nanotechnology firms...[but] that voluntary efforts are a supplement to, not a substitute for, government oversight.’<sup>111</sup> If Governments are the primary investors however, then one must ask: who are the ones to regulate? Nevertheless, with a ponderous amount of this material already in our products, environment, and bodies, there is no room for policy quarrels and disputes of responsibility. Industries and governments worldwide are innovating and implementing nanotechnology rapidly. Policy and regulation must act just as fast if we hope to avoid the unidentifiable aftermath. In the preoccupation of scientists, government and industry, it will be up to the public to pressure for better oversight, and more stringent regulation before proper policy can begin. Nanotechnology may be harmless, but until that too is firmly understood, the lack of regulation is anything but.



## Notes & References

1. Colman E. Bernhardt, B., Hochella, M., Cardinale, B., Nisbet, R., Richardson, C., Yin, L. An Ecological Perspective on Nanomaterial Impacts in the Environment. *Journal on Environmental Quality*, 39, 2010, 1954-1965.
2. J. C. Davies, 'Nanolessons for Revamping Government Oversight of Technology', *Issues in Science and Technology*, 2009, 43-50.
3. G. A Kimbrell, 'Governance of Nanotechnology and Nanomaterials: Principles, Regulation, and Renegotiating the Social Contract' *Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics*, 2009, 706-723.
4. A. Fairbrother, & J. Fairbrother, 'Are environmental regulations keeping up with innovation? A Case Study of the Nanotechnology Industry' *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety*, 72, 2009, 1327-1330.
5. Kimbrell, op.cit.
6. Mihail Roco, 'The long view of nanotechnology development: the National Nanotechnology Initiative at 10 years' *Journal of Nanoparticle Research*, 13, 2011, 427-445.
7. P. Biswas, & C. Wu, 'Nanoparticles and the Environment' *Journal of the Air & Waste Management Association*, 55, 2005, 708-746.
8. Ibid.
9. J. Whitman, *The Governance of Nanotechnology*. *Science and Public Policy*, 34, 2007, 273-283.
10. Yasuyuk Motoyama, Richard Appelbaum, Rachel Parker, 'The National Nanotechnology Initiative: Federal Support for Science and Technology, or Hidden Industrial Policy?' *Technology in Society*, 33, 2011, 109-118.
11. Ibid., pp.109
12. Ibid., pp.116
13. Ibid.
14. Roco, op.cit.
15. Ibid.
16. Whitman, op.cit.
17. Ibid.
18. Bernhardt, et al., op.cit.
19. Whitman, op.cit., pp.279
20. Ibid.
21. Bernhardt, et al., op.cit.
22. Biswas,& Wu, op.cit.

23. Howard Weinberg, Anne.Galyean, MichaeLeopold, 'Evaluating Engineered Nanoparticles in Natural Waters. Trends in Analytical Chemistry, 30, 2011, 82.
24. Ibid.
25. A. Elsaesser, & V. Howard, 'Toxicology of Nanoparticles. Elsevier: Advanced Drug Delivery Reviews, 64, 2001, 129-137.
26. Valeria.Matranga, Ilaria Corsi, 'Toxic Effects of Engineered Nanoparticles in the Marine Environment: Model Organisms and Molecular Approaches. Marine Environmental Research, 76, 2012, 32-40.
27. Elsaesser, & Howard, op.cit.
28. Matranga, & Corsi, op.cit.
29. Ibid.
30. Biswas,& Wu, op.cit.
31. Ibid.
32. Fairbrother, & Fairbrother, op.cit.
33. Sergio. Andersen Manzetti, Otto. Toxicological Aspects of Nanomaterials Used in Energy Harvesting Consumer Electronics. Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews, 16, 2012, 2106-08.
34. Ibid,
35. Ibid., pp. 2108
36. Ibid.
37. Bernhardt., et al., op.cit.
38. Ibid.
39. Ibid.
40. Manzetti, & Andersen, op.cit. pp.2106
41. Ibid.
42. Ibid.
43. Bernhardt, et al., op.cit.
44. Elsaesser, & Howard, op.cit.
45. Ibid.
46. Ibid.
47. Fairbrother, & Fairbrother, op.cit.
48. A.P Jyanthi, Koen Beumer, Madhulika Bhati,, & Sujit Bhattacharya, 'Nanotechnology: 'Risk Governance' in India. Economic & Political Weekly. January 28, 2012, 1-8.
49. Biswas, & Wu, op.cit.
50. Kimbrell, op.cit.
51. Ibid.
52. Fairbrother, & Fairbrother, J. op.cit.

53. Biswas,& Wu op.cit.
54. G. Marchant, D. Sylvester, K. Abbott, Risk Management Principles for Nanotechnology. Nanoethics, 2, 2008, pp.44.
55. Bernhardt, et al., op.cit.
56. Ibid., p.1960.
57. Ibid.
58. Elsaesser, & Howard, op.cit.
59. Dalton-Brown, Sally. Global Ethics and Nanotechnology: A Comparison of the Nanoethics Environments of the EU and China. Nanoethics, 6, 2012, 137-150.
60. Morris, J., Willis, J., De Martinis, D., Hansen, B., Laursen, H., Sintes, J., et al. Science Policy Considerations for Responsible Nanotechnology Decisions. Nature Nanotechnology, 6, 2011, 73-77.Ibid. Ibid.
61. Elizabeth A Corley, Youngjae Kim, Dietram A. Scheufele. Leading US Nano-scientists' Perceptions About Media Coverage and the Public Communication of Scientific Research Findings. Journal of Nanoparticle Research, 13, 2011, 7041-7053
62. Morris, et al., op.cit./
63. Ibid. Ibid. Ibid.
64. Marchant, G., et al. op.cit. p.44.
65. Ibid. p.43-60. Ibid.
66. Fairbrother,& Fairbrother, op.cit.
67. Whitman, op.cit.
68. Morris, et al., op.cit.Ibid.
69. Fairbrother, & Fairbrother, op.cit. Ibid. Ibid.
70. Nico Jaspers,. 'Nanomaterial Safety: The Regulators' Dilemma', European Journal of Risk Regulation, 3, 2010, 270-274.
71. Motoyama, op.cit., p.111.
72. Fairbrother & Fairbrother, op.cit.
73. D.M., Bowman, & G.A Hodge, 'Governing' Nanotechnology Without Government? Science and Public Policy, 35, 2008, 475-487.Ibid. Ibid.
74. C. Selin, Negotiating Plausibility: Intervening in the Future of Nanotechnology. Science and Engineering Ethics, 17, 2011, 724. (723-737). Ibid
75. Whitman, op.cit. p.276.
76. Kimbrell, op.cit. Ibid.
77. Marchant, et al., op.cit.
78. Selin, op.cit. p.724 Ibid.
79. Whitman, op.cit. p.276.Ibid.
80. Marchant, et al., op.cit.Ibid.
81. Kimbrell, op.cit.Ibid. Ibid.

82. Bowman, & Hodge, op.cit.
83. Elen Stokes, Nanotechnology and the Products of Inherited Regulation. *Journal of Law and Society*, Vol. 39, 2012, 109. (93-112)
84. Fairbrother, & Fairbrother, op.cit.
85. Kimbrell, op.cit.
86. Jaspers, op.cit.
87. Li Tang, Philip Shapira, China's US scientific collaboration in nanotechnology: patterns and dynamics. *Scientometrics*, 88, 2011, 1-16. Dalton-Brown, op.cit.Ibid.
88. Raul Gouvea, Jonathan Linton, Manuel Montoya, Steven Walsh, Emerging Technologies and Ethics: A Race-to-the-Bottom or the Top? *Journal of Business Ethics*, 109, 2012, 553-567.
89. Jyanthi, et al., op.cit.
90. Gouvea, et al., op.cit.
91. Ibid., p.554
92. Jyanthi, et al., op.cit. p.7
93. Gouvea, et al., op.cit.Ibid.
94. Roco, op.cit.
95. Biswas, & Wu, op.cit.Ibid.
96. Kimbrell, op.cit.
97. Dalton-Brown, op.cit.

Shane Feyers  
*B.S. Candidate, Dept. of Ag. & Natural Resources*  
*University of Connecticut*

## **Women and Ecological struggle: Some Reflections on Chipko and Appiko Movement**

**Shohini Chakraborty**

### **I**

The impact of forests on environment and society is first recognized by women when deforestation was taking place in the Himalayan Mountains of India. In this perspective Chipko Movement was a revolutionary stride, made to save the Himalayan ecology and society from deforestation and gradual extinction. Women, the badly affected populace of this region were simply the strongest, dedicated and active participants of this movement. In fact, besides being an environmental movement it was a women's movement where women played a vital role against the state to press for better forestry policies so that both the Himalayan environment and its habitat remain protected.

The contemporary Chipko movement is best known for the strings of protests that had begun in the 1970s which involved a large number of peasant women. The majority of these protests occurred in the Himalayan foothills in the area of Uttarakhand, previously in the state of Uttar Pradesh.

Chipko Movement (Hug the Trees Movement) was the result of hundreds of decentralized and locality-based autonomous initiatives. Its leaders and activists have primarily been village women, working to save their means of livelihood and their communities. Men too, have been involved and some of them have given wider leadership to the movement. Chipko Movement was started by Sunderlal Bahuguna in 1973, a prominent leader of Sarvodaya Movement in the Uttarkhand region. The region, comprised of eight Himalayan districts is rich in natural resources and is exploited by the outsiders causing large-scale deforestation. The situation has worsened as the Forest Department of the state government used most of the forests for timber, paying no attention to the employment security and welfare of the local people and towards the serious ecological damage arising out of such deforestation. This has produced an adverse impact on the economic and social conditions in that part of the Himalayan region. One must note that the most affected are the local people, mainly the women. Obviously, women has played a major role in this movement and their way of hugging the trees by interposing their bodies between the trees and the contractor's axes has added a new dimension to the annals of ecological movements in India

Chipko in its literary sense is a verb in both Hindi and Garhwali language which means "to adhere". The word was used by village communities living near the forested areas of Chamoli district in Garhwal in 1973 for a particular set of actions that involved hugging trees. Ghanasyam Raturi, the Chipko poet, whose songs echoed during the movement describes the method of embracing the

trees to save them from felling. He says: "What do the forests bear? Soil, water and pure air.<sup>1</sup> Embrace the trees and save them from being felled; the property of our hills, save them from being looted."

One should ask --who were the protestors and why did they protest against what appeared to be completely a normal way of the Forest Department activities? This question is responded to differently by various Chipko<sup>2</sup> narratives. Some say that the protestors were mainly related with women who were concerned with protecting the ecology of their areas, others think that small-scale timber extractors in the district wanted the contracts themselves, or that a petition made by the local artisanal co-operatives rejected by the Forest Department in favour of more lucrative contracts with the timber merchants.<sup>3</sup> But, no one can deny the fact that one of the Chipko's most salient features was the mass participation of women villagers. As the backbone of Uttarakhand's agrarian economy, women were most directly hit by environmental degradation and deforestation, and thus spontaneously connected the issue with their concern for clean and safe environment use of forest resources for livelihood. Gaura Devi an elderly woman, who is the head of the village Mahila Mangal Dal, mobilized village women for the movement and when company men marched to cut the trees Gaura Devi stood on the way and challenged by saying, "the forest nurtures us like a mother; you will only be able to use your axes on it but you have to use them first on us." <sup>4</sup>

Two remarkable moments are generally cited as having marked the beginning of the Chipko movement. The first of these is largely credited to the activity of the Dasholi Gram Swaraj Sangh (DGSS), a local cooperative, based in Gopeshwar, Chamoli, which promoted local community forest industries. Beginning in 1973, the DGSS organized a number of small mobilizations in protest against the contractor system in which the Indian Government via the Forestry Department, held title to forests that were preferentially leased out to international or extra-regional corporations. The DGSS mobilized protests in reaction to the subsequent denial of their request for a lease for access to twelve trees needed for the manufacture of furniture and agricultural implements for local populations. The second event often interpreted as marking the beginning of Chipko movement occurred in Reni village, when a group of women first employed the "tree-hugging"---the Chipko tactic to prevent the logging of trees in a local forest. After this event, women's role in the movement became much more prominent and the prevention of all forms of forest scarcities became central to the goals of the movement. Of course, which event one regards as having started the movement seems to depend almost entirely upon how one interprets the movement itself. For those who, along with Ramachandra Guha, define the Chipko movement as an effort to re-appropriate forest resources and secure peasant access to forest goods, the activities of the DGSS in encouraging widespread protest and holding educational and organization meetings against the contractor system are obviously foundational to the movement.<sup>5</sup> On the other hand, for those who like Vandana Shiva view Chipko andolan as a feminist movement thinks it as an attempt to prevent all tree felling through the use of a tree hugging strategy that called attention to the relationship between humans and nature, the protests at Reni marked the "true" beginning of movement.

In 1973 the movement began in Chamoli district that spread throughout the Uttarakhand Himalayas by the end of the decade. In Tehri district, Chipko activists went on to protest against the limestone mining in the Dehradun hills in the 1980s as well as the Tehri dam, before founding the Beej Bachao Andolan or Save the Seeds movement that continues to the present day. In Kumaon region, Chipko took on a more radical hue, combining with the general movement for separate statehood for Uttarakhand. As revenue from deforestation increasingly accrued at the timber processing centers in the plains states, male villagers were sometimes forced to leave the Uttarakhand in order to find employment elsewhere. Many village households gradually became

reliant upon remittances from these emigrated workers. The absence of so many working-age males left women with the sole responsibility of "running the home, looking after the children, bearing the drudgery of agricultural work, cattle care and bringing fuel, fodder and water from long distances".<sup>6</sup> As rates of deforestation worsened, women were spending over seven hours per day collecting food and fuel. In addition to their other responsibilities, this made the average woman's working hours between 14 and 16 hours each day. As it became increasingly difficult for women to secure their means of survival by collecting food, fuel and fodder, they became desperate for other avenues. According to a Chipko movement literature, few women were driven to suicide, some lost family members, and many joined the movement to work for meaningful change. As one Chipko activist described: "When we could not obtain the wood to cook even the little grain we get, we had to resort to a movement"<sup>7</sup> Chipko, for Vandana Shiva appears to be women's ecology movement, a resurgence of women's power.

## II

The impact of Chipko movement continues to be felt nationally and internationally in the debates on Indian environmentalism and environmentally sound developmental policies and programs of the state. Chipko-like tactics and messages are also adopted in other struggles and the story of the movement is discerned as a symbol of grassroots opposition to the development model of the West. In many watersheds the denuded forest cover has been reclaimed, biomass production has gone up, and lost prosperity has been gradually reestablished. Environmental awareness increased dramatically in the 1990s in India -- and so did the number of organized lobbies to champion the cause of a cleaner environment.. As a result, the government introduced legislation that aimed to curb pollution, but the enforcement mechanism seems to be been little lackadaisical. As early as in August 1994, the Chipko huggers wanted to stop the construction of the dam at Tehri <sup>8</sup>because the protestors claim that it will uproot trees and create regular flood.. Today, although most of the state legislators respect the peasants and the mountain inhabitants to prevent future risks, the Chipko "tree huggers" are still very active to prevent any crisis in future<sup>9</sup>.

Women have undoubtedly played a significant role in this movement. But it would be inappropriate if in this context the role of the most prominent leader Sunderlal Bahuguna, a Gandhian activist and philosopher is not taken into account for a proper analysis of the background

of the movement. In 1981-83 Bahuguna's appeal to Mrs. Gandhi resulted in banning green-felling and his 5,000-kilometre trans-Himalayan foot march was crucial in spreading the Chipko message in many parts of the world. In late 1980s, Bahuguna joined the campaign which already for many years had been opposing the construction of a proposed Himalayan dam on the river near his birthplace in Tehri. In 1989 he began the first of a series of hunger strikes to draw political attention to the dangers posed by the dam and in due course Chipko Movement gave birth to the Save Himalaya Movement<sup>10</sup>.

Bahuguna ended a 45-day fast in 1995 when the Indian government promised a review of the Tehri dam project. But the promise was not kept and the following year he committed himself to another fast, only broken after 74 days when the Prime Minister gave a personal undertaking to conduct a thorough review, largely on Bahuguna's terms. The veteran environmentalist, then in his 70th year, told the Prime Minister that the Himalayan glaciers were receding at an alarming rate. If this was not checked, the glacier feeding the Ganges would disappear within 100 years. Bahuguna remarks: "We in the Himalaya are facing a crisis of survival due to the suicidal activities being carried out in the name of development... The monstrous Tehri dam is a symbol of this... There is a need for a new long-term policy to protect the dying Himalayas. I do not want to see the death of the most sacred river of the world - the Ganga - for short-term economic gains." <sup>8</sup>.

Chipko movement culminated in several significant movements leading to a number of positive results. From this perspective it is very interesting to study the work of "Beej Bachao Andolan" (Save the Seeds Movement-SSM) in Henvaighati region (Tehri Garhwal District). More or less the same core group of activists was earlier involved in Chipko Movement (Hug the Trees Movement), Anti Liquor Movement and the Movement to Stop Destructive Mining Practices. However, in Henvaighati<sup>9</sup>, the slogan is ---"which gifts do forest bear: Soil, water and fresh air".

Thus, the ecological issues came to the fore-front and the issues were tied up with the long-term protection of rural livelihood. Hence, the demand for a ban on felling trees got momentum and was finally accepted by the government. Thus, within the movement, the movement in Henvaighati, particularly the action to save Advani forest, marks an important watershed in highlighting the ecological consciousness of the local community in which women played a leading role. The fact that ordinary villagers participate actively and courageously in the movement which proves that there were no real contradictions in the movement for the protection of environment, and for a sustained and long-term protection of livelihood of the villagers. Henvaighati is one of the few regions where the word "Chipko" is not just a symbol; a large number of villagers actually hugged trees when the contractor's men tried to fell trees.

Later, the movement resisted the onslaught of mining practices (to get limestone) in ecologically fragile and sensitive zones which would have played havoc on the green fields, water springs and rivulets ---the lifeline setting of this region. This movement was successful by and large in keeping away the mining contractors although the lease of one of them has not yet expired. Later, these activists from Henvaighati also went to other villages badly hit by mining works and they have



contributed to saving the environment and ecology of villages like Nahim Kala in Dehradun district.

Chipko movement took place in several parts of Uttarakhand but the movement in Henvaighati had a very special place. Before the movement more emphasis was given to increase the economic benefits of forests to the local people. So, at that time ecological issues were not given adequate importance. But the "Save the Seeds Movement" (SSM) got the best response from women farmers. In these hill villages men are used to plough fields but most of other farming works are done by women. Seeds are their concern more than that of men. But men go to the market, block and the headquarters where they are told about improved seeds and the subsidies accompanying them. So men bring them home and ask women to sow those seeds; and not knowing much about the new seeds the women sow for growing them. Vijay Jardhari, a senior activist of SSM says: "After some years women regret this decision but by then it is not easy to get back to the old varieties."<sup>10</sup> SSM activists held a large number of meetings with women farmers when they were invited by the Mahila Samakhya Programme for this purpose.

### III

. It should be noted that the impact of Chipko movement did not remain confined within the Himalayan region of Uttarakhand. Almost all over the country this movement has already transmitted its impact as found in the upsurge of Appiko movement, a radical movement founded on the doctrine of environmental conservation in India. It is found that "Chipko Andolan" . in Uttarakhand in the Himalayas inspired the villagers of the Uttara Kannada district of Karnataka Province in southern India to kickstart a similar movement to save their forests. In September 1983, men, women and children of Salkani "hugged the trees" in Kalase forest. (The local term for "hugging" in Kannada is "appiko") Appiko Andolan gave birth to a new awareness all over southern India.

In 1950, Uttara Kannada district forest covered more than 81 per cent of its geographical area. The government, declared this forest district a "backward" area and initiated the process of development. There are major industries - pulp and paper mill, a plywood factory and a chain of hydroelectric dams sprouted in the area to harness the rivers. These industries have overexploited the forest resources, and the dams have submerged huge-forest and agricultural areas. The forest had shrunk to nearly 25 per cent of the district's area by 1980. The local population, especially the poorest groups, was displaced by the dams. The conversion of the natural mixed forests into teak and eucalyptus plantations dried up the water sources, directly affecting the forest dwellers. In a nutshell, the three major p's - paper, plywood and power - which were intended for the development of the people, have resulted in a fourth p: poverty. <sup>11</sup>

Following the footsteps of Chipko movement Appiko Movement also tries to save the Western Ghats by spreading its roots all over southern India. The movement's objectives can be classified into three major areas. First, the Appiko Movement is struggling to save the remaining tropical

forests in the Western Ghats. Second, it is making a modest attempt to restore the greenery to denuded areas. Third, it is striving to propagate the idea of rational utilization in order to reduce the pressure on forest resources. To save, to grow and to use rationally - popularly known in Kannada as Ubsu ("save"), Belesu ("grow") and Balasu ("rational use") - are the movement's popular slogans.<sup>12</sup> The thrust of the Appiko Movement in carrying out its work reveals the constructive phase of the people's movement. Through this constructive phase, depleted natural resources are rebuilt. This process promotes sharing of resources in an egalitarian way to help the forest dwellers. The movement's aim is to establish a harmonious relationship between people and nature, to redefine the term "development" so that a genuine concern for environmental security can form the basis for a sustainable development.

#### IV

The success achieved by these movements has led to similar protests in other parts of the country. From their origins as a spontaneous protest against logging abuses in Uttar Pradesh in the Himalayas, supporters of both the movements, mainly village women, have successfully banned the felling of trees in a number of regions and have influenced natural resource policy in India. As a diverse movement with diverse experiences, strategies, and motivations, Chipko and Appiko movement have inspired environmentalists both nationally and globally and have contributed substantially to the emerging philosophy of eco-feminism and deep ecology and fields of community-based conservation and sustainable mountain development<sup>12</sup>.

In a throwback to the Chipko movement to save trees in the seventies, the Rakhi festival has turned into a rallying point for hundreds of village women to make a pledge for protecting their 'brother' trees that are to be axed. Women from villages in Sirmour district in Himachal Pradesh's tie rakhis -- a sacred thread symbolizing the brother-sister bond while the construction of the dam, likely to inundate their habitat ---is for providing drinking water to the dwellers of New Delhi. It is a noble way to draw the attention of the dam authorities to the voluminous damage to biodiversity in the area with its construction," said Rukhmani Devi of Mohtu village, situated on the banks of the Giri river.<sup>13</sup>

Sunderlal Bahuguna, the leading Chipko activist, remarked "The solution of present-day problems lies in the re-establishment of a harmonious relationship between man and nature. To keep this relationship permanent we will have to digest the definition of real development: development is synonymous with culture. When we sublimate nature in a way that we achieve peace, happiness, prosperity and ultimately, fulfillment along with satisfying our basic needs, we march towards culture." <sup>14</sup> . . It can be inferred that "Chipko" is a movement about village self-reliance and self-determination; it is a movement about an unwavering confidence in the innate wisdom and capabilities of the Garhwali people, especially women. It is also about the basic rights of people to use and manage the resources they need for survival. Being strengthened by women's increasing ecological consciousness the trajectory of this movement in India shows the way and appears to

be the fulcrum for the betterment of the conditions of work, health or education of the marginal people in which women constitute a significant part.

## Notes & References

1. Haripriya Rangan, *Of Myth and Movements: Rewriting Chipko into Himalayan History*, Verso, London, February 2001, p. 5.
2. Ibid., p. 20.
3. Ibid., p. 20.
4. . Ramchandra Guha, *The Unquiet Woods: Ecological Change and Peasant Resistance*, University of California Press, Berkeley, 1989, p. 15
5. Ibid., . p. 16.
6. . Vandana Shiva, *Ecology And The Politics Of Survival*, Sage publications, New Delhi, 1991, p.135.
7. Marianne H Marchand, *Feminism Post Modernism Development*, Routledge, New York , 2005, p. 173.
8. Sunderlal Bahuguna, *A Novel Movement for Establishment Of Cordial Relationship Between Man and Nature*, Chipko Information Centre, 1980.
9. Henvaighati is one of the few regions where the word "Chipko" is not just a symbol; a large number of villagers actually hugged trees when the contractor"s men tried to fell trees. This happened in the forest of Salet and Advani in 1977-78. In Advani even though a large police force was summoned to assist the contractor, still the contractor"s men could not cut trees and villagers, particularly women, simply clasped trees and it was impossible to cut trees without first cutting or perhaps even killing them.
10. Prayaga.org/documents/finalpaper-complete.pdf, *Chipko"s Quiet Legacy: Forest Rights, Women"s Empowerment, People"s Institutions and New Urban Struggles In Uttarkhand, India*, Rajiv Rawat, July 21, 2004.

11. <http://www.outlookindia.com> ("Once there was a river"), Srinivasaraju Sugatha, Outlook, India 6 October, 2012. Sugatha Srinivasaraju, Once there was a river, Outlook India, 6 October 2012.
12. [www.hindusthantimes.com/india-news](http://www.hindusthantimes.com/india-news) New Chipko movement, Vishal Gulati, 3 August, 2009.
13. Sunderlal Bahuguna, "Fire in the heart firewood on the back" , published by Parvatiya Navjeevan Mandal for Save the Himalayas Movement, Tehri-Garhwal India, 1997, p. 27.

Shohini Chakraborty  
*Department of Political Science*  
*Maharaja Sris Chandra College, Kolkata*

## Right to Die: Slippery Slopes of Ethical Dialectics

Sourav Madhur Dey

**"One should die proudly when it is no longer possible to live proudly" - Friedrich Nietzsche**

### **Abstract**

*Medical science has brought remarkable changes to our lives. New life-sustaining techniques and practices are forcing hospitals to ask questions that never needed to be asked before. Foremost of these is the question, "How far do we go to save a life? ". Other questions challenge the very notion of what it means to be a doctor. A doctor's commitment has traditionally been to sustain life, to comfort and to heal. Today, though, physicians are able to sustain lives which have no hope of ever again being meaningful, which brings us to the question: when suffering is immeasurable, and a patient's condition terminal, should doctors be permitted to end a patient's life? Euthanasia of humans as a topic is often highly-charged" emotionally, politically, and morally. Terminology and laws change over time, geographically and globally, causing a great deal of confusion. Syndromes like persistent vegetative state and the immense suffering caused by prolonged cancers have many people, including some doctors, wondering if it wouldn't be more humane for physicians to do more than merely withdraw treatment, but to actually assist in hastening death. The purpose of this article is to explore these questions, to discover their implications and to help foster a clearer understanding of the ethical issues surrounding terminal health care in our technologically advanced society.*

After exchanging goodbyes, he brought his wife a cup of coffee laced with secobarbital and codeine. She drank, and he waited. If the drugs failed, or made her uncomfortable, he was prepared to smother her with pillows. This is the scene Derek Humphry<sup>1</sup> recounts for the world in the book *Jean's Way*, the story of how he helped his wife commit suicide at age 42 during the last stages of her battle with breast cancer. Five years later, with co-author and second wife Ann Wickett, Humphry founded the National Hemlock Society, an organization dedicated to the cause of legalizing doctor-assisted suicide for the terminally ill. In the advent of delving into what has unfurled into one of the most controversial issues that could have tremendous ramifications on basic ethical concepts and most importantly, the sanctity of life, the precious words of Thomas Jefferson strike a chord. "The care of human life and happiness and not their destruction is the first and only legitimate object of good governance.",<sup>2</sup> In juxtaposition, the words "Right to Die", evoke an exactly opposite sentiment. How can it be a right if you are using it to give up your rights? The above right has been used as a guise or a camouflage to include various concepts that are opposed to preservation of life. Euthanasia, Physician Assisted Suicide (PAS), Suicide, though conceptually different, are species of the same genre. The right to life supersedes - in Western

moral and legal systems - all other rights. It overrules the right to one's body, to comfort, to the avoidance of pain, or to ownership of property. Given such lack of equivocation, the amount of dilemmas and controversies surrounding the right to life is, therefore, surprising. When there is a clash between equally potent rights - for instance, the conflicting rights to life of two people - we can decide among them randomly (by flipping a coin, or casting dice). Alternatively, we can add and subtract rights in a somewhat macabre arithmetic. Thus, if the continued life of an embryo or a fetus threatens the mother's life - that is, assuming, controversially, that both of them have an equal right to life - we can decide to kill the fetus. By adding to the mother's right to life her right to her own body we outweigh the foetus',s right to life. The right to life - at least as far as human beings are concerned - is a rarely questioned fundamental moral principle. In Western cultures, it is assumed to be inalienable and indivisible (i.e., monolithic). Yet, it is neither. Even if we accept the axiomatic - and therefore arbitrary - source of this right, we are still faced with intractable dilemmas. All said, the right to life may be nothing more than a cultural construct, dependent on social mores, historical contexts, and exegetic systems.

The debate over "end-of-life issues", raises fundamental questions: Who decides whether a life is worth living or not? Many people say they would rather die than suffer in great pain, or be trapped in a vegetative state. Should people have the right to decide when and how they will die? Should others -- their families, their doctors, the government -- be able to decide for them? Is euthanasia -- the supposedly merciful killing of the terminally ill -- an act of kindness prompted by a sense of mercy and respect for an individual's wishes? Or is it an act of murder and a violation of the Hippocratic Oath? If legally recognized, would physician-assisted suicide permit dying people a measure of control over the timing and manner of their death? Or would it lead to a slippery slope of neglect for the old, the poor, the disabled and those who are emotionally distraught or seriously ill? Would the right to die become the duty to die when living would be too costly for patients and their survivors? What are the religious and moral questions here? For people in many faiths, these decisions touch on their most deeply held belief that life and death should be left to God, not human beings. Others argue that life is to be cherished and not abandoned, no matter the circumstances. Are there other alternatives? Advocates of palliative care say the real problem is that terminal patients don't get enough pain relief and emotional support. Many of the terminally ill suffer from treatable clinical depression. Others get less pain relief than they should because doctors are reluctant to use painkillers aggressively enough. Over the last few decades, a network of hospices has grown up specifically to make terminal patients as comfortable as possible in their last months.

Euthanasia, whether in a medical setting (hospital, clinic, hospice) or not (at home), have two different usages. The first is sometimes called the "narrow construal of euthanasia.", On this view euthanasia is equivalent to mercy killing. Thus, if a physician injects a patient with a drug with the intent to kill the patient, that would be an act of euthanasia, but if the physician allows the patient to die by withholding some excessively burdensome treatment, that does not count as an example of euthanasia. The second view is sometimes called the "broad construal of euthanasia", and includes within its definition of "euthanasia", direct intervention (active euthanasia) or by withholding life-prolonging measures and resources (passive euthanasia), either at the express or

implied request of that person (voluntary euthanasia), or in the absence of such approval (non-voluntary euthanasia). Involuntary euthanasia - where the individual wishes to go on living - is a euphemism for murder.<sup>3</sup> Most forms of euthanasia are, indeed, motivated by (some say: misplaced) mercy. Not so others. The traditional view holds that it is always wrong to intentionally kill an innocent human being, but that given certain circumstances it is permissible to withhold or withdraw treatment and allow a patient to die.

A more recent, radical view embraced by groups such as the Hemlock Society and the Society for the Right to Die denies that there is a morally significant distinction between passive and active euthanasia (defined above) that allows the former and forbids the latter. The arguments against killing someone who hasn't expressed a wish to die revolve around the right to life. People are assumed to value their life, cherish it, and protect it. Euthanasia - especially the non-voluntary forms - amounts to depriving someone (as well as their nearest and dearest) of something they value.<sup>4</sup>

Rights - whether moral or legal - impose obligations or duties on third parties towards the right-holder. One has a right AGAINST other people and thus can prescribe to them certain obligatory behaviors and proscribe certain acts or omissions. Rights and duties are two sides of the same ethical coin. This duality confuses people. They often erroneously identify rights with their attendant duties or obligations, with the morally decent, or even with the morally permissible. One's rights inform other people how they MUST behave towards one - not how they SHOULD or OUGHT to act morally. Moral behavior is not dependent on the existence of a right. Obligations are. To complicate matters further, many apparently simple and straightforward rights are amalgams of more basic moral or legal principles. To treat such rights as unities is to mistreat them. Take the right to life. It is a compendium of no less than eight distinct rights: the right to be brought to life, the right to be born, the right to have one's life maintained, the right not to be killed, the right to have one's life saved, the right to save one's life (wrongly reduced to the right to self-defence), the right to terminate one's life, and the right to have one's life terminated. None of these rights is self-evident, or unambiguous, or universal, or immutable, or automatically applicable. It is safe to say, therefore, that these rights are not primary as hitherto believed - but derivatives.

It is commonly accepted that where two equally potent values clash, society steps in as an arbiter. The right to material welfare (food, shelter, basic possessions) often conflicts with the right to own private property and to benefit from it. Society strikes a fine balance by, on the one hand, taking from the rich and giving to the poor (through redistributive taxation) and, on the other hand, prohibiting and punishing theft and looting. Euthanasia involves a few such finely-balanced values: the sanctity of life vs. personal autonomy, the welfare of the many vs. the welfare of the individual, the relief of pain vs. the prolongation and preservation of life. Why can't society step in as arbiter in these cases as well? Moreover, what if a person is rendered incapable of expressing his preferences with regards to the manner and timing of his death - should society step in (through the agency of his family or through the courts or legislature) and make the decision for him? In a variety of legal situations, parents, court-appointed guardians, custodians, and conservators act for,

on behalf of, and in lieu of underage children, the physically and mentally challenged and the disabled. Why not here?

We must distinguish between four situations: i. the patient foresaw the circumstances and provided an advance directive (living will), asking explicitly for his life to be terminated when certain conditions are met; ii. the patient did not provide an advanced directive but expressed his preference clearly before he was incapacitated. The risk here is that self-interested family members may lie; iii. the patient did not provide an advance directive and did not express his preference aloud - but the decision to terminate his life is commensurate with both his character and with other decisions he made; and iv. there is no indication, however indirect, that the patient wishes or would have wished to die had he been capable of expression but the patient is no longer a "person", and, therefore, has no interests to respect, observe, and protect. Moreover, the patient is a burden to himself, to his nearest and dearest, and to society at large. Euthanasia is the right, just, and most efficient thing to do. Society can (and often does) legalize euthanasia in the first case and, subject to rigorous fact checking, in the second and third cases. To prevent economically motivated murder disguised as euthanasia, non-voluntary and involuntary euthanasia should be banned outright.

Proponents of "Right to die", groups argue that, a patient in unbearable agony and excruciating pain or "terminally ill", the saving- grace is euthanasia on compassionate grounds. It is submitted that the problem here is the term "terminally ill", has no precise definition. For instance, Jack Kervorkian, a famous proponent of euthanasia, defined "terminal illness", as "any disease that curtails life even for a day",<sup>5</sup> Some laws define "terminal", as one from which death will occur in a "relatively short time", or "within a span of six months",<sup>6</sup> The nub of the point is that all these definitions scream ambiguity and medical experts have acknowledged that it is virtually impossible to predict the life expectancy of a particular individual. Interestingly, euthanasia activists have dropped references to terminal illness, replacing them with such phrases as "gentle landing", "hopelessly ill", "desperately ill", and "meaningless life.",<sup>7</sup> It is reinforced that this issue hovers around an invaluable asset called "life". Just as a mistaken diagnosis is possible, so is a mistaken prognosis. It must be remembered that death is final and a chance of error too great to approve the practice of euthanasia.

On the flip side of the coin, an undeniable transition is evidenced in the augmentation of medicine and technology. What was excessive in medicine fifty years ago may be ordinary and routine today. The idea here is that what is excessively burdensome and offers little hope for one may be less burdensome and more hopeful for a second patient in a different state of health. A startling revelation..... Research has shown that ninety per cent of the pain can be alleviated by proper pain control methods. Appropriate care can make a huge difference. This goes to show that medicine and technological breakthroughs have a fitting reply to almost every problem and the extent of medical commitment is unassailable. In contradistinction, if every terminal patient were prodded to a "gentle landing", impetus to research, which is the answer to curative medicine, would be foiled. If legalized, doctors would be forced to perform such acts against their consent that would amount to a violation of the Hippocratic Oath. Incidentally, it was as early as 400 B.C., when the



renowned Greek physician stipulated in his Oath..... "I will neither give a deadly drug to any one.if asked for it, nor will I make a suggestion to this effect.",<sup>8</sup>

The fact remains that the practice of euthanasia has been ostracized since time immemorial and Oregon, Belgium and The Netherlands are the only jurisdictions in the world where laws specifically permit euthanasia or assisted suicide. It may be pertinent to mention that the most vital point is the repercussions that could take place once something as controversial is legalized. The matter is not an issue of force but an issue of the way laws can be expanded once something is declared legal. In India, where abuse of the law is the rule rather than the exception and where conniving relatives clamor to lap up an heirloom, the above-mentioned argument holds great weightage.

In India, the sanctity of life has been placed on the highest pedestal. "The right to life", under Article 21 of the Constitution has received the widest possible interpretation under the able hands of the judiciary and rightly so. This right is inalienable and is inherent in us. It cannot and is not conferred upon us. This vital point seems to elude all those who keep on clamouring for the "Right to Die",. The stance taken by the judiciary in this regard is unquestionable. In *Gian Kaur vs. State of Punjab*, a five judge Constitutional Bench held that the "right to life", is inherently inconsistent with the "right to die", as is "death", with "life",. In furtherance, the right to life, which includes right to live with human dignity, would mean the existence of such a right up to the natural end of life. It may further include "death with dignity", but such existence should not be confused with unnatural extinction of life curtailing natural span of life. In progression of the above, the constitutionality of Section 309 of the I.P.C, which makes "attempt to suicide", an offence, was upheld, overruling the judgment in *P. Rathinam's* case. The factor of immense significance to be noted here is that suicide, euthanasia, mercy killing and the like amount to unnatural ebbing of life. This decision thereby overruling *P.Rathinam's* case establishes that the "Right to life", not only precludes the "right to die", but also the "right to kill.", Interestingly in *P.Rathinam's* case, even when a Division bench affirmed the view in *M.S Dubal v. State of Maharashtra* that the "right to life", provided by the Constitution may be said to bring into its purview, the right not to live a forced life, the plea that euthanasia be legalized was discarded. It was held that as euthanasia involves the intervention of a third person, it would indirectly amount to a person aiding or abetting the killing of another, which would be inviting Section 306 of the I.P.C.<sup>9</sup> In *Naresh Marotrao Sakhre v. Union of India*, *Lodha J.* affirmed that "Euthanasia or mercy killing is nothing but homicide whatever the circumstances in which it is effected."<sup>10</sup>

The above inferences lead to one irresistible conclusion i.e. any form that involves unnatural termination of life, whether an attempt to suicide, abetment to suicide/assisted suicide or euthanasia, is illegal. The fact that even an attempt to suicide is punishable goes to show the extent of credibility accorded to the sanctity of life and the right to life as a whole. This apart, the decriminalization of euthanasia is unworkable in the Indian perspective, even on humanitarian grounds, as it involves a third person. Though, there has been no legislation pertaining to euthanasia in India, the term keeps on coming back for public approval like a recurring decimal.

Venkatesh, a 25-year-old muscular dystrophia patient, wanted to be granted the right to die. He sought to enforce the right so that he could donate organs before they were affected by his illness. The plea was rejected a day before his death by the Andhra Pradesh High Court. The court ruled that the petition sought to violate the Transplantation of Human Organs Act, 1995, which had no provisions that allowed individuals to donate organs before they were brain dead. The court's caution in this case is understandable considering the implications of easing restrictions in organ transplant. However, the order indirectly reiterated the stated legal position that an individual had no right to end his life voluntarily. Our Constitution guarantees the right to life. The right to life is incomplete without the right to death. The karma of life is a wheel that is completed only when birth is complemented by death. The right to die is built into the right to live. The state has every obligation to legally ensure the protection of life; protection in this case limited to prevention of homicide. However, the Indian state has expanded its territory to be the arbiter even in cases of suicide and euthanasia. Section 309 of the Indian Penal Code holds suicide a criminal act while euthanasia or mercy killing has been left open for debate.<sup>11</sup>

Assisted suicide laws around the world are clear in some nations but unclear "“ if they exist at all "“ in others. Just because a country has not defined its criminal code on this specific action does not mean all assisters will go free. It is a complicated state of affairs. A great many people instinctively feel that suicide and assisted suicide are such individual acts of freedom and free will that they assume there are no legal prohibitions. This fallacy has brought many people into trouble with the law.<sup>12</sup>The only four places that today openly and legally, authorize active assistance in dying of patients, are: Oregon (since 1997, physician-assisted suicide only); Switzerland (1941, physician and non-physician assisted suicide only); Belgium (2002, permits 'euthanasia' but does not define the method; Netherlands (voluntary euthanasia and physician-assisted suicide lawful since April 2002 but permitted by the courts since 1984).<sup>13</sup> A recent Gallup Poll survey showed that 60 per cent of Americans supported euthanasia.<sup>14</sup>Attempts to legalize euthanasia and assisted suicide resulted in ballot initiatives and "legislation bills,€<sup>14</sup> within the United States of America in the last 20 years. For example, Washington voters saw Ballot Initiative 119 in 1991, California placed Proposition 161 on the ballot in 1992, Michigan included Proposal B in their ballot in 1998, and Oregon passed the Death with Dignity Act.<sup>15</sup> .

Some of the differences in public attitudes towards the right to die debate stem from the diversity of religion. Of the religious groups that were studied, among Christians, conservative Protestants (including Southern Baptists, Pentecostals, and Evangelicals) were more opposed to euthanasia than non-affiliates and the other religious groups. Moderate Protestants (including Lutherans and Methodists) and Catholics (not necessarily faithful to church's teachings) showed mixed views concerning end of life decisions in general. Both of these groups showed less support than non-affiliates, but were less opposed to it than conservative Protestants. The liberal Protestants (including some Presbyterians and Episcopalians) were the most supportive of the groups. In general, they had looser affiliations with religious institutions and their views were similar to those of non-affiliates.<sup>16</sup> In Theravada Buddhism, in caring for the terminally ill, one is forbidden to treat a patient so as to bring on death faster than would occur if the disease were allowed to run its

natural course.<sup>17</sup> In Hinduism, death has been referred to both as the ultimate truth and as one of the stages in human life. In the Bhagavad Gita, Lord Krishna urges Arjuna to fulfill his destiny or Dharma, and not to worry about consequences as death levels all: whatever you give and take, you do it on this earth. In Hindu mythology, some humans were given the right to choose the time of their deaths. This was awarded to only the most pure in heart, suggesting that Hinduism does not disapprove of euthanasia./p>

Ethnic studies in case of euthanasia have shown European-Americans to be more accepting than African-Americans. They are also more likely to have advance directives and to use other end of life measures.<sup>18</sup> African-Americans are almost three times more likely to oppose euthanasia than European-Americans. The main reason for this discrepancy is attributed to the lower levels of trust in the medical establishment.<sup>19</sup> Researchers believe that past history of abuses towards minority in medicine (such as the Tuskegee Syphilis Study) have made minority groups less trustful of the level of care they receive. Studies have also found that there are significant disparities in the medical treatment and pain management that European-Americans and other Americans receive.<sup>20</sup> Among African-Americans, education correlates to support for euthanasia. African-Americans without a four-year degree are twice as likely to oppose euthanasia as those with at least that much education. Level of education, however, does not significantly influence other racial groups in the US. Some researchers suggest that African-Americans tend to be more religious, a claim that is difficult to substantiate and define.<sup>21</sup> Only African and European Americans have been studied in extensive detail. Although it has been found that non European-American groups are less supportive of euthanasia than European-Americans, there is still some ambiguity as to what degree this is true. A recent Gallup Poll found that 84 per cent of males supported euthanasia compared to 64 per cent of females.<sup>22</sup> Some cite the prior studies showing that women have a higher level of religiosity and moral conservatism as an explanation. Within both genders, there are differences in attitudes towards euthanasia due to other influences. For example, one study found that African-American women are 2.37 times more likely to oppose euthanasia than European-American women. African-American men are 3.61 times more likely to oppose euthanasia than European-American men.<sup>23</sup>/p>

Physicians continue to face a pointed dilemma. "For over 2,000 years, the predominant responsibility of the physician has not been to preserve life at all costs but to serve the patient's needs while respecting the patient's autonomy and dignity," the American Medical Association said in one legal brief.<sup>24</sup> But the AMA opposes physician-assisted suicide. The Hippocratic Oath still states: "To please no one will I prescribe a deadly drug, or give advice which may cause his death."<sup>25</sup> A poll taken among Oregon physicians provides one indication of the dilemma: While 60 per cent say physician-assisted suicide should be legal, only 46 per cent said they would be willing to prescribe lethal medicine. An important and an opposite trend was observed as an extension to my PhD work on cancer patients and their environing care, conducted in Cancer Centre Welfare Home & Research Institute, Thakurpukur, Kolkata. From the responses of the doctors it was revealed that most of Doctors are not in favour of Euthanasia, as they feel that one's right to live can not be taken away by anyone, even by the person himself, as it would be suicidal

in nature and it may also give birth to wrong notions about the concept and may mislead the whole concept in the long run. 30 per cent believe that if a disease and its", treatment has no positive outcome as such and is increasing the pain of the patient; he has every right to seek to make a respectable end to his life. But in that case also there are obvious complexities. First, pain or incurability is a degree-loaded term and their respective intensity is relative. So can there be any broad, all encompassing and generalized line of tolerance beyond which euthanasia will be permitted? Answer is to a greater probability unknown. Moreover different doctors have different approach towards the same disease. Some are conservatives, some adventurous. Consensus on the degree of incurability is very hard to find. So the starting point is yet unclear, undecided. This very lack of generalizing can find a tough road through legislations.

The core principles of medical ethics date from antiquity and are commonly labeled "beneficence", and "nonmaleficence.", The principle of beneficence holds that physicians should aim to "benefit the sick,", while nonmaleficence means to "do no harm", in the process. These principles are reflected in medicine",s chief goal, which is to help the sick by returning them to health and lessening the suffering and decline that is often associated with their diseases.<sup>26</sup> The central question in the care of the dying is the appropriate use of life-sustaining interventions. In some cases, there is little or no benefit to be gained by these interventions, and yet the potential for significant harm commonly remains. Ordinarily, when the benefits are clearly outweighed by the potential harms of intervention, the use of that intervention is properly regarded as inappropriate. But who has the ultimate authority to decide the matter of appropriateness? Should it be the physician alone? Should inappropriateness be decided at the policy level? From an ethics point of view, the patient is the one to decide about forgoing life-sustaining interventions, based on the third ethical principle "" patient autonomy. The principle of autonomy, or respect for persons, has its roots in analytic philosophy and has become synonymous with the concept of self-determination.<sup>27</sup>This concept was expressed well by Justice Cardozo in a famous medical malpractice case: "Every human being of adult years and sound mind has a right to determine what shall be done with his own body.",<sup>28</sup> The principle of autonomy lies at the root of the medical and legal doctrine of informed consent and also at the root of decisions by patients to forgo life-sustaining treatment at the end of life.,

The fourth ethical principle is that of distributive justice, which guides the fair allocation of medical resources. Justice considerations arise in end-of-life care when one compares the high cost of marginally beneficial end-of-life care to the lack of funding for the basic care of a large portion of our country",s residents. While the issues surrounding medical costs and the design of just health care systems are complex and important, they require a social policy level approach and should not be left simply to the physician at the bedside. The principle of justice is mentioned to set it apart from end-of-life ethics decisions at the bedside. In the current climate of increasing desire for a dignified death, if a better job were done of honoring patients", wishes to forgo expensive life-prolonging intervention, then both justice and autonomy would be served.<sup>29</sup> In most cases, ethical treatment decisions should be shared between physician and patient. The physician has an obligation to inform the patient of established treatment options and then to recommend the

treatment he or she believes is in the patient",s best medical interest.<sup>30</sup>The patient then accepts the physician",s recommendation and consents to treatment, chooses an option other than the recommended one, or chooses to forgo the treatments altogether. In each case, the physician fulfils the ethical obligation to benefit the patient while minimizing harm.

Much of the debate around euthanasia has centered around the "slippery slope", argument "" the view that once we accept the notion of active euthanasia (deliberately terminating someone's life) we break a general moral prohibition against killing, and there will be nothing to prevent us going further. First, there would be active euthanasia for those who request it (voluntary euthanasia), then compassionate (indirect) euthanasia for those who are unable to request it "" the comatose or those in intractable pain. From there it would be only a short step to killing the mentally disabled and the mentally ill; the senile, the elderly, the mentally retarded, the chronic schizophrenics, patients with Alzheimer's disease. Furthermore, the argument goes, as the population ages and the cost of caring for the frail elderly increases, there will be a minority demand for non-voluntary euthanasia of dependent patients who lack full decision-making capacity. In such a scenario it is not hard to imagine how the non-treatment of any life-threatening condition might become routine "" a not impossible prospect if cost-cutting reduces levels of care, especially for the less well-off.

It is commonly agreed that every person has the right not to be killed unjustly. Admittedly, what is just and an ethical calculus or a social contract determines what is unjust - both constantly in flux. The fear of death is powerful. Yet even more powerful can be the fear of not dying, or of living a life full of pointless suffering. From this fear stems the belief that we should be masters of our own fate. Euthanasia is one of society's most widely and hotly debated moral issues. It has pained and exhausted the courts for entirely too long that questions the ethics and morality of the issue. It is a never-ending loop that by no means considers our right, or the victim's right, to freedom. The issues are immensely complex and there is much at stake. On the state and national levels, it is hoped that proposed legal and ethical changes in health care policies will receive a thorough examination before such policies are revised. Ideas which have immediate surface appeal often have unseen consequences.

## Notes & References

1. ..Derek Humphry, Jean",s Way, Norris Lane Press, 2003, pp. 70-120.
2. ..Thomas Jefferson to Maryland Republicans, 1809 16:359 Memorial Edition, Vol. 16 (Lipscomb and Bergh, editors) 20 Vols., Washington, D.C., 1903-04, pg. 359. Retrieved from: <http://www.famguardian.org/Subjects/Politics/ThomasJefferson/jeff0650.htm> on 04-10-2012.
3. ..J. P Moreland, What Is Euthanasia? Article ID: DE197-1, Christian Research Institute, Charlotte, NC April 17, 2009. Retrieved from: <http://www.equip.org/articles/what-is-euthanasia/>

4. .. J. P Moreland, The Euthanasia Debate: Understanding the Issues (Part One in a Two-Part Series on Euthanasia), Statement De197-1, Retrieved from:  
[www.equip.org/PDF/DE197-1.pdf](http://www.equip.org/PDF/DE197-1.pdf)
5. .. "Dr. Death: No law is needed on euthanasia", USA Today, 28 October, 1992, p. 6A. Kevorkian's attorney, Geoffrey Feiger said, "Any disease that curtails life-span is terminal.", Geoffrey Fieger, Letter to the Editor, Detroit Free Press, 11 December, 1990.
6. ... .Legal Aspects in Health Care, Unit I, Chapter 1, Anna University, Retrieved 04-10-2012: [cde.annauniv.edu/pdf/MBA/2007/.../DBA1758.pdf](http://cde.annauniv.edu/pdf/MBA/2007/.../DBA1758.pdf).
7. .. Reenu Narula, "Whose life is it anyway", The Tribune, Sunday Reading, 14 March, 1999. Retrieved from: <http://www.tribuneindia.com>
8. ... .Leon R. Kass, "Toward a More Natural Science: Biology and Human Affairs", Chicago: Free Press, 1985.
9. .. .Legal brief in support of euthanasia, Retrieved 04-10-2012,  
<http://www.lawteacher.net/human-rights/essays/legal-brief-in-support-of-euthanasia.php>
10. ... .Kasliwal, Shreyans. "Should Euthanasia be Legalised in India?", Cite as : (2003) Practical Lawyer WebJour 16, 2003.
11. .. .The Right to Die in India (and everywhere) Saturday, 18 December, 2004 retrieved from the website: <http://www.lehigh.edu/~amsp/2004/12/right-to-die-in-india-and-everywhere.html>
12. ... .J. Sareen, B. J. Cox, T. O. Afifi, R. de Graaf, G. J. G. Asmundson, M. ten Have, and M. B. Stein, Anxiety Disorders and Risk for Suicidal Ideation and Suicide Attempts: A Population-Based Longitudinal Study of Adults Arch Gen Psychiatry, 1 November, 2005; 62(11): 1249 - 1257.
13. ... .Kanita Dervic, M.D., Maria A. Oquendo, M.D., Michael F. Grunebaum, M.D., Steve Ellis, Ph.D., Ainsley K. Burke, Ph.D. and J. John Mann, Religious Affiliation and Suicide Attempt M.D. Am J Psychiatry 161:2303-2308, December 2004.
14. ... .One final obstacle that has violated patients", legal right to control their treatment, or lack of it, is the intervention of family members who do not share the same views. Often, a close relative will override a patient",s desire to end treatment or imposed nutrition and hydration. Likewise, medical professionals are likely to respect the wishes of the family over the wishes of the patient because in reality, even though the patient overrides the family when it comes to treatment. For details see:. Joseph Carroll, (19 June, 2006). Public Continues to Support Right-to-Die for Terminally Ill Patients. Retrieved 16 January, 2007, from The Gallup Poll Web site:  
<http://www.galluppoll.com/content/?ci=23356&pg=1>
15. ... .Analysis of California's Assisted Suicide Proposal. Retrieved 2010-01-25.  
<http://www.patientsrightscouncil.org/site/california-analysis/>

16. ...Burdette, M Amy; Hill, D Terrence; Moulton, E. Benjamin, "Religion and Attitudes toward Physician-Assisted Suicide and Terminal Palliative Care", Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion, 44, 1, Mar, 2005, 79-93.
17. ... .Thanissaro Bhikkhu , Buddhist Monastic Code I: Chapter 4, Parajika, 1994.. Retrieved 2007-11-11 from "Access to Insight", at <http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/thanissaro/bmc1/ch04.html>.
18. ... .Jr.Werth, L. James, Dean Blevins, L. Karine Toussaint, R. Martha Durham, "The influence of Cultural Diversity on End-of-life Care and Decisions",. The American Behavioral Scientist, Oct 2002; 46, 2; pg 204-19.
19. ... . Among African-Americans, education correlates to support for euthanasia. African-Americans without a four-year degree are twice as likely to oppose euthanasia as those with at least that much education. Level of education, however, does not significantly influence other racial groups in the US. For details see K. Patricia Jennings, R. Clarence Talley, A Good Death? White Privilege and Public Opinion. Race, Gender, & Class. New Orleans, 2003. Vol. 10, Issue. 3, 31 July pg. 42.
20. ... .Jr. Werth, L. James.; Blevins, Dean; Toussaint, L. Karine; Durham, R. Martha, op. cit.,. pp.. 204-219
21. ... .Jennings op.cit., p.158
22. ... .One study found that African-American women are 2.37 times more likely to oppose to euthanasia than European-American. African-American men are 3.61 times more likely to oppose to euthanasia than European-American men. For details see: D. Moore. "Three in Four Americans Support Euthanasia", The Gallup Organization, 17 May, 2005.
23. ... .Jennings op.cit., p.175.
24. ... .Linda Greenhouse, An Issue for A Reluctant High Court, The New York Times, 6 October, 1996. Retrieved from: [http://www.nytimes.com/1996/10/06/week\\_in\\_review/an-issue-for-a-reluctant-high-court.html?pagewanted=all&src=pm](http://www.nytimes.com/1996/10/06/week_in_review/an-issue-for-a-reluctant-high-court.html?pagewanted=all&src=pm)
25. ... .P.N.Murkey & Konsam Suken Singh, "Euthanasia-- Mercy Killing", Review Article, J Indian Acad Forensic Med, 30(2). Retrieved: [medind.nic.in/jal/t08/i2/jalt08i2p92.pdf](http://medind.nic.in/jal/t08/i2/jalt08i2p92.pdf)
26. ... .LR. Kass. Is there a medical ethic? The hippocratic oath and the sources of ethical medicine. Toward a More Natural Science: Biology and Human Affairs. New York, NY: Free Press; 1985.
27. ... .T.L Beauchamp, JF. Childress. Principles of Biomedical Ethics. 4th ed. New York, NY: Oxford University Press; 1994.
28. ... .Schloendorff v. Society of New York Hospital, 211 N.Y. 125, 105 N.E. 92 (1914) Retrieved:[http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Schloendorff\\_v.\\_Society\\_of\\_New\\_York\\_Hospital](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Schloendorff_v._Society_of_New_York_Hospital)

29. ...A.R. Jonsen, M. Siegler, W.J. Winslade. *Clinical Ethics: A Practical Approach to Ethical Decisions in Clinical Medicine*. 4th ed. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill, Health Professions Division; 1998.
30. ...F.J. Ingelfinger Arrogance. *N Engl J Med*. 1980; 303:1507-1511.

Sourav Madhur Dey  
*Assistant Professor in Sociology*  
*University of Burdwan*

Inclusive



## One step forward two steps backward: A Historical Critique of Twentieth Century Decolonization

Anirudh Deshpande

### I.. Some important questions

Decolonization means the reverse of colonization like de-industrialization means the opposite of industrialization. To decolonize is to end colonialism; that is the dictionary meaning of the word. Although there are two meanings of decolonization, textbooks and internet sites generally refer to political decolonization as decolonization. The first, and the most obvious meaning of decolonization, is political decolonization which means the end of direct colonial rule over the colonies. Several colonies achieved independence by waging long national liberation struggles which exhausted the colonial powers who gave up their colonies. Decolonization either led to the emergence of new nation-states or potential nation-states. Usually the national liberation struggles in the colonies comprised the most important cause of a colonial weariness which forced the European colonial powers to concede political independence to their former subjects. This was the least they were either expected or forced to do in the historical circumstances which arose after the Second World War. Often the colonial powers waged prolonged wars and indulged in massive human rights violations in order to reclaim their colonies after World War II. If political decolonization is a meaningful definition of the term, we must agree that in the fifty odd years after World War II the erstwhile colonized parts of the world became decolonized. The formal independence of the Asian and African countries, during the 1940s, 1950s and 1960s is generally quoted as an example of decolonization in the literature on the subject. However, trends visible during the era of globalization, and following the demise of the USSR and the rise of capitalism in China, a handful of western countries has successfully rolled back the gains of decolonization in several parts of the developing world including Vietnam.<sup>[1]</sup>

If the chronology of decolonization is stretched backwards into the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries the revolt of the American colonies against Britain and the formation of the United States of America and the decline of the Spanish empire in south America becomes part of the decolonization narrative. So will the slave rebellion in Haiti [1791-1804] which produced the first non White independent country in the modern period. Haiti was the first slave colony to become independent of French rule in 1804 despite the efforts made by the French under the leadership of Napoleon's brother in law to regain it and enslave the Afro-Americans once again. <sup>[2]</sup> Thus while India was becoming Britain's colony much of America shook off colonial control in the nineteenth century. The words, 'independence' and, 'transfer of power' are also used to describe decolonization but they convey a limited sense of the concept. Though the story of decolonization and colonization as synchronous processes goes back to the eighteenth century it is true that the second half of the twentieth century was characterized, among other things, by political decolonization which took different forms in different national contexts. There were significant social similarities and historical differences between the decolonization of countries like Haiti, Venezuela, Argentina,

Peru, Chile, Mexico, Bolivia, Columbia, Cuba, Ghana, Kenya, Ethiopia, Uganda, Congo, Algeria, India, Burma, Ceylon, China, Korea, Vietnam and Malaysia etc. Decolonization meant different things in different contexts.

The second meaning of decolonization is more complex. This meaning derives its essentials from a deeper understanding of colonialism as an organic combination of economy, culture and discourse. A larger, and more meaningful definition of decolonization, is predicated upon a comprehensive definition of colonialism and its chief ideology, orientalism. This is important to create a truly decolonized future. Colonialism was much more than mere direct foreign rule over a colony and the exploitation of its resources; it embodied a complex and far reaching system of political economy, knowledge and culture underlined by what historians call, 'scientific racism.'<sup>[3]</sup> Under colonialism the colonizer and his metropolitan system affected almost every aspect of colonial life; language, fashion, urban planning, medicine, law, sport and literature bore the imprint of colonial domination. The political, educational and cultural institutions which evolved in the colonies, and conditioned and dominated the lives of the colonial subjects and their masters both, created an entire material and ideological system against which several anti-colonial movements militated. The development of the feeling of racial, linguistic and social inferiority among the colonized was crucial to the European colonial project. Colonialism spoke to the colonized in a voice of authority and superiority. Colonial anthropology, racism and slavery were often used extensively by the modern colonial powers to justify their victory and rule over the colonies; liberal traditions were good for the metropolis whereas the colonies were culturally inferior and hence unfit for liberal ideas. Colonialism created and perpetuated the ontological difference between the White man on the one hand and the savages and barbarians on the other. Knowledge generated in all academic fields and educational institutions under colonial guidance and supervision helped maintain colonialism as a hegemonic collaborative enterprise, in sum the mind of the colonial subjects was colonized to run the colonial system as efficiently as possible. Colonialism functioned by incorporating within its establishment an influential section of the culturally colonized native elites who mediated between the rulers and the masses. These elites, in general, have ended up blighting decolonization in their comprador interests.

Decolonization, above all, means un-learning and un-doing colonialism. Unless the mind of the colonized is decolonized colonialism, like a psychological illness in the chronically ill, will continue to outlive its political lifespan. The success and failure of many anti-colonial movements must be assessed in this context. Critics argue that in many instances political decolonization replaced colonialism with Superpower imperialism during the Cold War. Modern imperialism during the Cold War translated into indirect foreign rule in much of the Third World. The contemporary war in Iraq, Afghanistan and the Middle East proves that imperialism has replaced the great games of the classical colonial period.<sup>[4]</sup> Critics of globalization also assert that the North-South divide has increased during the contemporary times and that the, 'Washington Consensus' and institutions like the WTO actually represent the return of backdoor colonialism. While this goes on the United Nations either endorses imperialism or remains a passive onlooker. Among the critics of globalization the term, 'neo-colonialism' is popular. The post second world

war history of South America and its,banana republics', and Africa and its tin pot dictatorships lends weight to this criticism. The devastating and dehumanizing wars in Afghanistan (1979-2012), the Middle East and Africa and, above all, Vietnam (1945-75) prove that imperialism has a long life and international guarantees against it, in the form of UN resolutions etc, do not work''''''''.

## II. Can there be a theory of decolonization?

Western scholars were drawn to decolonization in the 1970s and 1980s after most of Africa and Asia had become free from direct foreign rule. Till World War II European scholars were used to the idea that either the European colonies would never gain independence or would gain independence in a non foreseeable future. The decolonization process began and become irreversible during the Second World War which exhausted the older colonial powers like Great Britain. France lost face upon being defeated and occupied by the Germans in 1940 but this did not prevent it from resisting decolonization in Indochina during the early 1950s with disastrous consequences. Britain also resisted decolonization in Malaya when it became apparent that the communists there had become too strong for post-colonial comfort. While decolonization progressed in the 1960s and 70s with all its limitations, several European scholars began to think that the great civilizing mission of the Western powers was finally being accomplished in this process. The birth of new nation-states in the spaces created by modern colonialism was seen as a significant achievement of Western civilization.

In due course plausible and implausible theories of decolonization emerged. These theories fall into two categories. First, the view of decolonization as a long term process guided by metropolitan policy is present in the works of Grimal, Holland and Rizvi. In the second perspective, evident in the work of B. R. Tomlinson, decolonization is a set of short-term measures taken by the British to overcome their growing economic and political problems in India during the 1920s and 1930s. The history of colonialism shows that principled decolonization is difficult to prove in practice. Colonial reforms were usually initiated to prolong, and not end, colonialism. According to H. Grimal the revolt of North America and the disintegration of the Spanish Empire in Central and South America led some liberals in England to apply Turgot's,biological lawâ€™™ to the history of these colonies. Turgot had set forth the example of a ripe fruit dropping from the tree much before the French Revolution. By analogy the process was considered inevitable though, it may be added, the comparison was unfair because the enlightened liberals misrepresented the nurturing between a tree and its fruit. Some liberals, who believed that modernity would enlighten the colonies, favored the careful granting of colonial freedom in gradual stages by peaceful means. Thus, phrases like,dominion status',,self-rule' and municipal reform became integral to the colonial discourse. However all this was interpreted differently in different historical contexts. White colonies like Canada, Australia and New Zealand evolved within the British Commonwealth on liberal lines which were usually kept closed to non white colonial subjects. Due to this racism the history of black colonies [in Africa and Asia], where strong national liberation struggles arose, turned out different.

In America the British and Spanish colonial subjects revolted and created independent countries. In Asia and Africa the civilizing mission lingered on even as colonialism was undermined by developments in world history. The two world wars of the previous century, products of imperialism and colonialism themselves, destroyed the colonial world built during the nineteenth century. Consequently there was no choice but to decolonize and nowhere was this demonstrated better than in India. Grimal asserts that colonialism, contained the seed of its own destruction.' This was so because colonialism was incapable of reforming itself. Colonial liberal reforms failed because the,only reforms ever considered were those that would link the colonies even more closely to the home country; the only liberal theories considered were those that were unlikely to be implemented.' <sup>151</sup> Decolonization, with serious political and economic limitations, has happened since 1945 despite colonialism and not because of colonial intentions. The informed researches of Noam Chomsky, Edward Said, Karl Meyer and, recently, Donny Gluckstein tell us that after 1945 imperialism, increasingly US imperialism, has replaced modern colonialism. <sup>161</sup> It is evident that the US inherited the mantle of western civilization from Great Britain upon the latter's decline in the twentieth century.

### **III.. The main causes of political decolonization**

Decolonization was caused primarily by the contradictions inherent in what may be called the colonial mode of production. Nationalism, the political and cultural manifestation of the colonial contradiction, in the colonies was produced by a combination of colonial policies, limited urbanization, the arrival of modernity and growing criticism of colonial rule. The question whether the European powers gave up their empires or were forced to give up these empires remains debated between the apologists of colonialism and the votaries of the anti-colonial nationalist movements. Norman Lowe asserts that the colonial powers,at first determined to hold on to their empires by military force. But they all gave way in the end.' <sup>171</sup> The colonial powers had overstretched themselves by the beginning of the twentieth century. Spanish dependence on colonial produce, including American gold and silver, prevented the transformation of Spain into a modern industrial country and caused the disintegration of the Spanish empire in the nineteenth century. Colonial empires declined and colonial powers lost their colonies to their former subjects when the cost of maintaining a colonial empire exceeded the benefits which a colony endowed upon the mother country. For a long time the colonies had brought several material and symbolic benefits to the colonizers. Cheap colonial agrarian products subsidized the working classes within the metropolis and lessened the gravity of class struggle there. Colonies provided the metals, minerals and protected markets needed by the advanced European countries. The vast bureaucratic and military apparatus in the colonies created thousands of jobs for the Europeans. Temperate regions absorbed surplus European populations. In all respects the European colonial experience reached its zenith in the nineteenth century , a century of expanding capitalism, industrialism and intensive colonial exploitation.

Gradually, with the growth of nationalist opposition and periodic popular anti-colonial revolts in the colonies, managing the colonies became difficult. Although the Europeans crushed most of the

anti-colonial peasant and tribal revolts using superior economic and military resources the cost of colonialism rose steadily. By the early twentieth century Britain and France were saddled with empires which called for ever increasing expenditures. The contradictions between the backwardness of the agrarian colonies and the growing demands for revenue became clear even before the Great War. Despite controlling vast colonial empires Great Britain and France fought World War I with US money. When World War II broke out in 1939 Britain was even more desperate; it was bailed out by the Lend Lease Agreement which it signed with the USA in 1941.. France survived the war by temporarily becoming a colony of Nazi Germany (1940-44)! The most important blows against the old colonial empires were struck by Japan and Germany. World War I (1914-18) and II (1939-45) exhausted Britain and France, made political decolonization and the international hegemony of the USA inevitable. During the Second World War the Allied Powers fought against the Axis Powers in the name of freedom, democracy and socialism but the closing months of the war revealed that the leadership of the Allied Powers [including the USSR] had resolved to deny freedom to the peoples it had used to win the war. Even before Hitler committed suicide and the atom bombs were dropped on Japan the leadership of the USA, UK and USSR had developed the blue print for the domination and exploitation of the post war world by the use of imperialist strategies. <sup>181</sup>

**The main causes of decolonization after 1945 were as follows:**

The growth of mass nationalism in the colonies in the first fifty years of the twentieth century undermined the legitimacy of colonialism as a material and intellectual system among the colonial subjects. These movements gathered enormous strength in most colonies during World War II making the political independence of these countries irresistible towards its end. The impact of the Great Depression on the colonies which exported primary commodities to the international markets was particularly severe. The 1920s and 30s were a period of economic crisis, high unemployment, political turmoil and civil strife in the colonial world. In Vietnam and China mass nationalism, organized by the communists, became a people's war against imperialism and colonialism. In India popular nationalism (1905-1946) led to independence and partition in 1947. The large scale participation of the colonial peoples in World War I and II exposed the Asians and Africans to the differences between conditions in Europe and their homelands. This had a salutary effect on the rising anti-colonial feelings in the colonies. Further, in lieu of the support the European powers sought from the colonies in these wars several promises of political reform were made to the colonial participants. Autonomy, self-rule and dominion status were often promised, though not granted, to the colonial subjects and this raised the levels of expectations of freedom in the colonies. Often the failure of the colonial powers to keep their wartime promises fuelled large scale elite and popular unrest in the colonies and increased the pressures of decolonization. The rise of Japan as an important military and imperial power in the first half of the twentieth century influenced nationalism in many colonies. Japan defeated Russia in the Russo-Japanese War of 1904-5. It played an important role in World War I against Germany. During World War II the Japanese inflicted several humiliating defeats on the British in Malaya and Singapore. To begin with, the rise of Japan proved to the nationalists in the colonies that the European powers could be

defeated by an Asian country. During World War II in many Asian countries like Vietnam and Malaysia the nationalists and communists fought against Japanese occupation and learnt valuable political and military lessons in the process. After Japan's defeat in 1945 these confident nationalist and communist forces were in no mood to allow the re-establishment of European colonialism in these countries. The Vietnamese continued their armed struggle against the French re-occupation of Indochina under the leadership of Ho Chi Minh and the Vietnamese Communist Party. They finally defeated the French Army, forcing the French garrison to surrender, in the famous battle of Dien Bien Phu in 1954. In China the Communist Party united the country by carrying out a simultaneous anti-feudal and anti-colonial revolution after a protracted civil war in 1949. In India, due to the failures of secular nationalism and the long term machinations of colonial policy, political decolonization was accompanied by the worst communal bloodbath of the twentieth century and the partition of the country in 1947.

. The two world wars converted the USA into the foremost imperialist country in search of markets for its industry and finance capital. From the late nineteenth century the USA began to champion the right of self-determination of various struggling nations in Europe and Asia chiefly in order to free their markets to its goods and capital. In Europe this applied to the Balkan areas which were struggling against Hapsburg domination. In Asia the USA began to urge Britain to decolonize her empire and towards China it supported an open door policy from the early decades of the twentieth century. During the Cold War, marked by the Superpower rivalry between the USA and USSR, the latter supported national liberation struggles in some countries like Vietnam against the French and the US. The Bolshevik Revolution, the success of Soviet Planning in the 1930s and its role in popular imagination across countries, the defeat of Nazi Germany by the Soviet Red Army during World War II and Soviet scientific achievements inspired several national liberation movements in the first half of the previous century. All this quickened the pace of political decolonization but simultaneously made the new decolonized regimes vulnerable to indirect political control by the superpowers. In many cases this defeated the original purpose of decolonization and led to the rise of superpower backed military dictatorships in the former colonies.

#### **IV.. Examples: Decolonization in South East Asia and the French Empire**

To illustrate some cases of problematic decolonization this section presents a critical survey of decolonization in Malaysia, the East Indies and Indochina (Vietnam). Holland, Britain and France had built a vast colonial empire in South East Asia during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Since the late nineteenth century nationalism gained strength in these regions and by the time the World War II ended political and social pressures for decolonization in these colonies could not be resisted by the imperialists.

##### **(a). . . Malaysia (Malaya)**

A part of the Malaysian peninsula had developed as a major British plantation colony and Singapore (the so called Gibraltar of the East) as an important British strategic commercial and

military port since the nineteenth century. It had a mixed ethnic population comprising ethnic Malays, the Chinese and the Indians most of whom were migrants or descendants of migrants from south India. In addition a small number of Europeans, mostly plantation owners, managers and officers, also resided in various parts of Malaysia. The political structure of Malaysia was complex, it had nine states ruled by independent sultans and three British settlements Malacca, Penang and the island of Singapore. Malaysia was occupied by the Japanese in 1942 after the Japanese defeated the British in the Second World War. The brief, but brutal, Japanese occupation finally ended with the surrender of Japan in 1945 and from then onwards British moves to re-organize a post war Malaysia gathered momentum. In 1948 it was decided that all the Malaysian sultanates, except Singapore, would comprise a Federation of Malaya under British influence. Detaching Singapore from the Federation and keeping it a separate colony made British strategic and economic interests quite clear during the negotiations. It was also decided that within the Federation each state would have its own legislature and local government. The belief was that the autonomous states would cooperate in making the Federation, under a central government, a successful experiment which would not be inimical to long term British commercial and military interests in the region. Elections to the local and federal legislatures would take place on the principle of universal adult franchise. In practice this gave the Malay Muslim majority greater political weight compared with the other ethnic groups like the Chinese and Indians with long term consequences. The British decided to concede partial independence as a prelude to complete decolonization sometime in future but the political conditions in Malaysia became turbulent because of the Communist insurgency. The Chinese people of Malaysia felt the brunt of the Japanese occupation and, inspired by the successes of the Communist Parties of China and Vietnam against the Japanese imperialists during the Second World War, played a major role in the anti-Japanese resistance in Malaysia from 1942 onwards. The communist guerillas led by the leader Chin Peng began to gather strength in many areas of Malaysia. By the end of the war the communists had won a great deal of support among the Malaysian plantation workers, the urban proletariat and sections of the urban Chinese. With the aim of liberating Malaysia from British control the Communists capitalized on the post-war hardships of the Malaysian people and began preparing for a communist takeover of the country. Major strikes led by the communists and a violent movement against the plantation owners and their Malaysian collaborators started almost as soon as the British returned. Since the communist movement was dominated by the Chinese and one of its aims was to abolish feudalism in Malaysia the several Sultans and the majority of Malays allied with the British against it. The British declared a state of emergency in 1948 and a protracted war against the communist insurgents began in the context of the international political equations following World War II. The state of emergency remained in force till 1960. During these twelve years the Malays were assured of independence and all the Chinese sympathizers of the communists were re-settled in specially guarded villages which were in fact like concentration camps. The differences between the Malays and the Chinese were played upon, sharpened and used by the British in their usual, 'divide and rule' fashion with long term consequences.

Once the communists were suppressed a large number of Chinese were left with no option but to seek a political solution within a Malaysian federation. As communist influence waned the

pressures on the Chinese eased. By the mid 1950s the movement for independence was strong enough in the Malay, Indian and Chinese camps for the Alliance Party to be formed under Tunku Abdul Rahman, a respected Malay leader. In the elections of 1955 this party won 51 out of the 52 seats. After this election the political conditions in Malaysia improved steadily and it achieved full independence and a membership of the British Commonwealth in 1957. The Federation of Malaysia was set up in 1963 with all the Sultanates joining it. At the same time the Malaysian economy, based on the export of rubber and tin, grew steadily because the international demand for these commodities rose phenomenally as a consequence of the post-war boom. Today Malaysia is generally held up by economists as a good example of an economic success story alongside South Korea, Taiwan and Singapore. Singapore, which developed as a free port benefiting from its strategic location in the Straits of Malacca, was part of the Federation till 1965. In that year it became an independent republic which is now known for its strict government, economic prosperity, high per capita income, a thriving service industry and various tourist attractions.,

#### **(b). . Indonesia**

Holland, one of the oldest European colonial powers,, had a large colonial empire in the East Indies including the large islands of Sumatra, Java and Celebes, West Irian and a about two thirds of Borneo before World War II. Under Dutch rule Indonesia developed as a classic colony exporting primary produce. These exports paid the Dutch a handsome profit in the international markets and eased their balance of payments problem. In fact it was the Dutch model of making a colony pay for its own subjugation and exploitation which was replicated in India by the English East India Company. To maximize their profits the Dutch kept the investment in developing the human capital of the locals low. Their plantations were run on the basis of forced labor at minimum wages. From the mid nineteenth century a small middle class developed in Indonesia and a nationalist movement, spurred by large scale labor unrest under growing communist influence, started developing from the late nineteenth century. By the 1930s several nationalist groups, inspired by nationalist and communist movements in other Asian colonies, began to increase pressure on the Dutch rulers to grant Indonesia some kind of independence. The Dutch reacted violently. The movement was suppressed and all important nationalist leaders, including the left leaning Ahmed Sukarno, were imprisoned by the time the Second World War broke out. During the Second World War Indonesia, as a Dutch possession, fell to the advancing Japanese who released Sukarno and his comrades. The Japanese promised the Indonesian independence after the war in return for their cooperation against the Allied Powers. With the Dutch expelled or imprisoned by the Japanese the Indonesian nationalists came to play an important role in the administration of Indonesia under Japanese supervision. Assured of Japanese support the nationalists also began to prepare for independence after the war and after Japan was defeated in 1945 Sukarno proclaimed an independent republic in Indonesia. However, despite being occupied by Germany during the war Holland was not yet finished as a colonial power. Once Holland became independent of German control a strong army was dispatched, in the nineteenth century fashion, to Indonesia to reclaim the colony from Sukarno and his followers who included large numbers of Indonesian communists as well. Although the Dutch fought with determination the Indonesians proved that the colonialists



could not defeat a countrywide people's resistance to the invading forces. The war dragged on till 1949 after which Holland found itself too weak to pursue it any further. This war was extremely unpopular in the Third World. Finally the UN intervened and put pressure on Holland to reach a settlement with the Indonesian nationalists. Countries like India were also expressing support for the Indonesian nationalists. The US and Australia were also in favor of Indonesian independence because they wanted to exploit the markets and resources of that archipelago in their own interest by ending the Dutch monopolies in the region. For their part the exhausted Dutch realized that it was better to maintain an economic connection with an independent Indonesia than forsake all their interests in the country. Consequently Holland recognized the United States of Indonesia in 1949. Sukarno, the popular leader of the Indonesian anti-colonial freedom movement, became independent Indonesia's first President.

Although Indonesia emerged as an independent country in 1949 Sukarno's perceived closeness to the communists in Indonesia and China was obviously disliked by the Americans. It was Sukarno's misfortune to have arisen to such prominence during the Cold War when the USA was bent upon stemming the tide of communism all over the world. On the other hand were leaders like Sukarno, with a non-aligned vision of the Third World like Jawaharlal Nehru of India, who wished to pursue a path of national development independent of Moscow and Washington. Realizing that genuine economic independence would enable Indonesia to resist American pressure, US agencies, like the CIA, began to conspire with a section of the Indonesian armed forces to topple Sukarno. In 1965 Sukarno was finally overthrown in a right wing military coup and replaced by General Suharto who was recognized by the Americans. The General repaid his debt to the US immediately by establishing a pro Washington, 'New Order' in the country. This order, among other things, also meant the liquidation of communists and political opponents and the cold blooded murder of at least half a million [five lakh] Indonesians. Thus, the USA demolished Sukarno's dream of an independent socialist Indonesia. Large scale human rights violations by the Suharto regime were tolerated by the Western powers because the General emerged as their hero against the communists in the Cold War. Suharto followed the economic policies of globalization developed by the neo liberal neo conservative, 'Washington Consensus' and Indonesia became a happy hunting ground for the American multinational corporations (MNCs). In 1997 Indonesia was one of the five Asian economies which were engulfed in a major currency crisis which began with the collapse of the Thai bhat. Once the communists were annihilated the military dictatorship turned against the ethnic minorities of Indonesia to justify itself and redefine Indonesian nationalism. The Indonesian Army, advised and supplied by the US, waged a genocidal war against the Timorese in East Timor. But the people of East Timor fought back in a war which lasted several years before the international community finally woke up and made East Timor an independent country in the recent past. In sum Suharto's dictatorship ended up imposing enormous costs on the Indonesian people, undid the legacy of Indonesia's anti-colonial struggle and opened the Indonesian market to the MNCs under American guidance.

### **(c). . . The predicament of the French colonial empire**

The Enlightenment, the French Revolution of 1789 and its ideals of liberty, equality and fraternity did not prevent France from becoming a major European colonial power in the nineteenth century. France was also one of those countries which were bled white during World War I. During World War II France was quickly defeated and occupied by the German Army in 1940 and northern France became a German colony for at least four years. The government of southern France, also called Vichy France, under General Pettain was virtually controlled by the Nazis. Although the French like to believe that they played an important role as resistance fighters against the Nazis during 1940-44 evidence, in general, points out that the Resistance was comparatively insignificant to the eventual defeat of Nazi Germany. On the other hand extremely large numbers of the French actively collaborated with the Nazis. The exhaustion of France during World War I and its humiliation in World War II weakened its economic and psychological grip over its far flung colonial empire and stoked the anti colonial national liberation struggles in many French colonies. But this did not prevent France from declaring its colonial intentions even before World War II ended! The 1944 Brazzaville Declaration made it clear that France was determined to strengthen its grip over its colonies: . The colonizing work of France makes it impossible to accept any idea of autonomy for the colonies or any possibility of development outside the French Empire. Even at a distant date, there will be no self-government in the colonies. <sup>191</sup> The main French possessions in 1945 were Syria in the Middle East, Guadaloupe and Martinique Islands in the West Indies, French Guyana in South America, Tunisia, Morocco and Algeria (together called the Maghrib i.e. West in Arabic), French West and Equatorial Africa, Madagascar and south Indo China [Vietnam]. In addition to these Pondichery [now called Pudduchery] on the Tamil Nadu coast in India was also a French possession. The French empire was smaller than the British and would have been much larger had the British not driven the French out of India in the eighteenth century. The French empire ended stage by stage after the Second World War but this paper presents Vietnam and Algeria as case studies.

#### **1. Vietnam**

During and after the Second World War the communists played a prominent role in the national liberation struggles of many peasant dominated Asian countries like China, Korea, Malaysia, Indonesia and the Philippines. The communists also emerged as a major force in Vietnam making the national liberation struggle there virtually synonymous with the communist movement in the period 1931-75. Vietnam was colonized by the French during a series of French imperialist campaigns between 1858 and 1895 in Indochina which also included Laos and Cambodia. The French developed a colonial economy in Vietnam in alliance with the local landlords based on rice cultivation, rubber plantations and the exploitation of coal reserves. Rice plantations based on an intensive exploitation of the peasantry were especially important in the Mekong River Valley. Opposition to French rule, exercised through a brutal colonial police and army (1895-1925), dates back to the nineteenth century. Vietnamese peasant opposition was caused by heavy rents, usury, numerous colonial taxes and low wages and was expressed in an anti-colonial movement guided

by nationalism and a republican ideology to begin with. After the Bolshevik Revolution and World War I the Vietnamese national liberation movement entered a new phase. Between 1925 and 1930 popular opposition to French colonialism sharpened and political terrorism became common in the country. The relatively small Vietnamese middle class and working class comprised the class base of this anti-colonial movement. The national liberation movement started assuming a radical color with the emergence of large scale working class strikes soon after 1918. A number of nationalist groups emerged in Vietnamese society and one of these was the Revolutionary Youth League founded by the Comintern trained Ho Chi Minh. The French reacted by smashing some nationalist groups and incorporating the less radical ones in their colonial-hegemonic designs. The Revolutionary Youth League was dominated by the communists right from the beginning and in 1931 was transformed into the Indochina Communist Party by Ho Chi Minh and his comrades. During the great depression years, which began in 1930-31 and lasted throughout the 1930s, social and political discontent in Vietnam assumed serious proportions. The impact of the depression and the unwillingness of the French to negotiate constructively with the Vietnamese nationalism expanded the base of the Communist Party which often led the peasant and worker upsurges of the early 1930s.

The French retaliated by banning the Communist Party driving it underground into the rural areas where, following the example set by Mao and the Chinese Communist Party, the communists cultivated a base among the poor peasants by a deft combination of Marxism and the local Vietnamese traditions of resistance which had a history going back to the medieval period. Thus the military art of people's war was perfected by the Vietnamese communists led by Ho and Giap.<sup>[10]</sup> In 1941 the Japanese occupied Vietnam forcing the Vietnamese national liberation struggle to change its strategy. In the same year the communists created the Vietminh, a broad based nationalist front under communist guidance, to fight imperialism and colonialism on the lines of the Chinese united fronts. The main aim of the communists during the period of Japanese occupation (1941-45) was to lead a heterogeneous national liberation struggle against foreign occupation and the possible return of French colonialism after 1945. The Vietnam communists demonstrated their commitment to anti-colonialism during these years and won widespread support among the people of Vietnam. The Vietminh carried out a successful land reform programme in the villages of North Vietnam and waged a guerrilla war against the Japanese between 1941 and 1945. Soon after Japan surrendered, Ho Chi Minh proclaimed an independent Democratic Republic of Vietnam (DRV) on 2nd September, 1945 'amidst popular acclamation.'<sup>[11]</sup> In his proclamation Ho quoted at length from the American Declaration of Independence and referred to the ideals of the French Revolution of 1789 in an obvious attempt to bring the US and France to the negotiating table. But, events proved, his appeal to the ideals of the Enlightenment fell on deaf ears. The proclamation of 1945 began the second important phase of decolonization in Vietnam. In the National Elections of January, 1946 the Vietminh did extremely well and Ho Chi Minh emerged as the most popular leader of Vietnam. Following this the Vietminh tried its best to negotiate a political settlement with the French in order to avoid another war. The French, with British assistance, had arrived in force as soon as World War II ended to reclaim Vietnam like the Dutch in Indonesia. The US and British backed French Expeditionary

Corps gained control of the southern portion of Vietnam where the Vietminh was not very strong. The French soon found out that they were not equal to the task of peacefully taking over from the Japanese because the confident Vietminh was left with no option but to fight the French (1946-54) in one of the most successful people's war in modern history. Since the French were economically incapable of waging a war against the Chinese and Soviet backed Vietminh the United States stepped in to bail out the French to stem the rising tide of international communism. In the meantime the Cold War had begun and the Americans had already tasted defeat in the Korean War.

The French invasion of Vietnam in 1946 led to the re-imposition of French colonial rule in South Vietnam. In doing so the French used the Japanese troops who had surrendered to the Allies ! Consequently the French Expeditionary Corps, which underestimated the anti-colonial resolve of the Vietnamese people and the Vietminh, moved north with the aim of conquering the whole of Vietnam. These French moves, assisted by ex-Nazi and anti-Communist troops from Africa, West Germany, France and Korea, spread the war to the entire Vietnamese countryside and set the stage for a major confrontation between the French and the Vietminh. In the absence of any clear ideological or national motivation on the imperialist side the invading multinational force and the troops raised in south Vietnam were given a carte blanche by the French.. What followed was a one of the bloodiest and indiscriminate wars in modern history. By 1953 it became clear to the French and American generals supporting them that the Vietminh would not be defeated easily and hence they came up with the,Navarre Plan' of 1953. <sup>[12]</sup> This plan had two aims. One was to raise the strength of the pro-French Vietnamese puppet forces and the induction of thousands of troops from France, Africa and West Germany [ex-Nazi soldiers] in an attempt to neutralize the guerrilla bases of the Vietminh. The second aim was to concentrate the best and the most well equipped French units in the central highlands to entice and destroy the main body of the Vietnamese People's Army. This plan failed miserably because the scattered puppet forces were no match for the highly motivated Vietminh guerrilla cadres and the best French forces were encircled, shelled, shattered and defeated by the Vietminh in the symbolic, famous and legendary Battle of Dien Bien Phu [May, 1954]. The battle ended with the annihilation of the French Expeditionary Corps and the capture of the entire French officer staff on 7 May, 1954. The unexpected French catastrophe at Dien Bien Phu forced the UN to convene the Geneva Conference in the summer of 1954. At this conference Laos and Cambodia were declared independent and it was decided to organize a national election in Vietnam. Since the US knew that a national election would lead to the establishment of a Vietminh government in a united Vietnam it succeeded in dividing the country at the seventeenth parallel. By this concession to communism the US sought to create a zone of colonial exploitation and anti-communism in South Vietnam. Thus the states of North Vietnam its capital at Hanoi and South Vietnam based on Saigon came into existence. The promise of holding national elections was never kept and the ground for a prolonged war in the region was prepared. Soon after the Geneva Conference of 1954, a Republic of Vietnam was created by the US in South Vietnam under the conservative mandarin Ngo Dinh Diem. The US, in an attempt to counter the spread of communism in South East Asia, also created the Southeast Asia

Treaty Organization [SEATO]. This alliance included Australia, France, Great Britain, New Zealand, the Philippines, Thailand and the United States.

The last phase of decolonization and the national liberation struggle in Vietnam lasted a full twenty years between 1955 and 1975. In these two decades the Vietnamese people, led by the Vietminh, waged a successful people's war against the greatest imperialist power of the twentieth century, the United States of America. Soon after 1954 the US backed Saigon regime reversed the land reforms carried out by the Vietminh in the 1940s, persecuted the peasantry and the Buddhists and established a police state based on nepotism. The return of landlordism was disliked by the peasants who reacted by joining the communist insurgency in growing numbers. This resulted in the expansion of the people's war on a large scale and the increase in the popularity of the communists and their nationalist supporters who formed the National Liberation Front (NLF) to carry forward the task of the Vietnamese revolution. As conditions in south Vietnam deteriorated during the late 1950s and early 1960s Washington tried its best to control the situation by engineering a regime change in 1963 and, finally, by the large scale induction of US troops into Vietnam from 1965 onwards during the presidency of Lyndon Johnson. By the time the Tet Offensive was launched by the North Vietnamese People's Army against the cities and towns in South Vietnam in 1968 the US had deployed around 180,000 regular conscripted well trained US Army troops in Vietnam. In the meantime during the 1960s a strong anti-war movement developed among large sections of the people in the US and Europe as news of the CIA machinations, US excesses and saturation bombing in Vietnam spread throughout the world. In the late 1960s Vietnam emerged as a symbol of anti-imperialism, anti-colonialism and the international struggle for human rights. In fact the Tet Offensive was timed by the Democratic Republic of Vietnam in keeping with the growing international revulsion against the Vietnam War. Although this offensive was not entirely successful it successfully proved to the US policy makers and generals that the US was losing the war. The large scale student and working class revolt in the US and Europe in 1968 combined with the spread of drug addiction and large scale demoralization in the US Army in Vietnam paved the way for the US withdrawal from Vietnam in 1974. Soon thereafter the puppet regime in Saigon, now left without the support of the US Army, crumbled rapidly despite massive US economic and military aid. Saigon fell to the People's Army of Vietnam and the NLF on 30 April, 1975 and Vietnam was finally united and rid of Western colonialism. It is a different matter that the decolonization of Vietnam has steadily been undone by the Western countries since the 1980s and today that poor developing country has been forced to honour the war debts incurred by the Saigon regime ! The history of the Vietnam war, it seems, is also being re-written to whitewash the record of the US military in the region and delete from future memory the war crimes committed by the USA. That is the cultural gift of globalization to a valorous people by the champion of the so called free world. <sup>[13]</sup>

## **2. Algeria**

France colonized Algeria in the 1830s and 1840s and eventually converted it into a department of the French state. Throughout the nineteenth century French immigration into Algeria continued

and by 1930 there were 900,000 French citizens of French origin settled in Algeria. Most of these poor immigrants, who were supported and subsidized by the French state, wrested the best lands in the north from the Algerian Arabs and grew wheat and produced wine for export to France. The important urban centers in Algeria also developed in the north and were dominated by the French colonial elite comprising wealthy landowners, newspaper proprietors, politicians and the French civilian and military officers. This French society in Algeria was closed to the Arabs and defined its identity in opposition to the nine million disempowered Arabs who lived generally in the hinterland. The Arabs resisted the French invasion and conquest of Algeria right from the beginning and serious armed anti-colonial peasant revolts occurred several times in the nineteenth century. The last great Arab insurrection against the French happened in 1871 and coincided with the Paris Commune. These revolts were usually crushed by the French Army with great bloodshed but their memory kept alive the spirit of Arab resistance to French colonialism. The monopolization of the fertile plains in the north by the French settlers created the grounds for a violent French-Arab conflict in Algeria in the long run. The French settlers, who were conscious of the numerical superiority of the Arabs, cultivated a racist mentality towards the colonial subjects. The French considered the Arabs barbaric and ridiculed their customs. This contempt for the Arabs was expressed in the French media and politics and kept the French colonizers united despite their internal class differences. Dominating the Algerian majority became an ...obsession...#157; with this French minority. <sup>[14]</sup> The dispossessed Arabs, on the other hand, first lost their lands and later their traditional manufactures under the impact of the French industry which was felt throughout the country. Increased poverty, land alienation, indebtedness, disease and political frustration were the consequences of French colonialism for more than ninety per cent of the Algerian Arabs. In the twentieth century agriculture and wine making became increasingly mechanized in the north. This adversely affected the opportunities for wage labor in this sector of the colonial Algerian economy. The depression of the 1930s worsened the economic conditions in Algeria because the demand for Algerian colonial produce declined significantly in the French and European markets.

Algerian nationalism, both moderate and religiously radical, grew swiftly in the 1930s and 40s as the Algerians began to apply the ideals of modernity to their visions of a new future for Algeria. The Second World War dealt a severe blow to French prestige and encouraged the nationalists in Algeria. Racial contradictions in Algeria sharpened in this period because a large number of French settlers in Algeria came under the influence of Nazi ideas in the 1930s and 40s. The French settlers were influenced by the anti-Semitism of the Vichy regime and this translated into a fear of Islam in North Africa. By the mid 1930s the Algerian nationalists, led by the Movement of the Oulemas, were establishing schools, publishing journals and preaching 'adherence to a conservative Islamic faith' in reaction to the French settlers. In 1937 the Arab leader Messali Hadj, created an authentically modern nationalist party' the Triumph of Democratic Liberties (MTLD) which developed a core of 25000 trained militants by the end of World War II. The Algerian revolution began in May, 1945. The Algerian militants killed around 100 French. The French retaliated by butchering 15,000 Arabs. Violence escalated throughout Algeria as French government efforts to devolve some powers to the Arabs were frustrated by the French settlers and the Governor General

himself. In 1954 the various Algerian nationalist groups, inspired by the rise of Nasser in Egypt and the French defeat at Dien Bien Phu, united to form the National Liberation Front [FLN] led by Ben Bella. On 31 October, the Front launched terrorist attacks on 70 selected targets throughout Algeria and the guerrilla war began. The French increased their military forces in Algeria rapidly and by 1960 around 700,000 French troops were fighting a few thousand Algerian guerrilla fighters in a war France was losing. The French Army, with its reputation in tatters during World War II and in Vietnam, tried its best to redeem its prestige in Algeria in the face of growing international condemnation. In 1958 the rising power of the French generals the Algerian war drove France close to a civil war and destroyed the Fourth Republic. This brought General De Gaulle to power in December, 1958 but the new president disappointed the French colonists by negotiating with the FLN. Sections of the army and the colonists made matters worse by organizing a Secret Army Organization [OAS] in 1961 under General Salan. The OAS launched a terror campaign against the critics of the Algerian war in Algeria and France murdering scores of people and blowing up buildings. The OAS tried to murder De Gaulle and seize power in Algeria. This alienated the French public, and a large section of the Army, which were sick of the Algerian War. The OAS collapsed when De Gaulle,denounced' it on national TV in full uniform. Ben Bella was released from prison and, by the Evian Accords [18 March, 1962], Algeria achieved independence by granting France,access to its newly discovered oil fields in the Sahara.' [15]

## **V.. Decolonization in Africa - a brief survey**

The decolonization of Africa in the twentieth century must be understood in relation to the definition of decolonization attempted in the beginning of this paper. Decolonization has remained problematic and incomplete in much of Africa. From ancient times till date Africa has been an important source of human and natural resources for Europe, Asia and America. Africa's contribution to the development of human civilization is immeasurable. Since 1500 AD Africa has played a decisive role in the development of international capitalism. Its human, mineral, metal, forest and oceanic resources have been significant to the development of Europe and America since the beginning of the capitalist mode of production in the sixteenth century. Africa was the greatest laboratory of European racism. It was the,'dark' continent where colonialism attained classic proportions and later the Cold War was played out with extreme violence. Africa became politically decolonized in stages after the Second World War because the weakened and discredited European countries could no longer rule Africa directly. European economic interests in Africa ruled out comprehensive decolonization. China and India have also developed economic stakes in Africa in the recent past prompting fears of a re-colonization of the continent. Was decolonization destined to fail in Africa and is much of Africa an example of neo-colonialism?

Although the history of African popular resistance to colonialism is coterminous with the history of colonialism, nationalism emerged as an important political force in many African countries during the twentieth century. The rise of African nationalisms was caused by local and international factors. Low levels of urbanization, persistent tribal loyalties and infirm modern institutions created a small, politically weak, middle class in the African countries. This restricted

the growth of liberal democratic politics in most African societies and strengthened the role of tribal-military leaders and their militias in them. The growth of a modern, educated, though small, African middle class since the nineteenth century and the severe crises of international capitalism in the first half of the twentieth century underpinned the rise of popular discontent and nationalist rebellion in Africa. It is true that the Bolshevik revolution and the national liberation struggles in Asia inspired nationalism and popularized communism in several African societies but an African revolution could never materialize because the transition from tribe to class remained incomplete in most African societies. Africa has a rich history of anti-colonial tribal-peasant revolts. The development of the plantation economy, mining and limited industrialization in some African countries displaced tribal groups and created a working class which generally labored in inhuman conditions. Peasants and workers employed in these colonial sectors of the African economy were often influenced by Marxism. In South Africa, for instance, the Communists played a considerable part in the anti-colonial and anti-apartheid struggle of the African National Congress. In general, however, the tribal-peasant uprisings in Africa, like the Mau Mau rebellion in Kenya, were politically isolated and defeated by the colonial authorities. In many African countries tribal divisions outlived colonialism and complicated the emergence of class based socialist politics in the long run. Unlike China and Vietnam a peasant revolution did not succeed in Africa and this has had long term consequences for Africa. Similarly unlike China, Vietnam, South Korea and India most African countries failed to develop a national economy capable of resisting colonial pressures in the age of decolonization. Faced with a range of opposition in Africa the colonial authorities gradually yielded to nationalist pressure and preferred to deal with the moderate nationalists in African society. In Kenya, Tanzania, Uganda, Ghana and some other countries the colonial powers dealt with Western educated elites because of two main reasons. First they believed that these elites understood Africa's connection with Europe better than the subaltern sections of the African society. Second, and here the Europeans were not entirely wrong, the colonial authorities were confident that European economic interests would be safer in countries ruled by such westernized elites. Never were the colonizers in favor of conceding power to the radical sections of the African people who favored large scale nationalization of mines, plantations and industries. Almost everywhere the colonial authorities encouraged the divisions within African society to the point where African tribalism became a self-fulfilling prophecy. Once the civil wars broke out in many African countries the Europeans could turn around and tell the world that Africans were incapable of ruling themselves. Consequently UN intervention remained a permanent feature of African decolonization in the decades following World War II. African decolonization also suffered major setbacks because of the Cold War. Initially pro USSR regimes, inspired by the successes of the socialist' Soviet Union, came to power in many African countries. Several African leaders, like Naser of Egypt, were committed to non-alignment and were impressed by the middle path shown by Marshal Tito and Nehru. This threatened the economic interests of the Western powers in Africa. Western agencies responded to this challenge by toppling regimes and aiding rebels irrespective of ideological affiliations. The intelligence agencies of almost all major international powers, including the CIA and KGB, were deeply implicated in African politics. For example the CIA supported and funded the Islamic fundamentalists against Naser in Egypt. On their part the African regimes played the Cold War



cards adroitly to extract money and arms from both the USA and USSR. Thus a well entrenched nexus between dominant African ruling groups and the international agencies developed during the cold war. In sum, true decolonization has evaded much of Africa also because of the waste of African wealth during the Cold War. Had this wealth been properly utilized to raise living standards in Africa matters would have turned out differently for the majority of Africans. VI.. Concluding remarks This paper has attempted a comprehensive definition of decolonization in the context of some selected events of decolonization in the twentieth century. The differences between political decolonization and a broader meaning of decolonization have been highlighted in the various sections of the paper. In general the paper has tried to illuminate the strengths and weaknesses of decolonization. In conclusion we must note the following. Classical modern colonialism, which implied direct European rule over non European people, reached its peak before World War I. The two world wars, the endemic crisis of international capitalism and the rising anti-colonial movements in the colonies had exhausted the European colonial powers by the time Hiroshima and Nagasaki were bombed by the Americans in August 1945.

The spread of the industrial revolution to the USA in the nineteenth century and the two world wars reversed the relationship between the USA and Europe. The major European powers fought the world wars with American money. This made the USA the largest creditor, and the US dollar the strongest currency, in the international markets. The USA emerged in the first half of the twentieth century as a great supporter of decolonization primarily because the American industrialists and financial institutions wanted to exploit the colonized regions. This was possible only with an,open door' policy. This,open door' has become the globalization of our times. The movements for decolonization which developed in the colonies were inspired, inter alia, by the Bolshevik revolution and the Soviet economic experiment. In several anti-colonial national liberation movements the communists, sometimes supported by the USSR and China, played a prominent role. The popularity of socialism in the erstwhile colonies threatened capitalism and the rise of the USA as the defender of Western civilization following World War II. The successful communist led national liberation movement in China, the formation of the People's Republic of China (1949) and the emergence of the USSR as a Superpower in 1945 threatened the international position of the USA and started the Cold War. The Cold War complicated the process of decolonization. In several parts of the world American and Soviet intervention undermined decolonization. The proxy wars of the Cold War era exhausted numerous newly independent countries and ultimately replaced colonialism with imperialism , indirect rule by a foreign power. This created a debt crisis in much of the Third World. In the early 1990s the USSR, which failed to develop a democratic alternative to modern industrialism, collapsed. Following this China emerged as a great power with the US as its biggest market and the US dominated international financial agencies like the World Bank and International Monetary Fund (IMF) were successful in imposing their conditions on numerous developing countries. The implosion of the Soviet Union was a multidimensional disaster for the developing countries. The structural adjustment packages imposed on numerous developing countries by the US led international lending agencies since the 1980s are collectively called globalization and liberalization. Globalization implies greater integration of Third World national economies with international industrial and money markets.

Liberalization means greater freedom to markets, and a retreat of government planning and social welfare, in the domestic economic spheres of the Third World. As far as decolonization is concerned the Cold War, globalization and liberalization have undone much that was accomplished by the anti-colonial national liberation struggles of the twentieth century. A bigger comment on globalization and liberalization is beyond the scope of this paper but the return of social democracy in many South American countries, among the first to be devastated by structural adjustment, since the 1990s suggests that the struggle between colonization and decolonization is not yet over.

### Notes & References

1. For more on this and related matters see Michel Chossudovsky, *The Globalization of Poverty , Impacts of IMF and World Bank Reforms*, The Other India Press & Madhyam Books, 1997.
2. On Haiti see Michel-Rolph Trouillot, *Silencing the past- Power and Production of History*, Beacon Press, Boston, 1995.
3. For details see Edward W. Said, *Orientalism: Western Conceptions of the Orient*, Penguin Books, 1995. Said's assertion (p.17) that the US has, self-consciously' filled the 'places excavated by the two earlier European powers' forces upon us a reconsideration of post World War II decolonization.
4. Noam Chomsky, 'Peering into the Abyss of the Future', in *Re-Imagining India and other essays*, Orient BlackSwan, Hyderabad, 2011, pp. 85-140.
5. H. Grimal, *Decolonization in the British, French, Dutch and Belgian Empires 1919-1963*, London, 1978, p. 3.
6. Donny Gluckstein, *A People's History of the Second World War: Resistance versus Empire*, Pluto Press, London, 2012. For a scathing view of contemporary Western imperialism in the middle east see Edward Said, *The End of the Peace Process*, Penguin Books, New Delhi, 2002.
7. *Mastering Modern World History*, Third Edition, Macmillan, 1997, p. 424.
8. For details see *A People's History of the Second World War: Resistance versus Empire*.
9. *Ibid.*, p. 443.
10. General Vo Nguyen Giap, *The Military Art of People's War*, Monthly Review Press, New York, 1970.
11. Henry Heller, *The Cold War and the New Imperialism: A Global History, 1945-2005*, Cornerstone Publications, Kharagpur, 2007, p. 83.
12. Named after General Henri-Eugene Navarre, who became Commander in Chief of the French forces in Vietnam, with obvious American approval, in the spring of 1953.
13. For details see *The Globalization of Poverty*, op.cit., pp. 147-168.

14. Cold War and the New Imperialism: A Global History, 1945-2005, p. 96.
15. Ibid., p. 98. Around 400,000 Arabs and 30,000 French were killed in the Algerian War [1954-62]. After Algerian independence almost all European settlers, numbering a million, returned to France..

Anirudh Deshpande  
*Associate Professor*  
*Department of History*  
*Faculty of Social Sciences*  
*University of Delhi*

Inclusive



# **Perspective Section**

# Constitutional Environmental Human Rights in India: Negating a Negating Statement

Chris Jeffords

## Introduction

The detrimental effects of environmental pollution are a great concern for the health of the planet, especially current and future generations of human inhabitants. As countries progress through various stages of social and economic development, so too does pollution disperse throughout the planet. Air and water pollution, for example, do not respect geographic, political, and temporal boundaries, and can have lingering effects on such aspects of daily life as economic and food security. Individuals, families, and governments alike therefore often face both the direct and indirect costs associated with increased economic and food insecurity. In an effort to combat the full spectrum of environmental harm and its continued presence in the modern world, national governments have taken important, constitutional steps toward mitigating this harm for current and future generations.

As of 2010, the national constitutions of 125 developing and developed countries include provisions for protecting the natural environment in general and for the sake of human life.<sup>1</sup> These provisions, often referred to as constitutional environmental human rights (CEHR), are essentially entitlements to clean air, water, and soil for present and future generations.<sup>2</sup> CEHR can be found directly in national constitutions by way of explicitly discussing the role of government in protecting the environment, for example, and/or indirectly by derivation from some other quality of life aspect such as an adequate standard of living. If one considers an adequate amount of safe drinking water as a human right and an important prerequisite for living a safe, healthy life, then the latter, indirect derivation is an integral component of defining and using CEHR to secure a clean or healthy natural environment for all. In fact, the International Bill of Human Rights does not include direct environmental human rights (EHR), but it does include other human rights from which EHR are derived, such as the right to an adequate standard of living.<sup>3</sup> Whether found directly or indirectly, the way in which CEHR are interpreted by a nation's legal system is an important component, if not the most important component, in determining how well any one CEHR addresses environmental harm.

Using text from the Constitution of India (dated December 1, 2011), this article examines three potential ways to interpret the legal strength of a broadly defined national CEHR.<sup>4</sup> Covering both objective and subjective approaches, the three ways are defined as follows: (i) having or not a CEHR; (ii) interpreting the CEHR as enforceable law or directive principles; and (iii) linking the language of the CEHR to the underlying definition of an EHR. Further complicating interpretation of a CEHR is the presence of negating statements either before or after the CEHR. These statements

can directly negate the constitutional power of the CEHR, or refer the responsibility of the environment to the domain of law and policy. Before discussing the three separate interpretations, the next section outlines India's CEHR followed by a brief section on the negating statement found in The Constitution of India.

## India's CEHR

The whole of India's CEHR is spread out across multiple articles within Part IV , Directive Principles of State Policy. It is outlined directly within Articles 48A and 51A and indirectly through articles 43 and 47. Article 48A , Protection and improvement of environment and safeguarding of forests and wild life , reads: The State shall endeavor to protect and improve the environment and to safeguard the forests and wild life of the country. Rather than imposing a duty on the State, this article provides an objective for the State to protect the natural environment.

Article 51A (Part G) within Part IVA , Fundamental Duties , reads: It shall be the duty of every citizen of India to protect and improve the natural environment including forests, lakes, rivers, and wild life, and to have compassion for living creatures. Though this article imposes a duty to protect and improve the natural environment, the obligation is placed on every citizen of India thereby making it difficult to determine who would be responsible for violations of this fundamental duty.

The indirect definition of India's CEHR starts with Article 43 , Living Wage, Etc., for Workers , which reads:

The State shall endeavor to secure, by suitable legislation or economic organization or in any other way, to all workers, agricultural, industrial or otherwise, work, a living wage, conditions of work ensuring a decent standard of life and full enjoyment of leisure and social and cultural opportunities and, in particular, the State shall endeavor to promote cottage industries on an individual or co-operative basis in rural areas.

This article indirectly allows for the CEHR by way of providing a living wage to workers to ensure a decent standard of life, where the living wage would presumably afford individual's access to clean, safe water, for example.

The second indirect aspect of India's CEHR is found in Article 47 , Duty of the State to Raise the Level of Nutrition and the Standard of Living and to Improve Public Health , which reads:

The State shall regard the raising of the level of nutrition and the standard of living of its people and the improvement of public health as among its primary duties and, in particular, the State shall endeavor to bring about prohibition of the consumption except for medicinal purposes of intoxicating drinks and of drugs which are injurious to health.

As discussed in the introduction, this article indirectly allows for the CEHR through improving the living standards for the people of India. Again, improving access to clean, safe water is arguably a prerequisite (or a corequisite) for improving standards of living.

### **Negating Statement**

Perhaps unfortunately for India's natural environment, the CEHR is preceded by a succinct negating statement in Article 37, Application of the Principles Contained in this Part, which reads:

The provisions contained in this Part shall not be enforceable by any court but the principles therein laid down are nevertheless fundamental in the governance of the country and it shall be the duty of the State to apply these principles in making laws.

As evidenced by the first line of Article 37, anything that follows within Part IV is not justiciable in the court system. Furthermore, the principles outlined in the remaining articles of Part IV are not relegated directly to the domain of law, but are instead guidelines for making national laws and policies (depending, of course, on how strong the duty is perceived). On top of making it impossible to use the court system to address violations of the remaining articles of Part IV, the language of Article 37 perhaps makes the following interpretations of India's CEHR an exercise in futility (at least for the time being).

### **Having an EHR (or Not)**

India's Constitution certainly has an EHR provision, albeit spread out across a few articles. It is not immediately clear, however, that simply having a provision would be useful for adjudicating disputes over environmental harm or protecting the overall state of the natural environment. In this sense, interpreting the CEHR as either enforceable law or directive principles is perhaps a better approximation of the legal teeth.

### **Directive Principles versus Enforceable Law**

As Minkler notes, directive principles are essentially guidelines for State action. Acting as goals to guide policy-making, directive principles do not bind policy-makers to take any specific action.<sup>5</sup> It is possible, however, that policy-makers are concerned with their elected status and would face reelection repercussions if they failed to incorporate directive principles into actual policy-making. Enforceable law, on the other hand, provides a legal framework for adjudicating human

rights violations. Under enforceable law, policy-makers would be forced to enact policies and devote resources toward meeting the goals and guidelines of the CEHR provision or they would face legal ramifications. Based on the negating statement contained in Article 37, it is obvious that India's CEHR is a matter of directive principles and not enforceable law. Yet another way to consider the legal strength of CEHR is to see how well the language links to the definitions of EHR.,

### **Linking the Language of CEHR Provisions to Definitions of EHR**

Using original data through 2010, Jeffords<sup>6</sup> developed a simple index of the legal strength of CEHR by way of a keyword analysis and categorization based on the definition of EHR outlined by Hiskes and others, including Sax, Weiss, and Collins-Chobanian.<sup>7, 8</sup> The index is calculated by analyzing any one CEHR for seven keyword categories, marking a 1 for the presence of the category (0 otherwise), and summing across each category for one nation. The seven categories are defined as: (i) State duties to protect the environment; (ii) State objectives to protect the environment; (iii) every citizen's right to information about the status of the environment; (iv) every citizen's right to a healthy, clean, and/or safe environment; (v) the concern for future generations and/or sustainable development; (vi) a general duty for everyone to respect and protect the environment; and (vii) the human right to water. Despite the timing difference of the data and the date of India's constitution, India's CEHR scores a 2 on the index by summation across Categories 2 (Article 48A) and 6 (Article 51A). Depending on whether or not the full index includes Category vii, the average score across the 125 countries are 2.248 (Categories 1-6) and 2.328 (Categories 1-7). If a higher score indicates a stronger (in a legal sense) CEHR, then the language of India's CEHR is a bit weak. The index counts each keyword category at equal weight, however, and so it is possible that certain categories are more important than others, which may or may not help the legal interpretation of India's current CEHR.

### **Conclusion**

This article described India's CEHR and offered three ways to view or interpret its legal meaning. The first method, though not exactly an interpretation, merely notes that India has a broadly defined CEHR. The second method demonstrated that India's CEHR is a directive principle and not enforceable law. The final method showed that India's CEHR falls slightly below average compared to other developing and developed countries on the simple index of legal strength. With a weighted index, however, this position could change. Regardless, the legal strength of India's CEHR is severely diminished by the presence of the negating statement in Article 37.



Considering that the present CEHR is a directive principle and also scores relatively low on the simple index of legal strength, the negating statement acts to further shrink the avenues through which the citizens of India can seek recourse for EHR violations. Taken as a whole, it seems that the current legal framework based in part on the constitutional structure is not entirely sympathetic towards respecting, protecting, and fulfilling EHR. At the very least, if the government of India is to take EHR seriously at the national level, the negating statement would likely have to be repealed. From there, the relative limitations and inadequacies of India's CEHR can be formally addressed through the various socioeconomic processes which can lead to widespread respect for, and protection and fulfillment of, EHR.

The three interpretations of CEHR offered above rely on the underlying definition of EHR, which is built on and derived from a long history of the theory and practice of human rights. So as our understanding of EHR evolves over time, so too will our interpretation of CEHR. Coupled with the role of case law, perhaps this evolution will translate into a justiciable CEHR for the people of India or, at the very least, some stronger language in India's Constitution. Of course all of this hinges on the preferences of India's people and its government. Do they want a legally enforceable CEHR?

## Notes and References

1. Christopher Jeffords, "Constitutional Environmental Human Rights: A Descriptive Analysis of 142 National Constitutions's in *The State of Economic and Social Human Rights: A Global Overview*, ed. Lanse Minkler, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, MA, USA, December 2012, Chapter 13.
2. Richard Hiskes, *The Human Right to a Green Future*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, MA, USA, 2009.
3. The International Bill of Human Rights consists of the following three binding articles of international law: (1) the Universal Declaration of Human Rights; (2) the International Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights; and (3) the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. The right to an adequate standard of living is outlined in Article 25 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.
4. The Constitution of India, Government of India, Ministry of Law and Justice, December 1, 2011.
5. Lanse Minkler: "Economic Rights and Political Decision Making's Human Rights Quarterly, Vol. 31, No. 2, 2009, pp. 368-93.
6. Jeffords, op.cit.
7. Ibid., notes 2 and 3. Joseph Sax: "The Search for Environmental Rights's Journal of Land Use and Environmental Law, Vol 6., 1990-91, pp. 93-105.; Edith Brown Weiss:

â€œIn Fairness to Future Generations and Sustainable Development's American University Journal of International Law and Policy, Vol. 8, No. 19, 1992-93.; Shari Collins-Chobanian: â€œBeyond Sax and Welfare Interests's Environmental Ethics, Vol. 22, 2000, pp. 133-48.

8. In this sense, the index fails to capture the indirect derivations of EHR as discussed above. See the paper cited above for a more detailed explanation of the strengths and weaknesses of this index, as well as for the full data set.

Chris Jeffords

*Visiting Assistant Professor of Economics, Eastern Connecticut State University (2012-2013)  
Willimantic, CT & Assistant Professor of Economics, Indiana University of Pennsylvania*



# **Commentary Section**

## Notes on the Condition of Public Health in India

Siddhartha Gupta

### Introduction

At the midnight of 14th August, 1947 the first Prime minister elect of the Indian republic Mr. Jawaharlal Nehru delivered his famous speech known as '*Our tryst with Destiny*.' He said there,

*'Long years ago we made a tryst with destiny, and now the time comes when we shall redeem our pledge, not wholly or in full measure, but very substantially. At the stroke of the mid night our, when the world sleeps, India will awake to life and freedom...The service of India means the service of the millions who suffer. It means the ending of poverty and ignorance and disease and in equality of opportunity. The ambition of the greatest man of our generations has been to wipe every tear from every eye. That may be beyond us, but so long as there are tears and sufferings, so long our work will not be over'.<sup>1</sup>*

Since those days much water has flown down the Ganges. This year we are going to celebrate the 65 th anniversary of our precious independence as usual with much fanfare. But it is a fact that while 20 per cent of the people of India are enjoying the fruits of freedom, the 80 per cent of the population is reeling under severe malnutrition, hunger, illiteracy, homelessness and death from preventable disease, due to extreme *lack* of even the basic healthcare. Our beloved motherland is horizontally split in two parts, the shining India of the upper echelon and the domed Bharat of the majority.

Let us take a look at the United Nation's Human Right Charter (UNHRC) which was adapted in 1948. The Charter and the subsequent international covenants clearly upheld that only political right (e.g. right to exercise voting power) is not enough. The social, economic and cultural rights of a person or a community must be protected to give a meaningful shape to universal human rights in the member states. The constitution of India toed these lines set by the UNHRC. In the charter of fundamental rights (chapter III) of the Indian constitution, one of the most important article is Article 21 which states, 'No person shall be deprived of his life and personal liberty except according to the procedure established by law'.<sup>2</sup>

Likewise, the 'Right to Life 'is one of the main foundation and guiding principle of the Indian Constitution which necessarily has the protection of the judiciary and non-negotiable. Subsequently, many state High Courts and even the Supreme Court in several verdicts observed that right to healthcare and medical treatment is one of the pillars of right to life. The honorable Supreme Court of India has explicitly articulated 'Right to life is not merely animal existence but a life with human dignity'.<sup>3</sup>

Despite the presence of these guiding principles till date right to health care is not accepted as a fundamental right. The Central Government has recently drafted a 'bill' on 'Right to Health Care' which is to be placed before both the houses of Parliament. Though suffering from many lacunae and short comings, this bill if converted to law, may reflect the constitutional obligation of the government to offer suitable medical and health care to all the citizen of India. The 12 th planning commission has also set up a High level Expert Group under the chairmanship of Dr. K. Srinath Reddy towards Universal Health Care in the whole country. The Expert Group has already submitted its detailed recommendations to the Prime Minister. That the healthcare of all the citizens transcending all barriers of caste, creed, religion, region, economic and social conditions, is a responsibility of the state, has been clearly stated in the report of the Expert Group. However, whether the government will accept its recommendations is yet to be seen.

With these constitutional and legal provisions, let us have a look at the state of public health in the so-called largest democracy of the world.

### **A stock taking of the situation**

India is a vast country with approximately 3.3 million square kilometer area and a population of 1.21 billion (as per latest census report). India covers about 4 per cent of the area of the earth with 16 per cent of world population. The average population density is 373 per square kilometer, one on the highest in the world. More that 37 per cent of the populations is Below Poverty line (BPL), calculated on the basis of the price of food grains which supply 2000 to 2200 Calories per day. No other essentialities of human life, like balanced diet, shelter, clothing, education, health or amusement, is included in the calculation of BPL. By international standard of poverty line, i.e. US \$ 1 per day (= Rs. 55 at present), more than 50 per cent of the population sinks below the poverty line. The Arjun Sengupta Committee has opined that almost 77 per cent of the populations are unable to spend Rs. 20 a day.<sup>4</sup>

If we see the central budgetary allocation for health, it is a meager 1.02 per cent The total expenses in healthcare (both public and private spending taken together) is less than 3 per cent of the GDP whereas 13 per cent of central budget is spent in defense and 17 per cent goes in debt service (payment of interest and principals of loan). The allocation in health is gradually sliding down since the first five year plan, in which the health budget was about 4.3 per cent of total central budget. The first United Progressive Alliance (UPA) government promised in its election manifesto to gradually increase the budget up to 3 per cent. But it remained as a mere lip service. The high level expert group has observed: 'Government (central government and states combined) should increase public expenditures on health from the current level of 1.4 per cent of GDP to at least 2.5 per cent by the end of 12 th plan, and to at least 3 per cent of GDP by 2022.'<sup>5</sup>

## Some health statistics of India

Let us have a snap look to the state of maternal and child health in India.

**Table 1 : Maternal & Child Health<sup>6</sup>**

Conditions	Prevalence
1. Anemia in pregnancy	57.9%
2. Home delivery by untrained dai	53%
3. Infant Mortality Rate (IMR)	52 /1000
4. Under Five Mortality rate	66 / 1000
5. Low birth Weight	44%
6. Anemia in children (6 months to 3 years)	68%
7. Maternal Mortality Rate (MMR)	212 / 1,00,000
8. Severe malnutrition in children.	21 million

It may be worthwhile to compare the health status with other developing nations, as India is one of the fastest growing economies in the world and aspires to join the group of world leaders (including a permanent post in the Security Council of the UNO).

**Table 2: Comparison with other countries<sup>7</sup>**

Health Indicators	India	China	Brazil	Srilanka	Thailand
IMR/ 1000 live Births	52	17	17	13	12
Under 5 mortality/1000 live Births	66	19	21	16	13
Fully Immunized (%)	66	95	99	99	98
Birth by skilled attendant (%47)	47	96	98	97	99

Low priority to public spending on health in India in comparison to other developing countries is one of the major stumbling block in health care in India.

**Table 3: Public expenses in health<sup>8</sup>**

Country	Public spending on health as % of total public spending	Public spending on health as % of GDP
India	4.1	1.4
Srilanka	7.3	1.0
China	10.3	2.3
Thailand	14.0	3.3

The total number of child death in India is approximately 2 million per year, which accounts for one fourth of total crib death in the world. There is above 5000 child death a day, out of which 46 per cent is directly or indirectly due to malnutrition. The Supreme Court observed, in public interest litigation (PIL) by People Union for civil Liberties (PUCL), that there are almost two child deaths per minute in India due to malnutrition and hunger. There is wide regional variation in crib death. Whereas states like Kerala (13 / Thousand), Tamilnadu (29 / Thousand) and West Bengal (32 / Thousand) show good performance, the numbers of child death in Uttar Pradesh, Madhya Pradesh or Jharkhand are worse even than the famine hurt countries of sub-Saharan Africa.<sup>9</sup>

### **Out of Pocket Expenses**

India is the world leader in Out Of Pocket expenses (OOP) to get health care. Poor public spending on one hand and mushrooming of the private health care industry have pushed the middle class and poor people to the brink of disaster.

The National Rural Health Mission (NRHM) documents have stated that the hospitalization expenses of an average Indian is 58 per cent of his annual income and 40 per cent patients or their families are indebted to meet such expenses. It further states that the rank of “medical loans” is second among all types of loans in the country. Approximately, one crore of population sinks below the poverty line every year to pay off health related expenses. Out of pocket expenses are 83 per cent of all health expenses and it is a major cause of rural and urban poverty in India. The existing public health system is pro rich and urban bias. 80 per cent doctors, 75 per cent dispensaries and 60 per cent hospitals are local in urban areas. There are 1.3 doctors per 10,000 populations in urban areas. In the vast rural hinterland there are only 1.9 qualified doctors per 10,000 populations. Out of total 4, 50,360 hospital beds, there are less than a third (1, 02,736) in the rural areas. There is a gross shortage of 20,903 sub centre 4803 primary health centers and 2653 community health centers as per stipulated government norms.<sup>10</sup>

### **Disease load of India**

In a nutshell, India is the global capital of infectious and deficiency diseases. Let us see the table 5 to get a clear idea regarding our public health status, which is the real picture of ‘Incredible India,’ so far as Health and Medicare is concerned.

The burden of non infections diseases is also huge. Diabetes mellitus is spreading almost like a wild fire. Presently the estimated diabetic patients are 61 million and the projected number of patients by 2030 is 101 million. Hypertensive patients are 130 millions and the number is likely to double by 2030. Death due to consumption of Tobacco is increasing steadily. Death and paralytic

episodes due to stroke (cerebro vascular Accident) is 9.2 million at present and it may reach 17.9 million by third decade of this millennium. Despite some national programmes, morbidity and mortality rate is increasing in leaps and bounds.

**Table 5: Morbidity & Mortality<sup>11</sup>**

<b>Disease</b>	<b>Total Patients</b>
----------------	-----------------------

Siddhartha Gupta

Kolkata

Inclusive





# **Review Section**

## In Search of Good Communism

Pratip Chattopadhyay

**A Traveler and The Road : The Journey of An Indian Communist, Mohit Sen, Rupa & Co., New Delhi, 2003, 584 pages, Rs. 295/-. ISBN: 81-291-0105-X**

In the aftermath of the debacle of the Left Front organized rule in West Bengal and related widespread discussion of the decline of Left in India, attempts are needed to fruitfully assess the present of Communist parties in India in the light of the past and the book under review, though published almost a decade ago, just serves the purpose as through its nicely crafted chapters, it embarks the reader into a journey that falls methodologically in the genre of 'auto-ethnography', as here the author, through an astonishing reflection of memory, acts as both the subject and object (In the preface, the author states that the book embodies "Chronological narrative of my life...tries to combine...developments in Communist movement with life as I have lived it" ) creating to a layman in this field, lively pictures of various characters of Indian communist movement . The first four chapters are devoted to the growing up years of the author as a student ('My Early Years' & 'Growing Up in Calcutta') and as a theoretically and practically trained practitioner of Communism ('In Cambridge' & 'In China'). The next five chapters reflect the ways and means by which the author comes to term with the Indian Communist Party and its associated movements ('The Years in CPI Headquarters' & 'The Chinese Attack') and also creates his own impression in the backyard of his mind regarding the ground reality in India and the nature of Communist strategies ('Talking with Pandit Nehru', 'The Split and the CPI's New Line' & 'CPI and the Prague Spring'). Then comes the phase in Sen's life whereby he gradually moves up the ladder in the leadership of Communist Party in the midst of tensed political cross-currents in India ('Transition and Turmoil', 'First Years in Ajoy Bhawan' & 'Bangladesh and the Emergency'). With his knowledge rooted in the pristine theoretical and practical culture of Communism, Sen hugely influenced by P.C. Joshi and S.A. Dange, unravels his thoughts on the inertia of Communist movement in India and getting marginalised in Inner Party Struggle (IPS), in the chapters on 'The Emergency and the After', 'Meetings with Indira Gandhi' & 'Indira Gandhi, Tirupati and Gujrat'. In the following chapters on 'Rajiv Gandhi's Endeavour', 'The Year 1991' & 'The Last Decade', the author stresses how going beyond the givens of the Communist Party of India, one can develop an independent understanding of the correct path of Communist movement in India and institutionalizes it as he did. The last two chapters, 'Vanaja Dies' & 'Reflections', sees a seasoned communist leader in India working out a balance-sheet of his own life and that of Indian communist movement. This entire narrativization, based on family, friends and party in Sen's life, exemplifies that 'personal is political' in the path of a true traveler.

According to Sen, the narrative of his life is a narrative of twentieth century which is a contradictory time seeing advance of man from kingdom of necessity to kingdom of freedom and

also more persons were victims of war and oppression. Moved by G.K. Plekhanov's *The Role of the Individual in History*, Sen states that his family's class (Brahmo Samaj family influenced by Western liberalism) and historical location (second and third decades of the twentieth century) was important that pushed him increasingly towards nationalism and egalitarianism and later to Marxism and Communism. Bundle, his elder brother, introduced him to the ideals of communism while his Daddy told that he should read widely, listen to others and not close his mind. Good friends like Asok Sen and Boudhayan Chattopadhyay introduced him to Joseph Needham's *Time, The Refreshing River and History Is On Our Side*, Harry Slowocher's *Three Ways of Modern Man* and Stalin's *Fundamentals of Leninism*. Dilip Bose, M.G. Ramachandran, D.P. Dhar, Sukhamoy Chakravarty and Sarada Mitra were friends from Communist circle and Sen was moved by the works of Debi Prasad Chattopadhyay and D.D. Kosambi. Sen's love interest turned wife, Vanaja's attraction for Communism was seen as an attempt to integrate a scientific understanding with humanism. Great teachers 'Susobhan Sarkar, Bishnu Dey, Maurice Dobb, Piero Sraffa, E.H Carr, Gordon Leff (authored an erudite denunciation of Communism entitled *The Tyranny of Concepts*), Eric Hobsbawm (who believed that in the conditions of democracy and open ideological combat, it was essential that Marxism fought its battle with excellence and practical proof rather than reference to the texts of Marx, Engels, Lenin and Stalin, p-89 'offered knowledge and wisdom. Witnessing the relationship between the party and outstanding intellectuals like J.D. Bernal, Joseph Needham, Sen decided to be a full time member of the CPI or to use Stalin's phrase, 'professional revolutionary'. For Sen, the influence of great personalities 'Indira Gandhi, Dange, A.K. Gopalan, C. Rajeswara Rao 'were gifts of history and chance.

Sen analyses in the hindsight that the Marx that influenced the Communist movement in India was the author of the *Communist Manifesto* and for a select few the author of bi-class polarized society as set out in *Das Kapital*, Volume 1. The Marx of the *Eighteenth Brumaire*, to say nothing of the *Grundrisse*, was unknown for all practical purposes. The biggest break from Marx was in the treatment of classes. Class consciousness was narrowly interpreted as being synonymous with support for the Communist Party. Dange's concept was to raise the level of general knowledge and consciousness of the workers till they realized they were a class and then decided to support any particular party. Lenin as presented in the writings of Stalin (*The History of CPSU(B)*, *Short Course* and the *Foundations of Leninism*) was more influential in shaping our Communist movement. Stalin's implementation of democratic centralism as the basic principle of Party organization emphasized discipline and obedience to the extent that creativity and initiative were virtually illegalized within it. Khrushchov had made a great contribution by breaking Stalin's image and his ideological stranglehold but the break from Stalinism was superficial. Theory becomes unquestionable dogma. Received wisdom becomes a barrier to going beyond to newer realms of knowledge. It was Trotsky who said that you can never be right against the Party.

For Sen, the first injunction of the historical method bequeathed by Marx 'the concrete study of concrete reality - was all too often ignored by the communists at large in India. Sen states that the originality of Mao Dzadong (*On Practice and On Contradiction* 'his basic philosophical texts) lay in integrating the basic teachings of Marxism-Leninism with the concrete conditions of China and

the concrete experience of Chinese evolution('seeking truth from concrete facts'). In China, the Communist Party was the instrument of national and social emancipation; indeed, it was indispensable to such emancipation. A mature Sen later realized that the Gandhian ideology and programme, also combined national and social emancipation. On the basis of the positive assessment of the Mahatma, P. C. Joshi advised the Communists of India to unite with the Gandhian anti-imperialist movement while remaining independent and critical but it was opposed by majority of the CPI leaders. In theory, the People's War line that opposed the Quit India Movement could be presented as a line of struggle for freedom superior to that of the Movement. It was not a line that pitted Proletarian Internationalism against patriotism but which sought to combine both (p-23). P.C. Joshi's Forward to Freedom reflected this brand of analysis. S.A. Dange and S.V. Chitale were also votaries of the approach. Rajani Palme Dutt also reversed his anti-Congressism stance in 1936 and later in 1980 for unity with the Congress. Sen comments, 'Perhaps this was a contradiction in the great man's make up between faith (Stalinism) and reason (concrete analysis of a concrete situation)'.(p-47) Ravi Narayan Reddy viewed that the interest of the working class and working people could best be represented by the Communists provided they integrated these interests with national interest and did not oppose one to the other. Ajoy Ghosh evolved the concept of national democracy, replaced the concept of the dictatorship of proletariat by that of socialist statehood and proposed the line of unity and struggle with the Congress but his personal prejudices were also an impediment in his uniting with P.C. Joshi and S.A. Dange. Sen laments that, 'If these three leaders had come together the entire subsequent history of the CPI could have been changed for the better.'(p-139) The CPI promoted the United Front strategy with success of which two outstanding examples are organization of Indo-Soviet friendship and solidarity movement and the United Front government in Kerala. C. Achutha Menon as the chief minister was tolerant and flexible in his dealings with others, especially those belonging to parties other than his own. The debacle in Andhra triggered off the inner-party struggle. The division was really between the Joshi line of Congress-Communist unity for national advance and the people's welfare and the Sundarayya-Ranadive line of people's democratic, anti-Congress unity. Sen notes that, 'The inner party struggle was not a struggle only for power over the Party. It was a struggle over ideas, perspectives and the nature of revolution in general and in India in particular.'(p-244)

In this book, at various junctures, some of the comments made by the author are not only prophetic but also realistic. These are (i) 'P.C. Joshi categorically laid down that the Communist students had to be the best students- quite a contrast to what has happened in recent decades.'(p-31) (ii) 'The CPI would convert itself into a tail of and eventually a clone of the CPI (M). I added that while there could be more than one Communist party in the country, there was no room for two CPI (M)'s.' (p-370) (iii) 'In the view of persons with the background and mental makeup of Stalin dominated periods of world communist movement, it was difficult to accept that history could be made by other parties and other ideologies when once the communist movement had come into existence. This was the case with all the CPI leaders except to an extent and a growing extent with P.C. Joshi and S.A. Dange.'(p-164) (iv) 'It was axiomatically assumed that in countries where the Communists were once in power there could be no internal movement that would challenge it. Any such challenge had to be externally inspired, led and supplied' (p-264). Brecht has written,

‘Unhappy the nation that needs heroes’ and Sen adds ‘tragic the movement that cannot have the heroes that it needs’ implicitly pointing to the lack of new leadership with the intent to break from the Stalinist approach.

Edward Kardelj’s book *Peace and Socialism*, a new understanding of the basic dialectical framework was put forth. The Action Programme to introduce a multi-party civil libertarian democratic system and a combination of market and planning and adopting independent foreign policy and competing elections with other parties where Communist Party had the monopoly of power running the risk of losing elections are the important items of the ‘Prague Spring’ of 1968-69 spearheaded by Dabceck and other leaders of Communist Party of Czechoslovakia. In totality these reforms intended to establish ‘socialism with a human face’ that very much resembled the vision and programme of Nehruvian socialism. Moved by these international developments, Sen wrote a booklet *India’s Revolution – Path and Perspective* in 1970 where he stated that our freedom struggle was a national revolution and that it overthrew the colonial state and found a national state. He opines, ‘For the Communist movement 15th August was either a downright betrayal of the revolution or it was a compromise for sharing of power between the colonialists and the Indian capitalist-landlord bloc. I broke with that understanding.’ (p-292)

A seasoned Communist intern, Sen at the fag end of his life could talk about several gaps in Communist theory ‘the failure to understand democracy as a process to raise humanity and its history to a new level; failure to appreciate the scientific-technological revolution; confusion on what constituted the working class and what its role was in the progress of history to socialism; lacked an appreciation of religion as one of the forms of man’s appreciation of his limits and the yearning to transcend these; failed to correctly evaluate nationalism as either internationalism was counterpoised to nationalism or it was allowed to flourish as chauvinism. But even then his passion for Communism remained unabated as reflected in his comment : - ‘What was wrong with Marxism kind of question still did not arise in my mind and was perhaps due to a number of factors ‘the accomplishments of the Communist movement worldwide and the positive orientation that it provided for my thought and life; the futility and the worse of alternative modes of thought, philosophy including religion, liberalism and Gandhism as intellectual systems; the high level of intellect, learning and morality of those who were Marxists or sympathizers. Above all it enabled and impelled me and my companions to fight what was evil and unjust ant to live intense and creative lives.’ (p-221) Based on his unconditioned faith in Communist principles and frustrated by the Stalinisation of the leading Communist Parties in India, Sen formed United Communist Party of India (UCPI) influenced by Palmro Togliatti’s concepts of ‘structural transformation’ and ‘the United Front as a strategy and not just as a tactical response to the rise of fascism’ and was close to Italian Communist Party’s aim of ‘socialism of the ninety percent’. UCPI’s programme broadly remained the same as that of the CPI, i.e. the transition to socialism through the national democratic revolution with two new points that the transition would not be through an armed revolution but by democratic mass movements combining parliamentary and extra parliamentary forms of struggle. What was novel was the characterization of the present state as a multiclass national state. Sen says, ‘As politicians and politics were indispensable for popular sovereignty

and civil liberty, so also was there a need for a new type of Communist Party. So I would say that the jury is still out on the question about the fate of the UCPI.’(p-478) Mohit Sen’s different ideological and theoretical commitment was noted by none other than Jawaharlal Nehru as he describes him as ‘a Communist with national sympathies’(p-239)

In this magnanimous volume in page 467 Uttar Pradesh spelling was typed wrongly and throughout the write up Khrushchev’s name was written as Khrushchov.

Mohit Sen’s ideas as reflected in this autobiography in the context of overall political developments in national and international Communist movement is a must read for all the sympathizers of Communist ideals for understanding the theoretical cross currents present within its fold and to take a position ala Marx, Lenin and Gramsci going beyond Stalin’s approach for a better popular base in Indian society. Sen’s concluding remarks in his autobiography is like a beacon of light for the directionless and ideologically moribund Left politics in India. Sen says, ‘Communists we have been of different kinds. There will be other kinds in the future but Communists there will be. More open than we were, less arrogant and going along with many others who will not be Communists but whose aims though differently expressed will not be all that different from and not antagonistic to what Marx wished for humanity. He predicted fulfillment without insisting that a particular party was needed for it.’

Pratip Chattopadhyay  
*Dept. of Political Science*  
*University of Kalyani*